MKUKUTA II ASSESSMENT REPORT
(2010 - 2015)

“Taking stock and forging the national future”

Ministry of Finance and Planning

April, 2016
# Table of contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS .............................................. iii
ACRONYMS ......................................................................... vii
PREFACE .......................................................................... ix
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ................................................ xi
CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION ............................................ 1
1.1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 1
1.2 PURPOSE, OBJECTIVES AND USE OF THE REPORT .............. 1
1.3 COORDINATION AND PROCESS OF PREPARING THIS REPORT ...... 2
1.4 ORGANIZATION OF THE REPORT ...................................... 2
CHAPTER II: GROWTH FOR REDUCTION OF INCOME POVERTY .... 3
2.0 INTRODUCTION ................................................................. 3
2.1 SOUND MACROECONOMIC MANAGEMENT ................................ 3
2.1.1 Inflation .......................................................................... 3
2.1.2 Proportion of actually disbursed amounts of Aid to total commitment ... 4
2.1.3 Official Foreign Reserves .................................................. 4
2.1.4 Exchange Rate ................................................................... 5
2.1.5 Budget deficit as percentage of GDP, before and after grants ........... 6
2.1.6 Revenue and Government Expenditure to GDP Ratio ..................... 6
2.1.7 Current Account Balance .................................................. 6
2.1.8 Exports Performance ....................................................... 7
2.1.9 Foreign Direct Investments ................................................. 7
2.2 INCOME POVERTY ............................................................ 8
2.2.1 Income Poverty and Inequality ............................................. 8
2.2.2 GDP Growth ............................................................... 9
2.3 PRODUCTIVE AND DECENT EMPLOYMENT ......................... 17
2.3.1 Enforcement of labor laws and policy ................................... 17
2.3.2 Employment in Manufacturing ............................................ 18
2.4 FOOD AND NUTRITION SECURITY, ENVIRONMENT AND CLIMATE CHANGE .... 19
2.5 NATIONAL RESOURCES FOR ENHANCING GROWTH AND BENEFITS TO THE COUNTRY ........................................ 22
2.6 CHALLENGES, LESSONS AND STRATEGIES FOR THE FORMULATION OF FYDP II 22
2.6.1 Translating GDP Growth for Poverty Reduction to the Majority .......... 22

5.2.3 Resource Mobilization 2010-2015 ................................................................. 117
5.2.4 Resource Allocation 2010-2015 ................................................................. 122
5.3 Budget Implementation 2010-2015 ................................................................. 126
5.4 Budget Reporting and Transparency ............................................................. 128
5.5 Principles, Assumption, Risks and Mitigation Measures and Challenges ................................................................. 130
5.5.1 Principles .............................................................................................................. 130
5.5.2 Assumptions ....................................................................................................... 130
5.5.3 Financing Risks under MKUKUTA II and Mitigation Measures ...................... 131
5.6 Challenges and Way Forward ............................................................................. 132
5.6.1 Challenges .......................................................................................................... 132
5.6.2 Way forward ...................................................................................................... 133

CHAPTER 6. MKUKUTA II MONITORING AND EVALUATION SYSTEM ...... 136

6.1 Overview ............................................................................................................. 136
6.2 Description of the Current Situation ............................................................... 136
6.2.1 General Implementation Progress for MMS ................................................. 136
6.2.2 Implementation of the Institutional Framework ............................................ 136
6.2.3 Implementation Progress MKUKUTA Secretariat ...................................... 138
6.2.4 Implementation Progress on Survey and Routine Data .............................. 138
6.2.5 Implementation of Research and Analysis .................................................... 139
6.2.6 Implementation of MKUKUTA II Communication Strategy ..................... 139
6.2.7 Outputs of MKUKUTA II Monitoring System ............................................. 140
6.3 Main findings of the assessment ........................................................................ 141
6.3.1 Institutional Arrangements for MKUKUTA M&E ....................................... 141
6.4 MKUKUTA II Monitoring System: Overall Challenges ................................. 144
6.5 Special issues for Consideration in M&E ......................................................... 145
6.5.1 Coordination of Data Production ................................................................. 146
6.5.2 Participation of Stakeholders ....................................................................... 146
6.5.3 Outputs of the MKUKUTA M&E System ...................................................... 147
6.5.4 Access to data and Information of the M&E Systems ............................... 148
6.5.5 Utilisation of Evidence Generated by the MKUKUTA II M&E Systems ....... 148
6.5.6 Capacity for Implementation of the MKUKUTA III M&E Systems .......... 150
6.5.7 Linkages between MMS and other M&E systems at National, MDA and LGA levels ................................................................. 150
6.5.8 Value for Money ............................................................................................. 152
6.6 Abridging MKUKUTA II and FYDP II Monitoring and Evaluation System: A New M&E generation ................................................................. 152
6.7 Stakeholders’ Analysis of MMS Situation .................................................. 153
6.8 Recommendations .......................................................................................... 154
ANNEX A. MKUKUTA CLUSTERS: GOALS, INDICATORS, AVAILABLE DATA AND 2015 TARGETS ................................................................. 155
ANNEX A1. TREND PERFORMANCE IN GROWTH FOR REDUCTION OF POVERTY ................................................................. 155
ANNEX B. TREND PERFORMANCE IN QUALITY OF LIFE AND SOCIAL WELLBEING .................................................................................. 163
ANNEX C. TREND PERFORMANCE IN GOOD GOVERNANCE AND ACCOUNTABILITY ........................................................................... 171
## Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AHSPPR</td>
<td>Annual Health Sector Performance Profile Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIDS</td>
<td>Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARV</td>
<td>Anti Retro Viral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEST</td>
<td>Basic Education Statistics in Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRN</td>
<td>Big Results Now</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBMIS</td>
<td>Community Based Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSEE</td>
<td>Certificate of Secondary Education Examinations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSR</td>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTS</td>
<td>Cash Transfer Schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAWASCO</td>
<td>Dar es salaam Water and Sewerage Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHS</td>
<td>Demographic and Health Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESAs</td>
<td>Ecological Sensitive Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESDP</td>
<td>Education Sector Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESPR</td>
<td>Education Sector Performance Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FI</td>
<td>Food Insecure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FYDP</td>
<td>Five Year Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GER</td>
<td>Gross Enrolment Ratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HBS</td>
<td>Household Budget Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HMIS</td>
<td>Health Sector Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSSP</td>
<td>Heath Sector Strategic Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDD</td>
<td>Iodine Deficiency Disorders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMR</td>
<td>Infant Mortality Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITNs</td>
<td>Insecticide-Treated Nets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGA’S</td>
<td>Local Government Authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCDGC</td>
<td>Ministry of Community Development Gender and Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIS</td>
<td>Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MKUKUTA</td>
<td>Mkakati wa Kukuza Uchumi na Kupunguza Umaskini Tanzania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoEVT</td>
<td>Ministry of Education and Vocational Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoHSW</td>
<td>Ministry of Health and Social Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoW</td>
<td>Ministry of Water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPDSR</td>
<td>Maternal and Perinatal Death Surveillance and Response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTR</td>
<td>Mid-Term Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MVC</td>
<td>Most Vulnerable Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MVE</td>
<td>Most Vulnerable Elderly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Nutrition Anaemia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NBI Nile Basin Initiative
NBS National Bureau of Statistics
NER Net Enrolment Rate
NGO’s Non Government Organizations
NHBRA National Housing and Building Research Agency
NHC National Housing Corporation
NSPF National Social Protection Framework
NTLP National Tuberculosis and Leprosy Programme
NWSDS National Water Sector Development Strategy
OPD Out Patient Department
PEDP Primary Education Development Programme
PHDR Poverty and Human Development Report
PMTCT Prevention of Mother to Child Transmission
PREPARED Planning for Resilience in East Africa through Policy, Adaptation, Research and Economic Development
PSLE Primary School Leaving Examination
PSSN Productive Social Safety Nets
PTR Pupil Teacher Ratio
RITA Registration, Insolvency and Trustship Agency
SEDP Secondary Education Development Programme
SP Service Poor
SPIFS Subproject Interest Forms
TAMISEMI Tawala za Mikoa na Serikali za Mitaa
TASAF Tanzania Social Action Fund
TB Tuberculosis
TDHS Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey
TFR Total Fertility Rate
THDR Tanzania Human Development Report
THMIS Tanzania HIV/AIDS and Malaria Indicator Survey
TRCHS Tanzania Reproductive and Child Health Survey
TRCS Tanzania Red Cross Society
U5MR Under Five Mortality Rate
UN United Nations
UNICEF United Nations Children Fund
UPE Universal Primary Education
URT United Republic of Tanzania
UWSSA Urban Water Supply and Sewerage Authority
VAD Vitamin A Deficiency
WASH Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
WHO World Health Organization
WSDP Water Sector Development Programme
Preface

MKUKUTA II Assessment Report (MAR) marks the end of MKUKUTA II implementation for the period of five years (2010-2015). However, consensus was reached within Government to extend MKUKUTA II for one year (2015/16) in order to coincide with the terminal year of FYDP I implementation and allow preparation of single national development plan.

MAR provides progress in MKUKUTA II clusters of economic growth, social wellbeing, and governance, as well as financing and monitoring and evaluation. The assessments focus on achievements and non-achievement, challenges and draw key messages to stimulate debate and policy thinking and further inform the second Five Year Development Plan II (FYDP II- 2016/17- 2020/21).

MAR uses the indicators’ baselines and targets from the MKUKUTA II Monitoring Master Plan and compares them with the current status in order to gauge progress. By doing so, MAR also provides a solid ground for baseline of the envisaged FYDP II.

Preparation of this MAR benefited from independent MKUKUTA II assessment studies carried out as part of the process of preparing the FYDP II.

I hope readers of EMAR will find it useful and assisting in their contribution to the policy development for nation. I also hope that, given the progress reported in MAR, you reader should asking a question: what did I contribute? How can I contribute more to the development of Tanzania?

Finally, I would like to extend my gratitude to all who participated in preparing this report.

Dr. Servacius B. Likwelile
Permanent Secretary
Ministry of Finance and Planning
This document is the end of MKUKUTA II review report, which takes stock of the achievements and challenges of MKUKUTA II and looks ahead to inform the 2nd Five Year Development Plan (FYDP II). The review covers the three MKUKUTA II clusters of desired outcomes: Cluster I – growth for the reduction of income poverty; Cluster II – improvement of quality of life and social well-being; and Cluster III – governance and accountability. The report also presents a review of MKUKUTA II Financing as well as Monitoring and Evaluation. Each review chapter ends with a section on key messages to inform FYDP II. What follows is a summary organized by MKUKUTA II key result areas.

Cluster I - Growth for Reduction of Income Poverty

During the period under review, GDP in real terms grew by seven percent or above with the exception of 2012 where it grew by 5.1 percent. The GDP growth however has not reached MKUKUTA II target of achieving and maintaining an 8-10 percent growth necessary for eradicating absolute poverty by 2025.

Income poverty starts to respond to economic growth. The proportion of Mainland population in basic needs poverty was 28.2 percent in 2011/12, down from 34.4 percent in 2007. Furthermore, 9.7 percent of the Mainland population is food poor in 2011/12 compared to 11.8 percent in 2007.

Under MKUKUTA II, prudent macroeconomic management continued to be considered fundamental in fostering high and sustainable economic growth, employment creation and poverty reduction. However, there were substantial fluctuations in some indicators.

The rate of inflation was 7.2 percent in June 2010 rising to its highest level of 17.4 percent in June 2012 but consistently dropped to 6.1 percent in June 2015.

Government total expenditure as a percentage of GDP showed unpredictable pattern. It declined from 20.0 percent in 2009/10 to 18.9 percent in 2011/12 before rising to 19.2 percent in 2012/13, declining again to 18.6 percent in 2013/14 than MKUKUTA target of 25 percent by 2015. The recurrent and development expenditures followed similar patterns. During the period under review, domestic revenue to GDP ratio exhibited a rising trend. It rose from 11.4 percent in 2009/10 to 13.6 in 2013/14 and it reached 14.0 percent in 2014/15.

The fiscal deficit before grants as a percentage of GDP has declined from 8.2 percent in 2009/10 to 4.5 percent in 2014/15. However, fiscal deficit after grants showed a fluctuating trend.
Total export increased from USD 7,050.7 million in 2010/11 to USD 8,885.8 million in 2013/14 and reached USD 9,398.5 million in 2014/15. The improvement emanated largely from traditional and manufactured export goods, as well as travel and transportation receipts. Nevertheless, the current account balance recorded a widening deficit during the period under review. The deficit increased from USD 2,208.7 million in 2010/11 to USD 4,790.4 million in 2013/14, and it was USD 4,091.8 million during the year ending June 2015.

The Tanzanian Shilling depreciated from an annual average of TZS 1,391.6 per USD in June 2010 to an annual average of 2,020.3 per USD in June 2015. The depreciation was largely due to higher demand for foreign currency coupled with the general strengthening of the US dollar against the major international currencies in the international markets.

During the period under review, the values of Foreign Direct Investments (FDI) have shown a fluctuating trend. It declined from 1,813.2 million USD in 2010 to 1,229.5 million USD in 2011 rising to 2,087 million USD in 2013 before declining again to 2,049.3 million USD in 2014.

The Food Security Sufficient Ratio (FSSR) increased from 119 percent in 2010/11 to 138 percent in 2011/12, it dropped thereafter reaching 118 percent in 2013/14 rising again to 125 percent in 2014. But, it generally remained above the target ratio of 100 percent.

Decent employment is a fundamental factor for reducing income poverty and enhancing economic growth. It is through creation of decent jobs that income poverty can significantly be reduced among the population. Manufacturing Sector has been doing better in increasing job opportunity from 2010 to 2014. Cumulatively the number of people employed in manufacturing sector by 2014 reached 133,231 people, an increase of 21.6 percent from 2010. Other progress made in this area includes:

i. Implementation of the National Youth Employment Creation Programme in collaboration with stakeholders whereby 840,000 employment opportunities will be created

ii. Implementation of the skills development programme as well as empowerment of youth through training on entrepreneurship with the aim of encouraging self employment

iii. Empowerment of young youth and women through facilitating business start –up- capital for self employment as well as establishment of apprenticeship programme.
Cluster II – Improvement of Quality of Life and Social Well-being

Under this cluster, MKUKUTA II aimed at the following two cluster-wide broad outcomes:

i. Enhanced capabilities, with particular focus on the poorest, people with disabilities, and other vulnerable groups; and

ii. Reduced inequalities in accessing social and economic opportunities, across geographical areas, income groups, age, gender, and other groups.

In ensuring equitable access to quality education, Tanzania records significant progress in some indicators; but major challenges are noted. The total enrolment in Pre-primary education has declined by 2 percent from 1,069,208 pupils in 2011 to 1,046,369 pupils in 2014. Likewise, the Gross Enrolment ratio declined by 17 percentage points from 44.5 percent in 2011 to 36.9 percent in 2014. At regional level, GER for 2014 varied greatly, with Iringa recorded the highest (56.2 percent) while the lowest found in Dar es Salaam (15.9 percent).

The net primary school enrolment rate indicated a substantial progress in the last decade from 2003 (88.5 percent) to 2007 (97.3 percent), following the introduction of the Primary Education Development Plan (PEDP) in 2001. However, NER declined afterward (2008-2014) from 97.2 percent to 84.4 percent, indicating that about 15.6 percent of primary school age children are not attending school. MKUKUTA II target is 100 percent NER by 2015.

The Percentage of Cohort Completing Standard Seven continues to increase. However, the top level scorer (Grade A and B) were much fewer than those scoring at the bottom (Grade C and D). In 2014, only 13.8 percent scored grade A and B while 43.2 percent scored grade C.

Pupil teacher ratio in primary education has been improving since the past decade, from 1:58 in 2004 to 1:51 in 2010 and to 1:43 in 2014, which is close the government standard of 1:40.

The Transition Rate from Standard Seven to Form One improved from 52.2 in 2011 to 55.5 percent in 2014. Tanzania has achieved gender balance in transition to secondary education. In 2012/13, transition rate from standard seven to form one for males and females were fairly the same, recorded as 257,465 students and female 257,127 students.

Net Enrolment Ratio in Lower Secondary Schools (Form One-Four) steadily increased from 6.3 percent in 2003 up to 36.6 percent in 2012. It then started
declining afterward, down to 32.0 percent in 2014. This is shortfall to the MKUKUTA target of 50 percent.

There has been substantial increase in qualified teachers in secondary schools, from 33,954 teachers in 2009 to 80,529 teachers in 2014. The standard norm of pupil teacher ratio of 1:40 in secondary education has been achieved.

Vocational Education Enrolment has been increasing. Between 2011 and 2014, the number of students enrolled increased from 104,840 to 164,077, equivalent to 56.5 percent. The number of students enrolled in technical education increased by 136 percent from 49,185 students in 2009 to 116,160 students in 2014.

Tanzania recorded a significant increase in the number of public and private universities. There are 26 universities in Tanzania, (of which, 10 public and 16 private) and 15 university colleges (4 public and 11 private universities).

On improving survival, health, nutrition and well being, especially for children, women and vulnerable groups, the following is performance.

Proportion of births taking place at health facility was 62 percent in year 2013/14 which is far from the target MKUKUTA II and HSSP III target of 80 percent by 2015.

Under-Five Mortality Rates continued to drop from 112 deaths per 1,000 live births in 2005 to 81 in 2010 and to 54 in 2013, achieving MKUKUTA target of 54 deaths per 1000 live births by 2015.

The TDHS 2010 survey estimated MMR at 454 per 100,000 live births as compared to 578 per 100,000 live births in 2005. There is an apparent decline in MMR from the previous estimate, although MMR is still unacceptably high. Maternal deaths represent 17 percent of all deaths to women aged 15 – 49.

There has also been progress in access to affordable clean and safe water; sanitation and hygiene. Water supply coverage in rural areas increased substantially, from 40 percent in 2013 to 55.5 percent in April 2015 and then to 67 percent in June 2015. This surpasses the MKUKUTA II target of 65 percent by June 2015. Furthermore, water supply coverage in 19 regional headquarters increased from 84 percent in 2009 to 86 percent in 2010/11, and it was maintained up to June 2015.

MKUKUTA II also addressed issues of settlements and sustaining environmental quality. The percentage of households with decent housing rose from 55 percent in 2007, to 73 percent in 2012. The proportion of houses with land certificates increased from 5.86 percent in 2012/13 to 6.4 percent in 2013/14.

The villages with land use plans increased from 1.4 percent in 2010 to 12.45 percent in 2014. The target for MKUKUTA II is to attain 40 percent by 2015.

MKUKUTA II further contained strategies for providing adequate social protection and rights to vulnerable and needy groups. The results include the increase in the proportion of households with orphans who attend school 10.33 percent (2009/10) to 13.5 percent but regressed again to 9.0 percent in 2013/14. On the gender line, male enrolment has been higher than female enrolment.

The proportion of children with disability attending primary school marginally increased from 0.32 percent in 2009/2010 to 3.4 in 2011/12 is maintained this level in 2013/14. Throughout the review period, attendance is higher for males than for females.

The Productive Social Safety Net (PSSN) is intended to support one million extreme poor households comprising six million people (approximately 15 percent of the total population). Up to 2014, a total of 761,630 households (about 76 percent of the targeted 1 million) were enrolled in the PSSN. A total of 2,595,668 individuals have been reached in this case with 55 percent of them being females.

Cluster III- Good Governance and Accountability

MKUKUTA II interventions under this cluster aimed at achieving the broad outcomes in terms of good governance and the rule of law; accountability of leaders and public servants; democracy, and political and social tolerance; and peace, political stability, national unity and social cohesion.

Achievements include increases in the number of institutions utilizing public resources according to the financial rules and regulations. Despite the achievement, challenges include the inadequate capacity with regards to International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) and inadequate knowledge among practitioners in respect to the Integrated Financial Management System (IFMS).

During the period under review, all 163 LGAs were found to post their public budgets, revenue and actual expenditures on easily accessible public notice boards.

Corruption remains a challenge. Tanzania’s Transparency International (TI) index score is relatively high compared to other countries in Sub-Saharan Africa.

On improving gender balance, the proportion of women in senior positions in different levels of decision-making has increased from 33 percent during 2010/11 to 41 percent in 2014/15.
Progress has been made on dispensing justice. In order to reduce the number of prisoners in remand, time taken for arrangement of case hearing, especially the first hearing has declined from 120 days in 2010/11 to 65 days in 2014/15.

MKUKUTA II Financing

Government budgetary operations in 2010/11-2014/15 were generally characterized by shortfall in domestic revenue collections resulting to a lower than projected government spending. The average domestic revenue collection in that period was 93 percent of the planned estimates.

Support from Development Partners remained unreliable. For instance, until April 2015, the actual budget support contributions received amounted to TZS 408 billion, which is equivalent to 44 percent of the annual projections of TZS 922.2 billion.

MKUKUTA II Monitoring and Evaluation System

There was some progress in implementing MKUKUTA II Monitoring Master Plan, particularly the component of survey calendar. However, the M&E system faced several challenges, including:

i. Limited data availability, data quality and accessibility by sector accelerated by lack of standardized and harmonized format of reporting; data interpretation and use remain relative weak.

ii. Inadequate M&E capacity at all levels constrained the implementation of strategic planning, budgeting and reporting manual designed with the intention to generate information for indicator reporting at national level.

iii. The evaluation function is underplayed; as such other elements of outcome evaluation (impact assessment) by comparing indicators before and after (without attributing the change) and comparison of targeted values to actual values are still limited.

iv. Absence of independent Evaluation Institution identified by government to build capacity of the staff working in Government as well as help the government to use evaluation as a learning process.

v. Weak Results Based Management (RBM) and evidence based decision making using M&E data remain a challenge at all levels.
Chapter I: Introduction

1.1. Introduction

Tanzania has been implementing the second phase of the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty—NSGRPII/MKUKUTA II) through a number of development and reform programmes and projects. The Government has been reporting the progress of implementation annually through MKUKUTA Annual Implementation Report (MAIR). This is the final report which aims at tracking progress in MKUKUTA II goals and informing stakeholders on the progress made and challenges being encountered. Being a final MAIR, it is also an assessment and review report for the MKUKUTA II.

The report comprehensively reviews progress towards key development targets based on the national indicator set of MKUKUTA II Monitoring Master Plan (MMMP II). The review covers the three major clusters of desired outcomes: Cluster I – growth for the reduction of income poverty; Cluster II – improvement of quality of life and social well-being; and Cluster III – governance and accountability. The report also presents a review of MKUKUTA II Financing as well as Monitoring and Evaluation.

1.2. Purpose, Objectives and Use of the Report

This report marks the end of the second phase of MKUKUTA II. It is a key document for reviewing the accomplishments of MKUKUTA II and for examining the challenges facing the country. It is expected that, the report will stimulate wider dialogue and debate, among stakeholders on key strategic issues including prioritization and sequencing of interventions, and resource mobilization and utilization. The purpose of this report is to provide progress towards performance of MKUKUTAII outcomes, challenges of implementation, and lessons learned. It intends to inform strategic interventions of the 2nd Five Year Development Plan II (FYDP II). The objectives of the report are:

i. To establish achievements and gaps as relative to set MKUKUTA II targets and causes thereof;

---

1 In its initial design, MKUKUTA II should have come to an end by June 2015. However, the Government extended MKUKUTA II implementation by one year to align it with the terminal year of the 1st Five Year Development Plan (FYDP I) in order to allow preparation of a harmonized single national development plan, i.e. FYDP II.
ii. To establish lessons that can be carried forward for improving the formulation and implementation strategy of FYDP II;

iii. To establish expected socio economic status quo come June 2016,- the baseline for FYDP II; and

iv. To Establish the “unfinished business” critical for the success of and to be taken on board FYDP II.

1.3. Coordination and Process of Preparing this Report

The Ministry of Finance coordinated the production of this report. The Ministries, Departments, Agencies (MDAs), Local Government Authorities (LGAs) through PMORALG, as well as Research and Academic Institutions providing the required data, information and analysis. The report benefited from MDAs’ Performance Reports, Survey and other reports, and Economic Survey and available information.

1.4. Organization of the Report

The rest of the report is structured in six chapters and series of annexes. Chapters II, III, and IV present progress according to the three clusters of MKUKUTA II respectively, Growth for Reduction of Income Poverty, Improvement of Quality of Life and Wellbeing and Governance and Accountability. Chapter V covers MKUKUTA II Financing and Government Budget. Chapter VI reports on implementation of MKUKUTA II Monitoring Master Plan. Each review chapter ends with a section, which contains key policy messages for FYDP II.

The annexes provide trends of MKUKUTA II monitoring indicators.
Chapter II: Growth for Reduction of Income Poverty

2.0. Introduction

The chapter reviews the performance of MKUKUTA II Cluster I (Growth for Reduction of Income Poverty) for the period 2010/11-2014/2015. It assesses key outcomes and other achievements for each indicator under the five goals of Cluster I. The goals are (i) pursuing sound macroeconomic management; (ii) reducing income poverty; (iii) ensuring creation and sustenance of productive and decent employment; (iv) ensuring food and nutrition security; and (v) leveraging returns on national resources. The analysis highlights the reasons behind the success and the failures. Furthermore, it identifies key challenges, lessons during the implementation of MKUKUTA II in order to inform the formulation of FYDP II.

2.1. Sound Macroeconomic Management

Goal 1: Pursuing Sound Macroeconomic Management

Prudent macroeconomic management is fundamental in fostering high and sustainable economic growth, employment creation and poverty reduction. Sustained economic growth requires maintaining a stable and predictable macroeconomic environment that guarantees safety and returns to key actors in the economy. This section assesses the progress of key macroeconomic management indicators during the period under review.

2.1.1. Inflation

The Annual Headline Inflation Rates have shown a fluctuating trend during the five years of MKUKUTA II implementation. It was 7.2 percent in June 2010 rising to its highest level of 17.4 percent in June 2012 before consistently dropping to reach 6.1 percent in June 2015. The rate for June 2015 though single digit, is still higher than MKUKUTA target of maintaining a rate not exceeding 5 percent by June 2015. The observed trend can be attributed mainly to fluctuation in oil prices in the world market and food prices and demand in some of Tanzania’s neighboring countries. Food prices is the major determining factor for inflation rate as food items constitute about 50 percent of the basket of goods and services for computing the Consumer Price Index.
Table: 2.1. Inflation Rate (Percentage)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Jun-10</th>
<th>Jun-11</th>
<th>Jun-12</th>
<th>Jun-13</th>
<th>Jun-14</th>
<th>Jun-15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inflation</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: National Bureau of Statistics

2.1.2. Proportion of actually disbursed amounts of Aid to total commitment

The proportion of actually disbursed amounts of aid to total commitment shows a declining trend. It has declined from 82 percent in June 2011 to 75 percent in June 2015. The poor performance in disbursements was mainly attributed to non-fulfillment of commitments by development partners, disbursement prior actions by government implementing agencies (GIAs), and low absorption capacity by some of the projects. The recent economic and financial crisis that the world experienced meant that Development Partners (DPs) could not honor their commitments.

Table: 2.2. Aid Disbursement as Percentage of Commitment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Jun-10</th>
<th>Jun-11</th>
<th>Jun-12</th>
<th>Jun-13</th>
<th>Jun-14</th>
<th>Jun-15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aid</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Finance

2.1.3. Official Foreign Reserves

During the period under review, gross official foreign reserves showed fluctuating and unpredictable trend. It declined from equivalent of 5.5 months of imports of goods and services in June 2010 to equivalent of 4.1 months in June 2013, rising to equivalent of 4.5 months in June 2014 declining again to equivalent of 3.7 months of imports of goods and services in June 2015. This level is below MKUKUTA II target of maintaining official foreign reserves equal to 6 months of imports of goods and services.

Table: 2.3. Official Foreign Reserves – Months of imports of goods and services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Jun-10</th>
<th>Jun-11</th>
<th>Jun-12</th>
<th>Jun-13</th>
<th>Jun-14</th>
<th>Jun-15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Months</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bank of Tanzania – Various Publications
2.1.4. Exchange Rate

The Tanzanian Shilling depreciated from an annual average of TZS 1,391.6 per USD in June 2010 to an annual average of 2,020.3 per USD in June 2015. The depreciation was largely due to higher demand for foreign currency coupled with the general strengthening of the US dollar against the major international currencies in the international markets. The Bank of Tanzania intervened occasionally in the market for liquidity management purposes by selling foreign currencies in order to curb further depreciation of the Tanzanian Shilling. It also implemented various measures including reduction of banks’ prudential limit on foreign currency net open position and strict enforcement of the existing restrictions on non-residents’ access to Tanzanian shilling denominated credit facilities.

Table: 2.4. Exchange rate – USD to TZS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Jun-10</th>
<th>Jun-11</th>
<th>Jun-12</th>
<th>Jun-13</th>
<th>Jun-14</th>
<th>Jun-15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>USD/TZS</td>
<td>1,391.6</td>
<td>1,489.6</td>
<td>1,572.2</td>
<td>1,603.7</td>
<td>1,647.7</td>
<td>2,020.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bank of Tanzania – Various Publications

2.1.5. Budget deficit as percentage of GDP, before and after grants

During the period under review, the overall fiscal deficit has shown a declining trend. Fiscal deficit before grants as a percentage of GDP has declined from 8.2 percent in 2009/10 to 4.5 percent in 2014/15. On the other hand, fiscal deficit after grants showed a fluctuating trend, it was 4.8 percent of GDP in 2009/10 rising to 5.0 percent in 2010/11, declining to 3.5 percent in 2011/12 before rising again to 4.2 percent in 2012/13. It then declined to 3.3 percent in 2013/14 and rising again to 3.8 percent in 2014/15 (see table 2.5). This level shows that MKUKUTA II target of containing deficit at below eight percent by 2015 has been attained.

Table: 2.5. Budget deficit as a percentage of GDP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2009/10</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deficit Before Grants</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deficit After Grants</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey - June 2015
2.1.6. Revenue and Government Expenditure to GDP Ratio

Revenue to GDP Ratio
During the period under review, domestic revenue to GDP ratio exhibited a rising trend. It rose from 11.4 percent in 2009/10 to 13.6 in 2013/14 and it reached 13.0 percent in 2014/15. The increase emanated largely from expanding the tax base (formalization of informal sector), improving revenue collection procedures and systems, including use of Electronic Fiscal Device (EFD), as well as minimizing tax exemptions and harmonization of tax rates and levies. MKUKUTA II target was reached, collection equivalent to 18.7 percent of GDP by 2014/15.

Government Expenditure to GDP Ratio
Government total expenditure as a percentage of GDP showed unpredictable pattern. It declined from 20.0 percent in 2009/10 to 18.9 percent in 2011/12 before rising to 19.2 percent in 2012/13, declining again to 18.6 percent in 2013/14. In 2014/15, government expenditure reached 20.5 percent which is less than MKUKUTA target of 25 percent by 2015. The recurrent and development expenditures followed similar patterns (see table 2.6).

Table 2.6. Government expenditures as a percentage of GDP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2009/10</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total expenditure</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>20.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recurrent</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>13.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


2.1.7. Current Account Balance

The current account balance recorded a widening deficit during the period under review. The deficit increased from USD 2,208.7 million in 2010/11 to USD 4,790.4 million in 2013/14, and it was USD 4,091.8 million during the year ending June 2015. The increase in current account deficit was mainly attributed to increased imports of goods and services (in both the quantum and price of goods imports particularly machinery and oil) coupled with a decrease in current transfers, particularly official transfers.

2.1.8. Exports Performance

The value of exports of goods and services during the period under review...
continued to increase though marginally. It increased from USD 7,050.7 million in 2010/11 to USD 8,885.8 million in 2013/14 and reached USD 9,398.5 million in 2014/15. The improvement emanated largely from traditional and manufactured export goods, as well as travel and transportation receipts. The increase in traditional exports goods were mainly due to higher export volumes of coffee and cotton associated with good weather conditions coupled with good prices offered during the years. The average unit prices of most traditional exports maintained an upward trend since 2010, which acted as incentive to producers.

2.1.9. Foreign Direct Investments

During the period under review, the values of Foreign Direct Investments (FDI) have shown a fluctuating trend. It declined from 1,813.2 million USD in 2010 to 1,229.5 million USD in 2011 rising to 2,087 million USD in 2013 before declining again to 2,049.3 million USD in 2014. Though it fluctuated, but it is an encouraging trend that needs to be promoted as FDI provides an inflow of much needed foreign capital and funds for investment in productive sectors. It can thus contribute to growth and reduction of poverty by among others creation of job opportunities, increased domestic revenues, skills and technological transfers. The government will need to continue to put in place investment policies and measures to make Tanzania an even more attractive for FDI.

| Table: 2.7. Foreign Direct Investment in Million USD |
|-------------------------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| **Year** | **2009** | **2010** | **2011** | **2012** | **2013** | **2014p** |
| FDI | 952.6 | 1,813.0 | 1,229.5 | 1,799.6 | 2,087.3 | 2,049.3 |
| Percentage Change | 90.3 | (32.2) | 46.4 | 16.0 | (1.8) |

Source: Economic Survey June 2015

Note: p=provisional

2.2. Income Poverty

Goal 2: Reducing Income Poverty through promoting inclusive, sustainable and employment-enhancing growth

The interventions under this goal are aimed at reducing income poverty. They include different policies that guarantee broad based and sustainable growth, modernizing the economy and strengthening of private sector as an engine of growth. The indicators under this goal include percentage of rural population who live within 2 km of an all-season passable road (Rural access indicator); Gini Coefficient; Head Count ratio for basic needs poverty line by rural/urban; GDP growth per annum by major economic growth drivers (Agriculture, Mining,
Manufacturing, Energy and Tourism). Others are: Percentage of trunk and regional roads network in good and fair condition; Percentage of rural roads that are passable (good and fair); Unemployment rate; Proportion of working age population underemployed and not currently employed by sex and age. Another set is that of access to infrastructure and facilities. They include: percentage of population with access to electricity (grid/off grid); Percentage of small holders participating in contract farming and out grower schemes; Percentage of small holders using farming technologies (irrigation, pesticides, fertilizers and improved seeds/breeds and vaccination). Others include: Percentage of households whose main income is derived from agro based enterprises (traders, processors, agro dealers); Percentage of smallholder farmers who accessed formal credit for agricultural purposes and percentage of increase of productivity of crops (maize and rice) and livestock (dairy).

2.2.1. Income Poverty and Inequality

Tanzania is making progress (though slowly) in reducing income poverty. Findings from the 2011/12 Household Budget Survey (HBS) (URT 2014) reveals that the proportion of Mainland population in basic needs poverty is 28.2 percent during the 2011/12, down from 34.4 percent in 2007. It further reveals that, 9.7 percent of the Mainland population is food poor in 2011/12 compared to 11.8 percent in 2007.

The poverty incidence differs significantly between rural and urban areas, with rural areas being worse off than urban areas (Table 2.8). Table 2.8 further reveals that the decline in Basic Needs Poverty of about 6.2 percent in five-year period was more pronounced in Dar es Salaam (10.0 percent) as compared to the rural areas (6.1 percent) and other urban areas (1.0 percent). Similarly the overall incidence of food poverty declined by 2.1 percent with Dar es Salaam and rural areas recording 2.2 percent decline and other urban areas a marginal 0.2 percent decline as shown in Table 2.8.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Poverty</th>
<th>Dar es Salaam</th>
<th>Other Urban Areas</th>
<th>Rural Areas</th>
<th>Tanzania Mainland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basic Needs Poverty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>22.7</td>
<td>39.4</td>
<td>34.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>21.7</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>28.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Poverty Line</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>11.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty Gap Index</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: HBS 2011/2012; Main Report July 2014
The income inequality as measured by Gini coefficient for Tanzania Mainland had improved slightly from 0.37 in 2007 to 0.34 in 2011/12. The inequality is higher in other urban areas and Dar es Salaam as compared to rural areas (see table 2.9).

### Table 2.9: Gini Coefficient

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania Mainland</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dar es salaam</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other urban</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural areas</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NBS – HBS Main Report July 2014

#### 2.2.2. GDP Growth

GDP growth is essential if poverty is to be reduced; without growth there cannot be any hope for reducing poverty. Sustained growth is critical to making faster progress towards eradicating absolute poverty. Growth generates virtuous circles opportunities including employments, incentives for investments in social and economic activities.

During the period under review, GDP in real terms grew by seven percent or above with the exception of 2012 where it grew by 5.1 percent. The GDP growth however has not reached MKUKUTA II target of achieving and maintaining an 8-10 percent growth necessary for eradicating absolute poverty by 2015 (see table 2.10).

### Table 2.10: Percentage GDP Growth at 2007 base year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth rate</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey June 2015

#### 2.3.3. Sectoral Growth

**Agriculture**

Growth rate in agriculture sector (crops, livestock, forestry and fishing) averaged above three percent between 2011 and 2014 as compared to growth of 2.7 percent in 2010 (table 2.11 below). The contributing factors to this level of growth are favorable weather conditions, timely distribution of inputs and availability of high yield seed during the period under review. The agriculture sector growth
was still below MKUKUTA target of reaching and maintaining an average growth of 6-8 percent over a period of five years required to make headway in eradicating absolute poverty. The contribution of agriculture to GDP increased from 29.9 percent in 2010 to 31.2 percent in 2012 and then down to 28.9 in 2014. Much effort is needed to improve farming system, expand irrigation schemes and promote use of pesticides and improved seeds for increase productivity for poverty reduction.

Table 2.11: Agricultural Sector Growth and Contribution to GDP Growth at 2007 base year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crops</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livestock</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishing</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture Contribution to GDP Growth</td>
<td>29.9</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>31.2</td>
<td>28.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey June 2015

Crops production growth showed a fluctuating pattern during the period under review, it increased from 3.7 percent in 2010 to 4.8 percent in 2011. It declined thereafter reaching 3.5 percent in 2013 before rising to 4.0 percent in 2014. Growth in livestock production continued to increase from 1.4 percent in 2010 to 2.2 percent in 2014. Forestry sub sector registered an increase in growth from 3.4 percent in 2010 to 5.1 percent in 2014. Fishery sub-sector also registered an increase in growth to 5.5 in 2013 down from 0.9 percent in 2010; it however declined in 2014 to 2.0 percent. The decline is attributed to environmental degradation, especially in fish breeding areas.

**Irrigation**

Tanzania has large surface and underground water resources that can be utilized for irrigating an estimated 2.3 million hectares of potential land for irrigation. Despite this potential, agriculture in the country remains largely rain fed, and therefore vulnerable to unfavorable weather which results in poor agricultural performance. The area under irrigation increased marginally from 370,000 hectares in 2010 to 461,326 hectares in 2014, equal to an increase of 24.7 percent. The irrigated area falls short of the MKUKUTA target of 1,000,000 hectares by 2015 (it is only 46.1 percent of the target).
Manufacturing sector has significant potential of transforming the economy and contributing to reducing poverty. It impacts poverty directly through the creation of job opportunities and indirectly through backward and forward linkages in the economy, especially agriculture sector which employs the largest section of the population. It further generates high employment multipliers through creation of indirect and induced jobs in related industries, which also results in knowledge and technological spillovers.

During the period under review manufacturing sector growth shows a declining trend. It declined from 8.9 percent in 2010 to 6.8 percent in 2014. The lowest growth was noticed in 2012 where it grew by 4.1 percent (see table 2.12). With this growth trend, its contribution to GDP also declined from 7.5 percent in 2010 to 7.3 percent in 2014. The observed growth has been off-track MKUKUTA II target of reaching and maintaining a growth rate of 15.0 percent by 2015 required to eradicate absolute poverty. The failure to meet the target is attributed to poor technology resulting to low productivity, decline in some industrial activities especially painting and pyrethrum products.

### Table 2.12: Manufacturing Sector Growth and Contribution to GDP Growth at 2007 base year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribution to GDP</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Economic Survey June 2015

The growth rate of Manufacturing Sector was 8.9 percent in year 2010 which declined to 6.9 percent in 2011 and again dropped to 4.1 percent in 2012. The decline mainly was due to a decrease in production of some factories particularly textiles, paints and pyrethrum pesticides. The decrease in the production was due to decreased demand, partly attributed to competition over imports. In 2013 manufacturing sector raised to 6.5 percent and in 2014 the growth rate increased to 6.8 percent. The upturn was due to the increase in production of some industrial product precisely textile, plastic product, rubber, furniture, printing, drinks and agro processing. The share of manufacturing sector to GDP was 6.9 percent in 2010 as compared to 5.6 percent in 2014.
Tourism
The number of foreign tourists who visited Tanzania increased from 782,699 tourists in 2010 to 1,102,026 tourists in 2014 an increase of 40.8 percent. Tourism earnings increased by 58.1 percent from USD 1,254.50 million in 2010 to USD 1,982.98 million in 2014. The increase is attributed to stepped-up efforts in promoting Tanzania’s tourist attractions, as well as improved tourist services and infrastructure. Increase in the number of tourists led to employment creation in areas such as campsites, hotels and restaurants, etc. Table 2.13 shows trend in tourist arrivals and earnings.

Table 2.13: International Tourism Business trend in Tanzania

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of International Arrivals</td>
<td>782,699</td>
<td>867,994</td>
<td>1,077,058</td>
<td>1,095,884</td>
<td>1,102,026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earnings ( US $ million)</td>
<td>1,254.50</td>
<td>1,324.83</td>
<td>1,712.75</td>
<td>1,853.28</td>
<td>1,982.98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism: P = Provision

Mining
The mining and quarrying sector growth showed a fluctuating pattern during the period under review. The sector growth decreased from 7.3 percent in 2010 to 3.9 percent in 2013 (the lowest growth in the period) and rising to 9.4 percent in 2014. The sector’s contribution to GDP averaged above 3 percent (Table 2.14).
Table 2.14: Mining Sector Growth and Contribution to GDP Growth at 2007 base year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribution to GDP</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey June 2015

Construction

The construction sector registered varying growth rate under the review period. It grew from 10.3 percent in 2010 to 22.9 percent in 2011, declining thereafter to 3.2 percent in 2012 and rising again to 14.6 percent and 14.1 percent in 2013 and 2014, respectively. The sector’s share to GDP increased from 7.8 percent in 2010 to 12.5 percent in 2014 mainly due to the falling shares of other sectors. The observed growth has been attributed largely by an increase in construction and rehabilitation activities of roads and bridges including the Dar es Salaam Bus Rapid Transport system, the ongoing constructions of airports, and residential buildings.

Table 2.15: Construction Sector Growth and Contribution to GDP Growth at 2007 base year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP Share</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey June 2015

Transport Infrastructure

Road Network

The total road network in Tanzania is estimated at 87,663.62 km comprising of trunk roads (12,203.73 km), regional roads (22,129.65 km), as well as district, urban and feeder roads (108,946 km). Whereas trunk and regional road networks are managed by the Ministry of Works through Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS), the network of about 108,946 km of urban, district and feeder roads is under the Prime Minister’s Office, Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG). The estimated road network has expanded following classification and upgrading of rural/ local/ feeder roads of about 55,486 km from newly established Districts and Councils. Table 2.16 shows the road network by class type.
Table 2.16: Road Network by type (km) in Tanzania - March 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Road Class</th>
<th>Paved</th>
<th>Unpaved</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trunk Roads</td>
<td>7,342.13</td>
<td>4,861.60</td>
<td>12,203.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional Roads</td>
<td>1,321.09</td>
<td>20,808.56</td>
<td>22,129.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District, Urban, Feeder Roads</td>
<td>1,118</td>
<td>107,828</td>
<td>108,946</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9,781.22</td>
<td>133,498.56</td>
<td>143,279.38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Works and PMO-RALG, 2015

Percentage of trunk and regional roads network in good and fair condition
During the period under review trunk and regional roads in good and fair condition was maintained at an average of above 85 percent. This has been a satisfactory performance given the level of public revenues and expenditures. Table 2.17 shows the general condition of trunk and regional roads.

Table 2.17: Percentage of Trunk and regional Roads in Good and Fair Condition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Actual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>39</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>45</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good/fair</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>84</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Works, 2015

Percentage of Rural/Local Roads that are Passable (Good/Fair Conditions)
Rural/local roads are critical ingredient to rural growth, development and income poverty reduction as they assist economic and income generating activities by facilitating movement of labor (people), and goods, as well as access to services (health, education, agricultural extension and information) and markets. Improved rural roads create the condition for better access to services, and of services to the rural areas, they also provide connectivity to higher class road networks.

During the period under review rural roads in good and fair condition has been below 60 percent against MKUKUTA II target of maintaining 63 percent of good and fair conditions (i.e. are passable throughout the year) by 2015. This has been attributed largely by lack of enough maintenance funds as well as due to new classification and upgrading of rural/feeder roads from newly established Districts and Councils which expanded the road network from 58,037 km to 108,946 km. Table 2.18 shows the general condition of rural/ local roads.
Table 2.18: Percentage of Rural/Local Roads in Good and Fair Condition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Condition</th>
<th>2009/10 Actual</th>
<th>2010/11 Actual</th>
<th>2011/12 Actual</th>
<th>2012/13 Actual</th>
<th>2013/14 Actual</th>
<th>2014/15 Actual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good/fair</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PMO-RALG, 2015

Energy

Electricity and gas sub sector growth for the period under review has been fluctuating. Growth decreased from 13.4 percent in 2010 to 3.3 percent in 2012 with negative growth of 4.3 percent in 2011. It increased thereafter to 13.0 and 9.3 percent in 2013 and 2014, respectively. The observed growth pattern can be explained to the decline in thermal power and hydro-electricity generation caused by deterioration of hydro power plants and drought. However, with the discovery of gas the sector is likely to increase its growth tremendously. Contribution of sector GDP has been very low at below 1 percent.

Table 2.19: Energy Sector Growth and Contribution to GDP Growth at 2007 base year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>-4.3</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP Contribution</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey June 2015

Electricity Generation

Electricity generated through the National Grid during the period under review increased from 5,189.3 GWh in 2010 to 6,285.0 GWh in 2014, an increase of 21 percent.

Table 2.20: Electricity Generation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Growth</td>
<td>5,189.3</td>
<td>5,153.4</td>
<td>5,449.7</td>
<td>5,997.4</td>
<td>6,285.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Economic Survey June 2015

2.3.15. Percent of households with access to electricity (grid/off grid)

Electricity enables households to improve their living conditions by enhancing opportunities for education and employment, as well as for domestic uses which saves time for productive activities. During the period under review, the percentage of households with access to electricity increased to 36 percent in 2013/14 from 13.0 percent in 2008/09 and to 40 percent in 2014/15. Percentage of households with access to electricity in rural areas is still very low at 21 percent in 2014/15 as compared to urban 97 percent. Table 2.21 below shows households with access to electricity.
### Table 2.21: Percentage of households with access to electricity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania Mainland</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>20.7</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>42.8</td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>51.8</td>
<td>57.8</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Ministry of Energy and Minerals

#### 2.2.4. Progress in other areas

**Percentage of smallholders participating in contract farming and out-growers schemes:** MKURABITA has formalized tea out-growers schemes in Mufindi, Rungwe, Njombe district, and Njombe town whereby 10,269 farms have been formalized. In the same way sugar cane out-growers have been formalized in Kilombero, Kilosa and Missenyi districts whereby 16,191 farms were formalized.

**Percentage of smallholder farmers using farming technologies** – irrigation, pesticides, fertilizers and improved seeds/breeds and vaccination) MKURABITA has formalized 105,626 small-holder farms in 208 villages and use of modern farming techniques was emphasized during land use planning.

**Percentage of households whose main income is derived from agro-based enterprises:** Formalization of properties leads to more investment in properties formalized. Although no research has been done in the 208 villages’ research would reveal more activities in the formalized properties.

**Percentage of smallholders who accessed formal credit for agricultural purposes:** Other than the 105,626 small holder farms that have been formalized; training on how to use formalized properties to access credit was conducted to 708 farmers and 144 leaders of farmers associations who would guarantee loans of small holder farmers. So far we have information of 116 loans worth 1.819 billion TZS that have been disbursed to owners of rural properties. If a study were done on how many farmers have accessed loans, we would have a bigger number.

**Percentage increase of productivity of crops and livestock:** Through implementation of land use plans, experience for evaluations done in three villages in Manyoni district council has shown that output per acre for major crops tripled and in some cases was more than four times the original output before implementation of land use plans. There are 147 land use plans that have been made in 147 villages in Tanzania mainland. We need a study to verify increase in productivity in these villages.
2.3. Productive and Decent Employment

Goal 3: Ensuring creation and sustenance of productive and decent employment, especially for women, youth and people with disabilities

Decent employment is a fundamental factor for reducing income poverty and enhancing economic growth. It is through creation of decent jobs that income poverty can significantly be reduced among the population.

2.3.1. Enforcement of labor laws and policy

In order to ensure creation of productive and decent employment and maintain harmony in the work places the following have been done in the enforcement of labor laws:

1. Effective enforcement of labor laws and standards
   i. Minimum wage has been set sector wise
   ii. Improved labor inspections at work places whereby from 2010 to 2015 about 220,350 work places were inspected to ensure compliance with labor laws managed to withdraw /prevent 3016 Children who were employed in the worst form of child labor
   iii. Establishment of Workers Compensation Fund (WCF)
   iv. Establishment of Standalone legislation to regulate foreign employment [Non – Citizens (Employment Regulations) Act, 2014]

2. Filing and Resolving Labour Dispute timely
   i. 10,281 disputes registered were resolved timely
   ii. Dispute hearing and mediation days reduced from 30 to 12 days
   iii. Dispute arbitration days reduced from 90 days to 85 days

3. Employment Creation
   iv. Establishment of a National Employment Strategy through the implementation of the National Youth Employment Creation Programme in collaboration with stake holders whereby 840,000 employment opportunities will be created
   v. Establishment and implementation of the skills development programme as well as empowerment of youth through training on entrepreneurship with the aim of encouraging self employment
   vi. Empowerment of young youth and women through facilitating business start –up- capital for self employment as well as establishment of apprenticeship programme
   vii. Enter into agreement (MoU) with all Regional Commissioners in Tanzania Mainland in order to engage them on the fight against youth unemployment whereby it is agreed to prepare a plan of action on the
fight against youth unemployment. This involves capacity building to youth on life and entrepreneurial skills; facilitating youth access to start up capital and tools; and facilitating youth access to production sites or business area; and reporting the implementation of the plan of action to the Ministry of Labour and Employment every half of the year.

4. Improved access to labor market information
In order to insure generation and dissemination of labor market information the following has been done:
   i. Labour Market Information System as developed
   ii. Data collection tool was developed. The tool has been attached in the National Budget Guideline for Monitoring and Evaluation and reporting mechanism on the results of employment creation from MDAs and LGAs.

2.3.2. Employment in Manufacturing
Manufacturing Sector has been doing better in increasing job opportunity from 2010 to 2014. Cumulatively the number of people employed in manufacturing by 2014 reached 133,231 people, an increase of 21.6 percent from 2010. The increase in employment in the manufacturing sector was attributed to the expansion in manufacturing activities such as the opening of new cement factories (Rhino, Camel, and Kilwa), and investment in new light manufacturing activities in Special Economic Zones. It is noted that, food-processing industries employs more compared to other industries followed by textile as a result of the implementation of the Cotton Strategy. Table 2.22 below highlights number of people employed in manufacturing in various activities.

Table 2.22: Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Various Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td>44,670</td>
<td>46,904</td>
<td>49,266</td>
<td>51,729</td>
<td>54,316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drinks</td>
<td>5,964</td>
<td>6,262</td>
<td>6,578</td>
<td>6,906</td>
<td>7,252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobacco and cigarettes</td>
<td>6883</td>
<td>7227</td>
<td>7588</td>
<td>7968</td>
<td>8,366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knitting and weaving</td>
<td>12,224</td>
<td>12,835</td>
<td>13,490</td>
<td>14,165</td>
<td>14,874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leather and leather products</td>
<td>652</td>
<td>684</td>
<td>719</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>793</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shoes</td>
<td>824</td>
<td>865</td>
<td>909</td>
<td>954</td>
<td>1,002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood and wood products</td>
<td>795</td>
<td>834</td>
<td>877</td>
<td>921</td>
<td>968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paper and printing</td>
<td>5,669</td>
<td>5,952</td>
<td>6,255</td>
<td>6,568</td>
<td>6,897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical Manufacturing</td>
<td>2,974</td>
<td>3,122</td>
<td>3,280</td>
<td>3,444</td>
<td>3,616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubber Products</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td>1,301</td>
<td>1,367</td>
<td>1,436</td>
<td>1,508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plastic Products</td>
<td>4,208</td>
<td>4,418</td>
<td>4,640</td>
<td>4,872</td>
<td>5,116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-metal Mineral Products</td>
<td>2,540</td>
<td>2,667</td>
<td>2,802</td>
<td>2,942</td>
<td>3,089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Others Activities</td>
<td>20,904</td>
<td>21,949</td>
<td>23,069</td>
<td>24,223</td>
<td>25,434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>109,546</td>
<td>115,022</td>
<td>120,840</td>
<td>126,883</td>
<td>133,231</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Economic Survey, 2014

*Other activities are fertilizers, paints, radio, carpets, textile, and petroleum products, fishing nets, sisal products and cement.

### 2.4. Food and Nutrition Security, Environment and Climate Change

**Goal 4: Ensuring Food and Nutrition Security, Environmental Sustainability and Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation**

This goal aims at achieving security in food and nutrition as well as environmental sustainability. It also aims at addressing and dealing with adverse effects of climate change. The indicators for this goal are: food security at household, district, regional, and national levels ensured through increasing food crops, livestock and fishery production; Strategic Grain Reserve of at least four months of national food requirement maintained; Crop and livestock varieties suited to adverse conditions brought about by climate change introduced and adopted; climate change projection and early warning systems, and natural disaster response, coordination framework strengthened.

**Food Security through Increased Food Crops, Livestock and Fishery Production**

The Food Security Sufficient Ratio (FSSR) increased from 119 percent in 2010/11 to 138 percent in 2011/12, it dropped thereafter reaching 118 percent in 2013/14 rising again to 125 percent in 2014/15. This indicates that during the period under review the country was in food self-sufficient as the FSSR was above 100 percent. Large swings however reflect high dependence on the state of the weather.
Table 2.23: Trend analysis of Agricultural Sector under MKUKUTA II performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural Sector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth Rate</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth of Crop Subsector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth of Livestock</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forest and Hunting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Self Sufficiency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>125</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irrigation Contribution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in the Domestic Food</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requirements</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Cooperatives (2014)
NB. Figures in Percentage as per the revised figures of 1992 - (Rebase of 2007)

Government Investment in Agricultural Sector for Improving Food Security through Increased Production

During implementation of MKUKUTA II there was an increase in government investment in the agricultural sector. This had been possible due to increasing government commitment to facilitate the transformation of the agricultural sector into modern, commercial and competitive sector in order to ensure food security and poverty reduction through increased volumes of competitive crop products.

Table 2.24: Government Spending in the Agricultural Sector (Figures in Billion TZS.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>722</td>
<td>903.8</td>
<td>926.2</td>
<td>1,103.6</td>
<td>908.1</td>
<td>1084.7</td>
<td>1001.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Cooperatives (2014)

Furthermore, in ensuring increase in production of food and cash crops there was an increase in the availability of productivity inputs (Table 2.25). This was due to increased Government subsidy which increased from 7.5 billion TZS in 2005/2006 to a total of 97.0 billion in 2014/2015. Also there was increased participation of private sector in the input production, multiplication, importation, and distribution because of conducive polices, legislation and practices.
Table 2.25: The Trend of Availability of Productivity Inputs (Metric Tons) from 2009/10-2014/15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Seeds</td>
<td>20,987</td>
<td>28,770</td>
<td>30,187</td>
<td>30,443</td>
<td>32,340</td>
<td>36,410.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fertilizer</td>
<td>302,000</td>
<td>275,685</td>
<td>302,453</td>
<td>240,350</td>
<td>343,687</td>
<td>342,798</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Cooperatives (2014)

Other initiatives of the Government raise productivity in the agricultural sector included:

i. Increased number of Extension officers from 3,379 in 2005/2006 to 10,089 in 2014/2015. This was contributed by the government policy of having one extension officer for each village.

ii. Increased use of improved varieties from research stations where as a total of 127 varieties of improved seed were produced from Research Stations between 2005/2006-2014/2015. This was possible because of government initiatives to revise the agricultural research function through increased emoluments of researchers and the attempt of giving Researchers contracts after retirement.

iii. Increased area under irrigation from 264,388 in 2005/2006 to 461,326 in 2014/2015 which ultimately increased productivity of irrigated farms from (1.8-2.0) to 4-5 tons per hectare. This was possible due to increased emphasis on importance of irrigation to smallholder farmers and financing of the irrigation projects through ASDP I via the District Irrigation Development Fund at district level.

iv. Increased use of tractors from 10 percent in 2005/2006 to 14 percent in 2014/2015; use of draft animals increased from 20 percent to 24; and hand hoe use in cultivation decreased from 70 percent to 62 percent due to Government efforts to increase the use of tractor through soft loan from India.

As a result of the above initiatives, production of cash crops was increased from 829,994 tons in 2005/2006 to 937,060.2 tons 2014/2015. Apart from the above initiatives increase in production of cash crops was attributed as well with Government good crop policies like Warehouse Receipt System; Contract Farming; transparent Auction in coffee, subsidy for agrochemicals in cashew nuts and cotton and so forth. Also Cooperative Societies which are active were increased from 5,832 in 2005/2006 to 7,888 in 2014/2015 and this was largely contributed by the implementation of Cooperatives Reform and Modernization Programs (CRMP).
2.5. National resources for enhancing growth and benefits to the country

Goal 5: Leveraging returns on national resources (both within and outside) for enhancing growth and benefits to the country at large and communities in particular, especially in rural areas

Utilization of natural resources in a sustainable manner improves livelihoods and reduces poverty. The Operational targets of this goal are (i) sustainable utilization of natural resources and (ii) increased contribution of human resources including the Diaspora. The information for the indicators of this goal was difficult to get for the period under review and thus failure to assess it.

2.6. Challenges, Lessons and Strategies for the Formulation of FYDP II

2.6.1. Translating GDP Growth for Poverty Reduction to the Majority

During the five years of MKUKUTA II implementation, the country’s economy has continued to register an impressive growth though below MKUKUTA II target of 8-10 percent required to eradicate absolute poverty by 2025. Real GDP growth for 2010 – 2014 has been seven percent or above with the exception of 2012 where it was 5.1 percent. Despite being below MKUKUTA II target, with this GDP growth, poverty would have declined considerably. However, poverty is still a major challenge to the majority Tanzanians, especially to rural inhabitants. The 2011/12 HBS shows that 28.2 percent of the population (about 12.3 million Tanzanian) lives below the poverty line.

Tackling this challenge will require action in a number of areas for translating growth into meaningful poverty reduction to the majority. The country will need to re-focus priorities by implementing policies and strategies on sectors with the maximum impact on poverty reduction to the majority and in particular agriculture and industry/manufacturing sectors.

Agriculture is among the sectors with great potential for reducing poverty to the majority. The majority poor live in rural areas where their main income generating activity is agriculture. It is important therefore that, any effort to reduce poverty should consider the rural economy and in particular the importance of agriculture sector for rural development and poverty reduction. Transformation and mechanization of agriculture is thus crucial for poverty reduction.

The other sector that is capable of reducing poverty significantly is manufacturing. It can reduce poverty by employing a large size of population and assisting the agricultural sector to grow through backward and forward linkages. Its growth needs to be shared by the majority through employment, absorbing raw materials
from the agriculture sector, adding value to agricultural produce and supporting agriculture-related SMEs. Improving the productivity of these sectors is vital for rural development and poverty reduction. Indeed, addressing bottlenecks to the development of the rural sector is of paramount importance, as urban poverty is also associated with rural poverty through the migration of the rural poor in search for better living opportunities in urban centers.

2.6.2. Agricultural Sector

Despite the achievements which were achieved during the implementation of MKUKUTA II, notable challenges were faced, and these includes:

i. Budget constraints and flow of funds which do not consider the seasonality of the agricultural activities;

ii. Inadequate extension officers, irrigation technicians, crop inspectors and cooperative officers at Local Government Level and there have also being shortage of technical staff at the central level;

iii. Inadequate infrastructure like roads, energy, utilities, irrigation infrastructure and market including storage facilities and market information;

iv. Natural hazards like pest and disease infestation, persistent droughts, floods and Climate change effects;

v. Deteriorating image of cooperative due to funds mismanagement and Court cases which are taking too long to come to an end.

vi. Inadequate investment by public and private sector which make agriculture to be persistently subsistence, over dependence on hand hoe and rain fed agriculture.

vii. Inadequate support services like, research, extension and training. Low participation of private sector in the agricultural sector

viii. Unreliable Markets conditions and unavailability of improved inputs,

ix. Inadequate agro-processing

x. Inadequate agricultural land use plans-and increasing conflicts between different land users;

xi. Inadequate infrastructure like roads, energy, utilities, irrigation infrastructure and market including storage facilities and market information and

xii. Natural hazards like pest and disease infestation, persistent droughts, floods and Climate change effects;

Going forward (in FYDP II), there must be more investments (public and private) in areas which benefit farmers directly and which provide big results in short period and contributes to increased employment. The objective should be toward making sure agriculture is modernized, competitive and contribute to the reduction of poverty. There should be continued financing of the input program at least till the Tanzania Agricultural Bank is operating at the envisage scale.
Future plans should improve market conditions such as establishment of commodity stock exchange; strategic market at the borders points and accessing the other international markets. Also, efforts to electrify rural areas should be strengthened to make sure power is available in rural areas.

Modernization of the agriculture sector requires improvement in all infrastructures like rural roads, irrigation infrastructure and marketing infrastructure. It also require support in the preparation and implementation of land use plans and land conflicts resolutions. Future plans should also integrate conservation agriculture and climate change mitigation strategies. In summary, areas of priority in the next five years are envisaged to be as per the TAFSIP and ASDP II.

2.6.3. Energy sector

Energy is important for growth and reduction of poverty. It is crucial for boosting manufacturing and poor people’s productivity and their income by among others simplifying their work and freeing substantial times for productive activities; lightening women’s work and reducing the environmental damage from the use of traditional fuels which has effects on the poor majority’s health and livelihoods. It can further run efficiently the transport infrastructure system developed. Reliable and efficient supply of energy is thus fundamental for growth and poverty reduction. The energy crisis hamper the country’s potential for growth, development and poverty reduction.

Developing and maintaining an efficient energy sector by providing sustainable and reliable energy to stir up growth and in transforming the lives of the poor majority in the rural area is the challenge that the country needs to address urgently. Sorting out sustainable financing for the sector over the longer term is essential for increasing the generation capacity and reliability of power supply to meet the growing demand. Over the long term there are huge opportunities presented by the discovery of gas, uranium and prospects for oil discovery. Managing these resources effectively for the benefit of all Tanzanians will be critical and will have major implications for growth, development and poverty reduction.

Looking at the performance of the sector, one notes that a gearing gap relative to the MKUKUTA II targets. In the course of implementing MKUKUTA II, the following challenges experienced include inadequate and timely disbursement of funds; inadequate office accommodation; mismatch between generation capacity and demand; and managing the environment in small scale mining areas. To address these challenges the following future strategies should be taken on board:

i. Enhancing conducive environment for encouraging private sector participation in the electricity sub-sector;

ii. Strengthen infrastructure for generation, transmission and distribution systems;
iii. Improving revenue collection from mineral sectors through close monitoring, provision of extension services and use of e-technology;
iv. Promotion of new and renewable energies;
v. Construction and rehabilitation of Zonal, and Resident Mines offices;
vi. Continue with implementation of projects under BRN initiative;
vii. Strengthening existing power generation plants, transmission lines, distribution networks and promoting rural electrification;
viii. Facilitating establishment of natural gas distribution networks as well as development of LNG;
ix. Promoting investments in renewable energy sources and developing coal resources as well as strengthening Tanzania Geothermal Development Company (TGDC); and
x. Continue with implementation of the Electricity Supply Industry (ESI) Strategy and Roadmap.

2.6.4. Efficient Transport Infrastructure System

Expanding and maintaining an efficient transport infrastructure system is essential for economic growth, development and poverty reduction. When transport infrastructure systems are efficient in terms of capacity and reliability, they provide socio-economic opportunities and benefits that result in positive multiplier effects which include accessibility to markets and social services, attraction of new investments and employment creation. Poverty can seriously be addressed with efficient transport systems. By improving transport systems opportunities are taken to the people and people are brought to opportunities.

The Tanzania transport system is still weak and unreliable; while roads network is improving, the railway system, air and ports are performing poorly. The lack of adequate public transport infrastructure in both urban and rural areas, as well as the absence of an integrated public transport system to create synergy between various modes of public transport is among the greatest challenges facing the transport system and for which the country needs to confront for sustainable growth, development and poverty reduction. Great attention needs to be paid to restoring the railway system, improving public transportation system in urban areas by reducing traffic time and enhancing cargo handling capacity in ports, especially the port of Dar es Salaam. It is important to underscore that much of other sectors of the economy such as agriculture, manufacturing and tourism also depend on transport. Secured and reliable public transport infrastructure is needed to promote productivity in rural areas and other parts within the country, as high costs associated with poor transport infrastructure is partly responsible for some areas in the country lagging behind others. The main challenges which faced the sector are:

i. Inadequate financing for road development projects which have resulted into delays in completion of planned activities, outstanding debts, stopping and or slowing down of works.

ii. Insufficient funds for maintenance of expanding road network;

iii. Inadequate capacity and capability of the local construction industry

iv. Unstable road network due to high percentage of unpaved roads which are highly vulnerable to rain.

Solutions to these challenges require the Government to allocate adequate funds for clearing outstanding debts to complete planned activities and to cover expanding road maintenance programme; to focus on the completion of ongoing projects before of embarking on new projects unless funding is assured, for example donor funded projects; pave regional road network and link to trunks roads.

2.6.5. Labour and Employment Issues

The analysis in this chapter shows that unemployment continues to pose a big challenge to the sector despite several efforts taken by the government. It is an issue to be carried forward. The observed pattern economic growth and employment creation moving in opposite directions should be addressed by aligning growth with employment rich sectors, i.e. growth should be aligned on the job rich sectors like agriculture and all its value chain inclusive economic growth. Scope lies in agriculture – agro processing; irrigation in order to get away to rain fed agriculture dependency; and transport and transportation – specifically trunk and feeder roads.

2.6.6. Manufacturing and Trade Sectors

Government decided to take initiatives in promotion and building of basic industries together with manufacturing industries and support NDC to revive Industries which are not currently working. But there were challenges, namely:

i. The Government budget for the Industry and Trade sector represented a smaller percent compared to the roles it performs throughout the 1st decade of 2000’s. MIT budget restricts performance due to resource confrontation for implementing policies. To accelerate the growth of the industry sector as the lead of the economic sector as foreseen in Vision 2025 require strong and motivating Budget allocation.

ii. It has been seen that the challenge is on high Cost of production, considering that the cost is reflected on the prices of goods and services then this impact the export of Industrial products to other countries.

iii. Accessing financing and potential investors remain limited

iv. Obtaining qualified experts in different aspects of Industries such as (specialized industrial skills, e. g. technologists of textiles, leather, etc.);

v. To increase the quality of products so as to enhance competition.
The solutions to these challenges lie on the following measures:

i. Proper budgeting for the sector has to be seriously considered, including support to Development Finance Institutions such as TIB in establishing the Industrial Development Fund.

ii. Addressing the critical constraints of industrial experts and labor insufficiencies is a priority as well as SME’s special working sites.

iii. Address issues of access to market, including rehabilitation of the railroads from remote production areas so as to stimulate industrial productions and the transportation of raw materials to the industrial production point.

iv. Strengthening Institutional capacity especially the research and development institution such as TIRDO.

v. Further broadening the Private Sector Participation in Industrial investments.

vi. Improving the legal and regulatory framework, the Government on one hand need to revise and enact new legislations which will favor the market information and industrial production systems, efforts need to be given to the enforcement of the existing regulations.


viii. Limited entrepreneurship skills among SMEs (example market analysis, research to products and services to deliver).

In the area of marketing promotion, future policies should address the concerns of the low price given to farmer’s crop caused by inefficiency production and ineffective markets; inappropriate use of measurements (Lumbesa); and counterfeit product entering the markets.

More capacity is required in such systems as the Warehouse Receipt System; Commodity Exchange; Weights and Measures Agency (WMA); and strengthening pre-shipment Verification of conformity to Standards. The TBS should set and control quality standards by establishing inspection centers for imported goods. Furthermore, the TBS continue to strengthen collaborate with other stakeholders like TRA, TFDA, EWURA, FCC, SUMATRA, public etc. on controlling sub-standard of imported and domestically produced goods.

Despite of the different established funds for SMEs such as NEDF (National Entrepreneurship Development Fund) and currently Credit Guarantee Scheme for SMEs, still the sector is facing the problems of accessing finance from financial institution due to lack of acceptable collateral to secure their loans, for that reason SMEs should be encouraged to continue forming groups that can help in accessing fund from financial institutions. Also SIDO and other institution should continue providing knowledge and skills on how to prepare the business plan that can help to access loan from the financial institutions.

Furthermore, there is need to advance and take special initiatives on technological development through SIDO for example cluster development. SIDO is direct
involved in development of the Small Industry Sector in Tanzania by a very wide range of functions, from direct support to industries, to hands on involvement in the establishment of SMEs in both rural and urban areas.

2.6.7. Trade and Regional Integration

Tanzania still has relatively high cost of doing business which has impact on export of goods both agricultural and industrial products. The costs emanates from the inefficiency infrastructure, unreliable energy supply, high cost of communications, multiple taxes, and unnecessary bureaucracy and other barriers that makes export to be more expensive.

Tanzania must enhance competitiveness at the industry and enterprise level reviewing different policies and come up with comprehensive plans on how to address the problem of high cost of doing business that will enhance our export products to be more competitive in different market access. This could include substantially reducing the number of licensing requirement and make the licensing regimes more simple, transparent and focused on necessary regulatory purpose.
Chapter III: Improved Quality of Life and Social Wellbeing

3.0. Introduction

This chapter provides an assessment of the performance of MKUKUTA II Cluster II. The assessment is based on outputs and outcomes of major activities implemented in order to achieve the two cluster-wide broad outcomes:

iii. Enhanced capabilities, with particular focus on the poorest, people with disabilities, and other vulnerable groups; and

iv. Reduced inequalities in accessing social and economic opportunities, across geographical areas, income groups, age, gender, and other groups.

Improvement in delivery and access to quality services in education, health, water and sanitation together with improved social protection among various groups including the vulnerable ones is crucial for attaining these broad outcomes for this cluster.

The assessment of Cluster II is organized under six goals, each with operational indicators used in evaluating progress, and operational targets. The goals are presented as follows:

**Goal 1:** Ensuring equitable access to quality education at all levels for males and females, and universal literacy for adults, both men and women

**Goal 2:** Ensuring expansion of vocational, technical, polytechnics, and higher education, and improving non-formal and continuing education

**Goal 3:** Improving Survival, Health, Nutrition and Well Being, especially for Children, Women and Vulnerable Groups

**Goal 4:** Increasing access to affordable clean and safe water; sanitation and hygiene

**Goal 5:** Developing Decent Human Settlements while Sustaining Environmental Quality

**Goal 6:** Providing Adequate Social Protection and Rights to Vulnerable and Needy groups
3.1: Ensuring equitable access to quality education

Goal 1: Ensuring equitable access to quality education at all levels for males and females, and universal literacy for adults, both men and women

The Government has continued implementing the Education Sector Development Program (ESDP) in MKUKUTA II period. Under this program, a number of sub-programs have been carried out. They include Primary Education Development Program (PEDP I-III), Secondary Education Development Program (SEDP I-II), and Teachers Education Management Program. In the process of implementing these programs, a number of achievements were made, along with respective challenges. Performance under goal 1 is assessed using the following indicators as discussed hereunder:

1. NER for Pre-primary, primary, lower secondary and upper secondary
2. Survival rate for lower secondary and upper secondary
3. Pass rates (national average; male and female) for; Std VII, Form 4 and Form 6
4. Transition rates from primary to secondary education (Std VII to Form I) and lower Secondary to upper Secondary (Form 4 to Form 5)
5. Ratio for Primary and Secondary Education
6. Adult illiteracy rate
7. Percentage of schools having adequate sanitation facilities as per policy

Pre-primary education

Pre-primary education for children aged 5 and 6 years is part of the national formal education system, which prepares children for primary education. Children who go through pre-primary find it easier to adapt to the school routine when they join primary school. By recognizing the importance of pre-primary education, the Government implements the education policy which, among others, stipulates that each Primary school should have a pre-primary stream(s). As the results of these efforts, participation rate in pre-primary education has substantially improved recently.

However, concerning the period under review (2011-2014), the total enrolment in Pre-primary education has declined by 2 percent from 1,069,208 pupils in 2011 to 1,046,369 pupils in 2014. Likewise, the Gross Enrolment ratio declined by 17 percentage points from 44.5 percent in 2011 to 36.9 percent in 2014. At regional level, GER for 2014 varied greatly, with Iringa recorded the highest (56.2 percent) while the lowest found in Dar es Salaam (15.9 percent). The number of male pupils enrolled slightly exceeded female pupils in all years, except for 2013, though in terms of percentage, 50 percent pre-school female enrolment has been virtually achieved since 2008.
The Net enrolment rate in pre-school (the proportion of five and six year-olds who are enrolled in pre-schools) recorded a rising trend since 2004 (24.6 percent), reached 42.4 percent in 2011. However, NER recorded a declining trend of 9 percentage points (from 42.4 percent to 33.4 percent) in the period of MKUKUTA II implementation (see figure 2), implying that 66.6 percent of pre-primary school age children are not attending school. This low rate reduces the possibility of achieving MKUKUTA II operational target of 100 percent by the end of 2015.

It is noted, however, that there is small difference between Net enrolment ratio (NER) and Gross Enrolment ratio (GER) for pre-primary education (33.4 percent and 36.9 percent respectively). This partly implies that those who do not enroll in the pre-school join the primary school directly and at the right age (see the primary school net enrolment in the next section).
Between the year 2009 and 2012, the number of teachers in pre-primary school declined, then began improving after 2012 (see table 3.1). The number of female teachers increased in the period under review (2011-2014). The number of female teachers has nearly doubled, whereas for male teachers, there has been a declining trend since 2011.

Table 3.1: Total Number of Teachers in Pre-primary Schools, 2009-2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>17,338</td>
<td>16,349</td>
<td>10,830</td>
<td>9,352</td>
<td>12,377</td>
<td>13,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>10,554</td>
<td>7,657</td>
<td>5,856</td>
<td>4,410</td>
<td>3,749</td>
<td>4,176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>6,784</td>
<td>8,692</td>
<td>4,974</td>
<td>4,942</td>
<td>8,628</td>
<td>9,424</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: URT, 2015

Despite the progress, no one region has reached the national pupil/teacher ratio (PTR) standards. According to the Government Standards, the pupil/teacher ratio (PTR) at pre-primary school level should be 1:25. In 2014, for a total enrolment of 1,046,369 children in pre-primary schools, there were only 13,600 teachers, giving a PTR of 1:77. Of which, the lowest ratio was in Dar es Salaam (1:27) and the highest was in Simiyu (1:186).

Challenges and recommendations on Pre-primary Education

Pre-primary education is currently facing a serious challenge of declining in total enrolment, Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) and Net Enrolment Ratio (NER), high Pupil Teacher Ratio (PTR) due to lack of qualified teachers, poor social services and teaching facilities. To improve quality and effective access of early children education, public campaign is needed to increase community awareness on the importance of pre-primary education. This is very important especially in the regions with low enrolment rate. Improving teaching facilities and social services in remote areas is crucial. Further, there is a need to speed-up the installation of infrastructure in communities necessary for provision of pre-primary education.

Primary School

During the period under review, the total enrolment in primary school decreased marginally from 8,363,386 pupils in 2011 to 8,202,892 pupils in 2014, equivalent to 2 percent decline. Similarly, the gross enrolment ratio decreased from 102.7 percent to 93.3 percent in the same period. Before the period under review, Tanzania recorded a remarkable success in primary education. In 2009, it achieved the Universal Primary Education (UPE) hence attained awards for meeting MDGs goals.

Regional variations in GER continue to be witnessed. The highest was recorded
in Mara region (117.9 percent) while the lowest found in Kigoma (75 percent). Gender-wise, the GER for female pupils was marginally higher (94.6 percent) compared to that of male pupils (92.0 percent).

**Figure 3.3: Net Primary School Enrolment Rate (percent), 2003-2014**

The net primary school enrolment rate (i.e. the percentage of children aged 7-13 years who are enrolled in standard one to seven) indicated a substantial progress in the last decade from 2003 (88.5 percent) to 2007 (97.3 percent), following the introduction of the Primary Education Development Plan (PEDP) in 2001. However, NER declined afterward (2008-2014) from 97.2 percent to 84.4 percent, indicating that about 15.6 percent of primary school age children are not attending school. MKUKUTA II target is 100 percent NER by 2015.

Tanzania has achieved gender balance at the primary education level. As such, the NER for males was 89.1 percent while for females it stood at 90.3 percent in 2014.

**Challenges and recommendations on enrolment in primary school**

There is a concern with the declining trend in total enrolment, GER and NER at primary education level. An annual increase in Standard one enrolment of nearly 3 percent would be expected given the population growth rate (PHDR, 2011). Instead, over the period from 2011-2014, the total number of children enrolled in standard one decreased by 242,704 pupils (equivalent to almost 2 percent decline annually). Initiatives such as cash incentives upon enrolling pupils, satellite schools for pastoralists and remote areas, providing school meals as well as community sensitization by all education stakeholders should be welcomed as one of the measures to address this challenge (MoVET, 2015).
Completion rate at standard seven has been fluctuating since 2003 (see Figure 3.4), recorded the highest in 2006 (78 percent), and the lowest in 2009 (53 percent). Between 2011 and 2014, the percentage of cohort completing standard seven initially dropped (in 2011-2012), then marginally improved afterward from 2012-2014.

Number of female pupils completing standard seven generally improved compared to male pupils. The percentages of female pupils completing standard seven were 68.8 and 59.4 percent in 2011 and 2014, respectively. The percentages of male pupils were 64.0 and 52.2 percent in 2011 and 2014, respectively. This is an indication that male pupils have a higher chance of dropping-out from school than their female counterparts. If this wedge of difference continues to increase, then this issue could deserve a thorough analysis to establish the underlying factors.

The completion rate is highly depending on dropout trend. The higher the dropout rate the lower is the rate of completion. Primary dropout rate between 2011 and 2014 declined from 3.4 percent in 2011 to 0.82 percent in 2014. This shows remarkable achievements in primary school education. Contrary, in Secondary education, the dropout rate increased from 2.6 percent in 2011 to 4.7 percent in 2014.

Regarding reasons for drop out from school, truancy constitutes the biggest proportional, in both primary and secondary education. Specifically, the figures are 75.7 percent (in primary) and 76.1 percent in secondary education. Poverty is another important factor influencing school dropouts (5.8 percent in primary and 12.8 in secondary school). Other factors include are pregnancy, death and illness.
### Table 3.2: Student Dropout by Reason Percentage Distribution, 2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Primary</th>
<th>percent</th>
<th>Secondary</th>
<th>percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Truancy</td>
<td>41,870</td>
<td>75.7</td>
<td>72,307</td>
<td>76.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnancy</td>
<td>2,433</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4,718</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death</td>
<td>1,443</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>1,059</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illness</td>
<td>1,110</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1,132</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>3,222</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>12,195</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>5,224</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>3,575</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>55,302</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>94,986</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: BEST, 2013

**Percentage of Students Passing the Primary School Leaving Examinations (PSLE)**

Figure 5 shows that PSLE raised from 40.1 percent in 2003, reached the peak (70.5 percent) in 2006, and then started to fluctuate around 50 percent since 2007. There was another sharp drop of 30.7 percent in 2012 from 58.3 percent (2011). It then started improving in the subsequent years. The sharp drop in 2007 was due to syllabus changes and tighter invigilation (PHDR, 2009).

Gender-wise, in 2014 percentage of male pupils passed PSLE was 60.9 percent, higher compared to female pupils who had 53.6 percent pass rate. Spatial disparities in primary school passing rate are observed as well, for example in 2014 the pass rate for Dar es Salaam was 77.9 percent, while that of Mara was 41.5 percent.

However, the top level scorer (Grade A and B) were much fewer than those scoring at the bottom (Grade C and D). For example, for the national average recorded of 57 percent in 2014, only 13.8 percent scored grade A and B while 43.2 percent scored grade C. Similarly, of the 50.6 national average pass reported in 2013, only 10.8 percent scored grade A and B, and 39.8 percent scored grade C.
Challenges and recommendations on PSLE
Passing rate at all levels of education is highly affected by teaching and learning environment. Education sector face the challenge of having few and low quality teaching and learning facilities such as pupils’ desks, teachers’ chairs and tables, classrooms, laboratories and latrines especially in government schools and those located in remote areas. Allocating a reasonable budget share to teaching and learning facilities is likely to improve the overall working environment in education sector, increase teachers’ retention and eventually raise the passing rate.

Percentage of Teachers with Relevant Qualifications
The percentage of teachers with relevant qualification continues to improve since the last decade. The years under review show similar trend as well, approaching to 100 percent, improving from 96.6 percent in 2011 to 98.7 percent in 2014. This has been attributed by government efforts to invest on teacher’s training. Apparently, the MKUKUTA II target of having at least 90 percent of qualified teachers has been achieved.
Figure 3.6: Percentage of Teachers with Relevant Qualifications

Source: MoEVT, 2015

**Pupil Teacher Ratio (PTR) and Pupil/Text book Ratio (PBR)**

Pupil teacher ratio in primary education has been improving since the past decade, from 1:58 in 2004 to 1:51 in 2010 and to 1:43 in 2014. This is close to the government standard of 1:40 (for primary education).

Regional wise, PTR in 2014 varied as well, recorded the highest in Tabora (1:56), and the lowest in Kilimanjaro (1:29). Other regions which recorded lower ratio than the norm include Arusha and Dar es Salaam (1:33), Njombe (1:36), Iringa (1:37) and Manyara (1:38) The high PTR in regions such as Tabora (1:56), Mara (1:54) and Geita (1:52) is partly a reflection of poor social services and teaching facilities in these regions.

According to recent data, the primary pupil textbook ratio improved from 5 pupils to 3 pupils per textbook between 2011 and 2014. However, the national level data presented by BEST is likely to be based on estimations and projections. The Education Sector Performance Report (ESPR) 2009/2010 narrates the findings from a monitoring exercise carried out in 15 regions of Mainland Tanzania. The assessment found that the average pupil text book ratio varied widely from school to school, from subject to subject, and from one LGA to another. The range across subjects was between 5:1 and 67:1.

**Challenge and recommendations on PTR and PBR**

Progress measured using these indicators point to critical challenges in terms of poor working environment especially in rural areas that pose difficult to teachers’ retention, teachers quitting the professional and the complex and lack of oversight in the allocation, distribution and utilization of funds in the financing of education sector. Deliberate efforts are needed to ensure proper allocation of funds for improving social services and schools working environment in rural areas.
areas. In the meantime, in-service and recruitment programs in remote areas are needed to address the issue of regional disparities and teachers’ retention challenges.

Figure 3.7: Pupil Teacher Ratio in Primary Education, 2004-2014

![Graph showing Pupil Teacher Ratio in Primary Education, 2004-2014]

Source: BEST 2013, MoEVT, 2015

Secondary Education

Transition Rate from Standard Seven to Form One

This indicator is measured as the percentage of children who sat the PSLE that were selected for enrolment in Government secondary schools. The data on transition rate portray that the transition rate from standard seven to form one has been fluctuating since 2004. It rose from 36.1 percent and reached to the highest level of 67.5 percent in 2006, then started declining to the lowest (43.9 percent) in 2010. In the period under review, the transition rate improved from 52.2 percent in 2011 to 55.5 percent in 2014. It implies that out of 100 children who sat for the PSLE in 2014, 55.5 percent children were selected to join in Government secondary schools.

Tanzania has also achieved gender balance in transition to secondary education. In 2012/13, transition rate from standard seven to form one for males and females were fairly the same, recorded as 257,465 students and female 257,127 students.
Figure 3.8: Transition Rate from Standard Seven to Form One 2004-2014

Source: BEST, 2013; MoEVT, 2015; URT, 2015

**Net Enrolment Ratio in Lower Secondary Schools (Form One-Four)**

This indicator is measured as the proportion of children between the ages of 14 and 17 years who are enrolled in lower secondary school (form one to four). As presented in figure 9, the NER for lower secondary has steadily increased from 6.3 percent in 2003 up to 36.6 percent in 2012. It then started declining afterward, down to 32.0 percent in 2014. The rising trend from 2003-2012 was due to introduction of the Secondary Education Development Program (SEDP) in 2001 with a view of enabling all primary school leavers who pass the primary school leaving examination (PSLE) attend secondary education. The SEDP has led to expansion in access to secondary education, especially among children from poor families.

Despite the significant progress made, secondary enrolment reported a declining trend in the past two years (2012-2014) that led further shortfall to the MKUKUTA target of 50 percent. The introduction of stricter requirements to progress beyond form two and other adjustments may have contributed to the decline observed in secondary education enrolment. Nonetheless, it has led to high overall and division specific Form four examination results (MoEVT, 2015).

The percentage of females enrolled in form one shows great improvement. It increased from 47.24 percent in 2011 to 49.33 percent in 2014, which close to the MKUKUTA II target of 50 percent. The number of secondary schools increased as well, from 4,367 to 4,753 schools in the same period. The NER and GER for secondary education is not presented regionally as many schools especially boarding ones, take students across the nation, thus regional grouping becomes less informative.
Challenges and recommendations on enrolment in lower secondary

There is substantial proportion of dropout in O-level, especially in form two mostly due to truancy and lack of basic needs. Introduction of universal education up to secondary level my reduce dropout cases. This will also create a large pool for upper secondary education, as well as Folk and Vocational training.

Percentage of Students Passing the Form 4 Examination

A student needs to pass at division one to three to be selected for higher education. Figure 10 presents a generally declining trend the percentage of students passing form four for the past 10 years with some bouncy back in recent years.
The number of form four leavers taking examination (CSEE) increased fast from 63,487 candidates in 2004 to 352,614 candidates in 2013 (equivalent to 455.4 percent). This brought a challenge especially on their pass rates. For example, the pass rates between 2004 and 2013 have fluctuated year to year but with a downward trend from 91.5 percent in 2004 to 57.1 percent in 2013. The lower performance in recent years could be due to rapid expansion of enrolment unmatched with adequate supply of essential teaching and learning materials (BEST, 2013).

**Challenges and recommendations**

The major challenge facing lower secondary education is lower performance in form four examinations and the increase in dropout rate. The rapid expansion of enrolment should be matched with sufficient supply of essential teaching and learning materials.

**Higher Secondary School (Form Five and Six)**

The students have to do two further years of secondary education to be eligible for admission to universities and institutions of higher learning. Access to higher secondary school depends on a student's performance in the CSEE. A student has to achieve at least a Division 3 pass to be selected to join form 5.

**Net Enrolment in Higher Secondary and Pass Rates**

There is a recorded quite improvement in net enrolment rate in higher secondary since 2009 as Figure 11 portrays. In 2009 enrolment for male and female students were almost the same (1.4 and 1.5 respectively), however the gap widened since then, male enrolment being higher than female enrolment.

Pass rate for form six was recorded higher in all years compared with that of form 4, with more or less stable trend from 96.9 percent in 2005 to 98.3 in 2014. However, like form 4 results, few candidates scored division I and II. In 2014, only 38.0 percent of candidates scored division I and II, whereas for form four only 13.6 candidates managed to score division I and II.
Percentage of Qualified Teachers in Secondary Schools
There has been substantial increase in qualified teachers in secondary schools, from 33,954 teachers in 2009 to 80,529 teachers in 2014. This is equivalent to 137 percent increase (figure 3.12). The standard norm of pupil teacher ratio of 1:40 in secondary education has been achieved. This is due to the fact that, proportionally, secondary teachers have increased faster compared to the pupils enrolled in secondary schools. Graduate teachers in secondary schools comprise 55.4 percent, the highest compared to other education levels.

Challenges and recommendations
Despite the increase in number of qualified teachers in secondary education, the subsector is facing shortage of qualified teachers in science subjects (biology, physics, chemistry and mathematics). This call for more efforts directed towards training science teachers and provides additional working incentives to attract students and eventually teachers to take such subjects and retain them in teaching profession.

---

3  About 28.2 percent of all teachers in Tanzania are in secondary education, less than the proportion of primary school teachers (67 percent) which is the largest sub-sector, and more than the proportion of teachers in pre-primary education (4.8 percent).
Figure 3.12: Number of qualified teachers and Pupil Teacher Ratio in Secondary Schools, 2009-2014

Source: BEST, 2013; MoEVT, 2015

**Literacy rate**

The level of literacy among the adult population is one of the indicators of national development, particularly on the knowledge dimension. It is a pre-requisite for socio-economic and political development in any society and it is an important capability for human development. The Household Budget Survey 2011/2012 reports a literacy rate of 77.2 percent compared to 72.5 percent in 2007. Data by region shows that in Dar es Salaam, literacy rate has improved from 91 percent in 2007 to 95.1 percent in 2011/12. Urban areas recorded higher literacy rate (89 percent) than rural areas (70.4 percent).

On the gender discrepancies, there were notable differences in literacy between men and women in all areas, with man literacy being higher than women. Overall literacy rate for men was 83.5 while it was 71.4 for women in 2012. This shows some improvement compared to that reported by HBS 2007 where literacy rate for male and female were 79.5 and 66.1 percent, respectively. In urban areas, the literacy rate was 93 percent for men and 85 percent for women, whilst 78 percent for men and 63 percent for women in rural areas (HBS, 2012).

**Challenges and recommendations on Literacy**

Overall, there is an improvement on the literacy of Tanzania’s population. Nonetheless, both the government and other non-government stakeholders need to put more efforts to ensure that literacy in the country continues to increase. Adult education campaigns enabling the country transformed to a social, economic and political developed society is needed. Also, there is a need to promote literacy beyond simple numeric and reading abilities.
Percentage of schools having adequate classroom and sanitation facilities as per policy

The shortage of classrooms and pit latrines is still high in primary schools. The pupil classroom ratio is still far below the target of 40 pupils per classroom (1:40). In 2014, it was 1:75, recorded a declining trend from 1:66 in 2011. The pupils’ latrine ratio was 1:58 in 2014. Likewise, the situation worsened compared to that of 2011 (53 pupils per latrine). This is far below the MKUKUTA II target and the standard norm of 22.5 pupils per a latrine. Further, male pupils’ latrine ratio was 1:58 in 2014 below that of 1:54 in 2011, while female pit latrine ratio was 1:57 in 2014 as compared to 1:51 in 2011. The standard norms for male and female are 1:25 and 1:20, respectively (MoEVT, 2015).

The pupil classroom ratio and pupil latrine ratio for secondary education were 1:39 and 1:29, respectively. The condition in secondary school is satisfactory especially in the case of classrooms.

Only 20.4 percent of all primary schools and 62.6 percent of secondary schools have access to electricity. The main source of power for these schools is National Grid (63.6 percent-- for primary and 47.7 percent-- for secondary schools) (MoEVT, 2013).

Goal 1 Summary of Challenges and Way Forward

Challenges

i. Declining in total enrolment, GER and NER for pre-primary, primary and secondary education

ii. The higher PTR in pre-primary and primary education due to lack of qualified teachers

iii. Tendency of some newly recruited teachers to take up teaching and retaining in remote areas of the country due to poor social services and teaching facilities in rural areas.

iv. Increase in secondary school dropout rate due to poor teaching and learning environment.

v. The shortage of pupils’ desks, teachers’ chairs and tables, classrooms, laboratories and pit latrines especially in primary school education level.

vi. Shortage of qualified teachers in Science subjects (Biology, Chemistry, Physics and Mathematics).

vii. Low quality education provided in pre-primary, primary and secondary education
**Way Forward**

i. Public campaign is needed to increase community awareness on the importance of education, especially pre-primary, primary and secondary education.

ii. Improve quality and access of early children education in Tanzania by providing Cash incentives upon enrolling pupils, satellite schools for pastoralists and remote areas, providing school meals as well as community sensitization by all education. To initiate this, stakeholders should be welcomed to increase the quality and enrolment rate.

iii. Deliberate efforts have to be done by the government in allocating more fund for improving social services and schools working environment particularly in rural areas so as to address the issue of teachers’ retention, pupils dropouts and passing rate.

iv. Efforts to be directed on training secondary school science teachers to sharpen their teaching and training skills. Moreover, provide additional working incentives to attract students and eventually teachers to take such subjects and retaining them in teaching professional.

v. The policy of introducing compulsory basic education now (Pre-primary to lower secondary for 11 years) is very important so as to create a large pool for upper secondary education, as well as Folk and Vocational training.

### Vocational, Technical, Polytechnics, and Higher Education

**Goal 2: Ensuring expansion of vocational, technical, polytechnics, and higher education, and improving non-formal and continuing education**

Vocational, technical and polytechnic institutions are responsible for providing skills directly needed in the production process. It is through this channel where specialized skills, below and at graduate level, are developed. The main indicator we track in this goal is annual enrolment in Vocational Education Centers, Technical, Training Institutions, and Universities, and Adult, Non-formal and continuing education programs.

**Performance under goal two**

**Technical and Vocational Education**

Technical education is an important sub-sector of education, which provides mid-level manpower, technicians and craftsmen for various industries, institutions and organizations. Technical schools admit students who completed Form four and Form six for certificate-level, diploma or degree-level courses.
**Vocational Education Enrolment**

Vocational education enrolment shows improvement since 2009, the situation is the same in the years under review. Between 2011 and 2014, the number of students enrolled increased from 104,840 to 164,077 (see figure 13), equivalent to 56.5 percent increase, and only about 1.2 percent below the national target. This shows a substantial achievement and a good sign for attaining MKUKUTA II target of 166,132 students by the end of 2015. However, percentage of female students enrolled in vocational training recorded a declining trend since 2011. In 2014, the percentage was 38.5, which is below MKUKUTA II target of 50 percent. It indicates that the increased enrolment in vocational education is mainly contributed by the increase males' enrolment.

**Technical Education**

Same to Vocational education, technical education shows remarkable achievements in the number of students’ enrolment. Generally, the number of students enrolled in technical education increased by 136 percent from 49,185 students in 2009 to 116,160 students in 2014. In fact, the number has achieved and surpassed MKUKUTA II targeted level of 113,393 students enrolled in technical education. Percentage enrolment of female students has been ranging between 45 to 47 percent in the years under review, below the targeted level of 50 percent. Again, the improvement in the number of students enrolled in technical education is highly contributed by male students’ enrolment.
Challenges and recommendations on Vocational and Technical Education

One of the challenges in both vocation and technical education is a small number of female students enrolled, presenting a gender disparity in this category of education. This is due to the notion of majority that, training provided by vocational and technical education is exclusively for male students. Much effort is needed, particularly campaigns on encouraging female students’ enrolment in Vocational education. Further, there is a need to closely review the syllabus to ensure that it is demand-driven and produce skills that are needed given the changing national focus towards industrialization.

Higher Education

Tanzania recorded a significant increase in the number of public and private universities. There are 26 universities in Tanzania, (of which, 10 public and 16 private) and 15 university colleges (4 public and 11 private universities). This facilitates the access of university education especially for female and children from poor families being easier than before. It generally increases the number of students enrolled in higher education.

Figure 15 portrays a steady increase in the number of students enrolled in higher education institutions between 2002/2003 and 2013/14. Where, female students enrolment slightly improved from 35.8 percent in 2011 to 36.1 percent in 2014, this is still below the target of having at least 40 percent female students in higher education. The number of higher education students provided with loan increased as well, from 92,791 students in 2011 to 96,325 students in 2014. 

Increasing in the number of universities and government sponsorship through Higher Education Students Loans Board (HESLB), also the implementation of Science and Technology Higher Education Project (STHEP), facilitated ongoing achievements in higher education.
Challenges and recommendations on higher education
Matching quality of graduates in higher education with the labor market needs is one of the challenges facing higher education. Another is the limited sponsorship fund and small number of female compared to male students. The government should continue encouraging female students’ enrolment, increase sponsorship and research on labor market needs to cope with the degree courses provided by higher learning institutions.

Financing for Education
Education sector budget has been increasing year to year, as Figure 16 indicates. The budget rose from Tshs. 669 billion in 2005/06 to Tshs. 3,465 billion in 2014/15 financial year. Additionally, the sector has been receiving 16-20 percent of the total national budget allocations. In the financial years 2010/2011 to 2014/2015 the sector, on average, received cut-of between 17 to 19 percent of the total national budget. The sector budget as percentage of GDP has slightly increased from about 4 percent in 2005/06 to about 6 percent in 2014/2015.
Primary education sub-sector has been receiving the biggest share of education sector budget (over 50 percent). However, between 2010/11 and 2014/15 the budget allocated to primary education sub-sector dropped from 62.2 percent to 54.3 percent, and, this portion directed to secondary, technical and higher educational budget which indicates the increase, whereas, teachers education remain stagnant around 1.8 percent. The teachers’ education has been receiving the smallest share over the review period. The reallocation of resources from primary education benefited the most secondary, technical and higher education and less on teachers’ education.
Challenges and recommendation on education sector budget

Limited budget allocated to education sector. Given the highly needs of teachers especially in pre-primary and primary education, the share teachers education needs to be increased.

Goal 2 Summary of Challenges and Way Forward

Challenges: The increase in the number of students enrolled in technical education reached and surpassed MKUKUTA II targeted level. Increasing in the number of universities and government sponsorship through Higher Education Students Loans Board (HESLB), also the implementation of Science and Technology Higher Education Project (STHEP), facilitated ongoing achievements in higher education.

However the following challenges are noted:

i. Small number of female students’ enrolled in Vocational, Technical and Higher education.

ii. Limited budget allocated to teachers and higher learning education

iii. Matching quality of graduates in higher education with the labor market needs.

Way forward

i. More effort has to be done to encourage female students’ enrolment in Vocational education.

ii. Given the highly needs of teachers particularly in pre-primary and primary education, the sector budget need to be restructured by allocating a greater portion of the sector budget to teachers education.

iii. Research on current labor market requirements in terms of profession and quality, these to be accommodated in designing, offering and delivering higher education courses so as to reduce the mismatch between the labor market needs and graduates quality and profession.

iv. Need to reduce donor dependency on financing education sector.
3.3. Improving Survival, Health, Nutrition and Well Being

**Goal 3: Improving Survival, Health, Nutrition and Well Being, especially for Children, Women and Vulnerable Groups**

The government through MKUKUTA II, aimed at improving people’s health by building stronger capacities to prevent and cure diseases through increase the population’s access to health care and scale up efforts to reduce child and maternal mortality and eliminate malnutrition. Following the adoption of the new Health Policy in 2007 and the design of a Health Sector Strategic Plan III (HSSP-III) (2009–2015), access to health services has increased, new health facilities (dispensaries, health centers, and hospitals) have been constructed, and availability of equipment and medicines has improved. 

Progress of these gains during MKUKUTA II implementation was monitored under the framework of 9 indicators as stipulated in MKUKUTA Monitoring Master Plan II. These are:-

i. Proportion of births taking place at health facility
ii. Total Fertility Rate
iii. Infant Mortality Rate
iv. Under Five Mortality Rate
v. DPTHb3 coverage
vi. Proportional of under-five moderately or severely stunted (height for age)
vii. Maternal Mortality Rate
viii. Percentage of persons with advanced HIV infection receiving ARV combination therapy
ix. TB treatment completion rate

**Performance under goal Three**

The performance assessment of this goal is based on these 9 monitoring indicators.

**Proportion of births taking place at health facility**

The set target for proportion of births taking place at health facility by 2015 was 80 percent. The TDHS shows that in 2004/05 only 47 percent of all births occurred at health facilities increasing to 58 percent and 62 percent, in 2010/11 and 2011/12 before decreasing to 60 percent in 2012/13. In the financial year 2013/14 proportion slightly rose to 61 percent which is far from the target. Therefore, the proportions are off track to achieving the HSSP III target of 80 percent by 2015.
Figure 3.18: Proportion of births taking place at health facility

Proportion of births taking place at health facility


Challenges and recommendations on Proportion of births taking place at health facility

Pregnant women do not deliver in a health facility due to lack of money for transport and payment of services, distance from home to health facility, poor quality of care provided at health facilities due to the lack of an enabling environment (drugs, equipment, and supplies), and due to poor skills of providers or hostile attitudes of providers. The Sharpened One Plan developed proposes innovative ways to address these challenges.

Total Fertility Rate (TFR)

This is the number of children a woman can give birth during her lifetime. Fertility rate is related to increases in population. Large households are associated with poverty. This indicator informs how population increases in years. According to the Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey 2010 (TDHS), Total Fertility Rate (TFR), was 5.4 in 2010; a slight decline from 5.7 during 2004/05. The current decline is entirely on rural women, and there was no progress among urban women (where fertility is much lower). There are however still large gaps within mainland Tanzania between urban and rural women, between the poorest and better-off households, and between regions/zones.

TDHS 2004/5 results were almost similar to the rates established in the 1996 TDHS (5.8 births) and in the 1999 Tanzania Reproductive and Child Health Survey (TRCHS) (5.6 births). At the current level, evidence suggests that fertility in Tanzania have started to decline. MKUKUTA target is to slow down total fertility rate from 5.4 (2010) to 5 by 2015 and reduce population growth rate from 2.9 percent in 2010 to 2.7 percent by 2015.
Fertility varied by residence and by zone. Women in urban areas had 3.7 children on average, compared to 6.1 children per woman in rural areas. Fertility was highest in Western Zone, where women had an average of 7.1 children, and lowest in Eastern Zone where women had an average of 3.9 children. Fertility also varied with mother’s education and economic status. Women who had no education had more than twice as many children as those with secondary or higher education (7.0 versus 3.0). Fertility increased as the wealth of the respondent’s household decreases. The poorest women, in general, had more than twice as many children as women who lived in the wealthiest households (7.0 versus 3.2 children per woman). According to the 2010 TDHS, teenage fertility indicated that 23 percent of young women age 15–19 had already begun childbearing; 17 percent were mothers, and an additional 6 percent were pregnant with their first child. Young motherhood was much more common in rural areas than in urban areas. Young women with no education were more than eight times as likely to have started childbearing by age 19 than those who have secondary and higher education (52 percent versus 6 percent).

As stated from above, fertility is one of the most important components of population growth and change. Comparing with developed countries, TFR and population growth rate in Tanzania are still high. Family planning programs, mass education such as promoting adequate child spacing by enhancing access to modern contraceptive use for all sexually active persons, particularly targeting women and their spouses, adolescent girls and boys; and ensuring access to primary and secondary education to reduce early pregnancy and promote child spacing are necessary interventions to control population growth.

**Figure 3.19: TFR Performance trend, 1996-2015**

![TFR Performance trend, 1996-2015](image)

Sources of data: TRCHS 1996, TDHS 1996, TDHS 2005, TDHS 2010
Currently, the 2015 Tanzania Demographic and Health Survey & Malaria Indicator Survey (2015 TDHS/MIS) is underway. The 2015 TDHS/MIS will provide the current status of TFR with reference to MKUKUTA II target if it has been achieved or not.

**Challenges and recommendations on TFR**

Fertility rate is still high; the slow uptakes of contraception among lower socioeconomic strata; and persistent high fertility in the western parts of the country, coupled with the desire for large families in the same regions and unchanging unmet need for contraception. The continued high fertility rate is a key source to population growth, and past and current high population growth rates among others have resulted in a youth bulge.

Right mix of policies must be in place to fully and positively exploit the demographic window of opportunity (as experienced in East Asia). Thus, adequate investments in education and health (maternal and child health, family planning) as well as an expansion of the modern employment sector can/will position Tanzania to reap huge dividends from changing demographic configurations. The changing demographic dynamics would require a change in the structure of the economy such that productivity increases create employment opportunities for the growing labor force.

**Infant and Under Five Mortality Rates (IMR & U5MR)**

The Government continued to implement the “Strategic Plan for Accelerating the Reduction of Maternal and Childhood Deaths” (2008-2015) in order to improve maternal and child health. The sources of data for measuring IMR & U5MR are usually from surveys and surveillance which are conducted periodically. Therefore, indicators cannot be updated on an annual basis. Data from TDHS 2010 indicates that a considerable progress is made in reducing infant and under five mortality rates. The deaths of infants (under one year) decreased from 68 in 2005 to 51 in 2010 per 1,000 live births. Under-Five Mortality Rates continued to drop from 112 deaths per 1,000 live births in 2005 to 81 in 2010 and to 54 in 2013. MKUKUTA targets for IMR was 38 deaths per 1000 live births and U5MR of 54 deaths per 1000 live births by 2015. In this regard, MKUKUTA II target for U5MR has been achieved as well as the MDG target.

The continuing decline can be attributed to Government commitments to increase use of key health interventions, such as sustained high coverage of routine under-five immunization, Vitamin A supplementation, the use of insecticide treated bed nets and better drugs to treat malaria. Current efforts need to be sustained and scaled up in some areas in order to maintain and build on the achievements. High population growth places additional strain on service provision at all levels. Pockets of low performance for key interventions also have an impact. For example, fluctuations in routine measles immunization of children under-five
years has led to outbreaks and necessitated emergency measles campaigns. Neonatal conditions like birth asphyxia and infections are the major causes of death in young children, followed by pneumonia, diarrhea and malaria. AIDS is also a major killer, responsible for about 9 per cent of under-five deaths. Poor nutrition is a significant compounding factor in child mortality.

Figure 3.20: IMR Trend Based On TDHS Data, 2005-2015

**IMR**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>IMR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year 2005</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 2010</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 2015 (Target)</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sources of data:** TDHS 2005, TDHS 2010

Figure 3.21: U5MR trend based on TDHS data, 2005-2015

**U5MR**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>U5MR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year 2005</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 2010</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 2015 (Target)</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sources of data:** TDHS 2005, TDHS 2010

*Challenges and recommendations on IMR and U5MR*

IMR and U5MR are decreasing to an extent that U5MR has reached the target. However, according to HMIS (2011-2013), the five leading causes of admission to hospital among under-fives were malaria, diarrhoea, respiratory infections, anaemia and pneumonia, which collectively accounted for more than two-thirds
of all causes of admission in the period between 2011 and 2013. Malaria was consistently the leading cause of admissions for children aged less than five years, accounting for 41.2 percent, 41.0 percent and 31.7 percent of all admissions in 2011, 2012 and 2013, respectively. Therefore, more efforts to curb these diseases will significantly continue to reduce IMR and U5MR.

**DPTHb3 coverage**

This is the proportion of children who have received three doses of vaccine against diphtheria, pertussis (whooping cough), tetanus and Hepatitis B by their first birthday. DPTHb3 coverage is within health service indicators under vaccination coverage in the HSSP III. Immunization is an essential component for reduction of under-five deaths. The Expanded Programme on Immunization (EPI) which currently is known as Immunization and Vaccines Development is delivering its service under the two HSSP III strategic objectives of: i) increase access to Maternal, Newborn and Child Health (MNCH) services; and ii) strengthening the health systems to provide quality MNCH and nutrition services. The primary objective for EPI is to contribute to the reduction of infant and under-fives morbidity and mortality due to vaccines preventable diseases towards achieving MDG 4 and 5.

The key performance indicators for the national immunization programme are the following: (i) Proportion of children under one year vaccinated three times against DTP-HepB-Hib vaccine (DTP-HepB-Hib 3); (ii) Proportion of children under one year vaccinated against measles; (iii) Proportion of women receiving at least 2 doses of TT vaccination (TT2+); and Proportion of districts with DTP-HepB-Hib 3 coverage =>80 percent; in which the numerator is the number of councils who has routine vaccination coverage of 80 percent and above and the denominator being the total number of councils.

The baseline and set target for the three vaccination key indicators in 2008 and 2015 respectively are indicated below as follows: (i) the baseline (2008) for proportion of children under one year vaccinated against measles is 88 percent and the target for 2015 is 85 percent; (ii) Proportion of children under one year vaccinated three times against DTP –HepB-Hib vaccine; 91 percent for the baseline year (2008) and 85 percent is target for 2015; (iii) Proportion of women receiving at least 2nd doses of TT vaccination (TT2+); 85 percent for the baseline year (2008) and 85 percent is target for 2015; and (iv) Proportion of districts with DTP3 coverage >80 percent and target is 80 percent of all districts. Figures below show the overall progress in vaccination-related indicators over the reporting period.
Figure 3.22 Progress in key vaccination indicators, 2009-13

The coverage data show the following key features: (i) DTP-HepB-Hib and measles 2013 coverage is substantially higher than the HSSP III target for the last four years in a row; (ii) Rotavirus and PCV13 vaccines was introduced in 2013, Rota-2 is within the HSSP III target while PCV-13 is below the target. However the coverage data of these newly introduced vaccines was highly affected by unavailability of data collection tools which resulted into loss of data; and (iii) TT2 coverage remains significantly below target. The following graphs of the regional performance are based on HMIS data and population estimates based on the 2012 Census. They show much higher rates of coverage, and further discussion is required.

Figure 3.23: Regional DTP3 immunization coverage, 2013

Source: WHO-UNICEF, JRF 2009 - 2013
Source: HMIS, 2013

Figure 3.24: Regional measles immunization coverage, 2013

Source: HMIS, 2013

Figure 3.25: Regional TT2 coverage, 2013

Source: HMIS 2013; Population denominator estimated from Census 2012
Note: Katavi excluded due to extreme outlier (533percent) – to be checked
The Key observations in districts is that the proportion of Districts with DTP-HepB-Hib 3 coverage above 80 percent increased from 54 percent in 2009 to 79 percent in 2013, though this represents a fall over the three year period under review in the Performance Profile Report. The recent increase in the number of districts is likely to have an effect on performance as the newly formed districts require time to have their management teams fully functional. With regard to new vaccines, in January 2013, the MOHSW introduced Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine (PCV 13) and Rotavirus vaccine (Rotarix) into routine infant vaccination programme. These two vaccines are given in the same schedule as traditional vaccines. The coverage report for these interventions was highly affected in 2013 due to the fact that HMIS data collection tools were not available at their time of introduction. This led into improvising of these tools hence loss of considerable data in some areas. Currently, these tools have already been distributed to all Health facilities in the country.

Challenges and recommendations on Immunization coverage

Some regions present coverage over 100 percent, suggesting that the denominator may be underestimated and therefore unreliable. The coverage of TT2+ for pregnant women remains under 80 percent for the period, ranging from 74 percent to 78 percent; this is quite different from studies where pregnant women are reported to be over vaccinated. Even though there are overall performance achievements, yet there are still disparities especially at council level. The performance indicators used in HSSP III are not sufficient to display some health/immunization system weakness and challenges. Also, denominators remained the challenge especially at lower levels of service delivery.
The census results conducted by the National Bureau of Statistics in August 2012 show a drop in target population which is not in line with children vaccinated. This will result in under-estimation of requirements and above 100 percent coverage in most councils. Therefore, NBS will provide clear target with projections. Furthermore, the implementation of Reach Every District/Every Child Strategy in every council is the best option of increasing and sustaining high immunization coverage; this will increase coverage in low performing councils, sustain the higher achieved gains and decrease disparities in immunization performance among councils. The Immunization Data Quality Self-assessment will be used to improve the quality of immunization data in all councils.

**Proportion of under-five moderately or severely stunted (height for age)**

In the country, nutrition issues are guided by the Tanzania National Nutrition Strategy which was developed in order to consolidate stakeholders’ efforts which aim at reducing all forms of malnutrition. Four major priority nutrition disorders are; protein energy malnutrition (PEM), nutritional anaemia (NA), iodine deficiency disorders (IDD) and vitamin A deficiency (VAD). Other priority areas, stipulated in the strategy, include infant and young nutrition, food and nutrition security, prevention and management of acute malnutrition.

The key performance indicators in nutrition are; Proportion of under-fives severely underweight (weight for age); Proportion of under-fives severely stunted (height for age); Proportion of children under 5 receiving vitamin A twice per year; Proportion of under-five children with anaemia; Proportion of infants exclusively Breastfed; Proportion of children under-five with vitamin A deficiency; and Proportion of line ministries, regions and councils with Nutrition Focal Persons/Officers. Most of nutritional data are collected periodically by the TDHS and other specific surveys. According to the TDHS 2010, 42 percent of children under the age of 5 years were stunted (low height for age), a figure which is significantly higher than the government target of 27 percent by the year 2015.
Table 3.3: Below shows baseline and targets for other indicators.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Target by 2015</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Proportion of all under-five children with anaemia</td>
<td>59 percent</td>
<td>55 percent</td>
<td>More efforts needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(TDHS 2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Proportion of infants &lt;6 months exclusively Breastfed</td>
<td>50 percent</td>
<td>60 percent</td>
<td>More efforts needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(TDHS 2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Proportion of all children under-five with vitamin A deficiency</td>
<td>33 percent</td>
<td>&lt;15 percent</td>
<td>More efforts needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(TDHS 2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Proportion of line ministries, Regions and Councils with Nutrition Focal Persons/Officers</td>
<td>0 percent</td>
<td>100 percent</td>
<td>The pace is good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(NNS, 2011)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Proportion of all children under-five wasted</td>
<td>5 percent</td>
<td>&lt;5 percent all times</td>
<td>Good pace, need to sustain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(TDHS 2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Proportion of thin women of reproductive age (BMI&lt;18.5 kg/m2)</td>
<td>11 percent</td>
<td>&lt;10 percent all times</td>
<td>Good pace, need to sustain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(TDHS 2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Proportion of under-fives severely stunted (height for age)</td>
<td>42 percent</td>
<td>27 percent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(TDHS 2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**Challenges and recommendations on Nutrition**

Challenges with regard to nutrition issues include; (i) nutritional data in all programs are not regularly collected due to poor surveillance system and inadequate integration of nutrition data into existing routine data collection systems; (ii) inadequate progress in reducing levels of malnutrition due to limited participation of other stakeholders; (iii) inadequate financial resources to implement nutrition interventions to the community level; (iv) inadequate understanding of the importance of good nutrition to national development; (v) inadequate reliability of data sources at all levels; and (iv) inadequate use of nutritional data in planning at community, council and national levels.

As a way forward, efforts are underway to establish sustainable nutrition surveillance system. Furthermore, decentralization of nutritional services from the Tanzania Food and Nutrition Centre to local councils countrywide is another initiative. Government ministries, institutions, development partners, private sector, public private partnership have been given roles and responsibilities to
implement either nutrition specific or sensitive interventions (Interventions that address the underlying determinants of women, infants and young child nutrition and development—food security; adequate care giving resources at the maternal, household and community levels; and access to health services and a safe and hygienic environment). Efforts are also geared to (i) increasing financial resource mobilization at all levels including Ministries; Regional Secretariats and councils to incorporate nutrition into their annual plans and budgets; (ii) providing guidelines for Ministries, Regional Secretariats, institutions and councils to incorporate nutrition in their plans and budgets; and (iii) improving nutrition education and training at all levels. Conclusively, stunting levels is still very high. Additional efforts and strategies, through multi-sectoral approach with the global Scaling up of Nutrition initiative, are required to give extra impetus in efforts to combat malnutrition.

**Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR)**

Reducing maternal mortality rate is achieved through implementation of Reproductive and Child Health interventions guided by a number of government documents that include the National Road Map Strategic Plan to Accelerate Reduction of Maternal, Newborn and Child Deaths in Tanzania 2008-2015 (One Plan), the newly developed Sharpened One Plan 2014 – 2015 and a number of intervention specific strategic plans. These interventions also accelerate the reduction of newborn and childhood morbidity and mortality. The TDHS 2010 survey estimated MMR at 454 per 100,000 live births as compared to 578 per 100,000 live births in 2005. There is an apparent decline in MMR from the previous estimate, although MMR is still unacceptably high. Maternal deaths represent 17 percent of all deaths to women aged 15 – 49. The population and housing census indicates that MMR has dropped to 432 deaths per 100,000 live births.

**Figure 3.27: Maternal Mortality Rate Mainland Tanzania 1999-2010**

![Bar Chart: Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) per 100,000 Live Births]

Challenges and recommendations on MMR

Poor quality of care due to an insufficient number of skilled health workers and lack of basic equipment, as well as long distances from home to health care facilities are major deterrents to facility delivery. Women living in rural areas, those who come from the poor families and those who are less educated, have the least access to skilled attendance at delivery. Thus, maternal death rates are closely linked with the high fertility rates and low socio-economic status of women. Women who start having children in adolescence tend to have more children and shorter spacing between pregnancies – all of which are risk factors for maternal and neonatal mortality.

The recommendation is based on focusing on One Plan. Thus the Sharpened One Plan proposes innovative ways to address the challenges stipulated above. The plan places a strong emphasis on strengthening accountability and monitoring mechanisms. Furthermore, the plan calls for implementation of the maternal and perinatal death surveillance and response (MPDSR) at all levels; and looks forward to work with Councils, TAMISEMI, RITA, and NBS to develop a sustainable mechanism for collecting community RMNCH data through the TAMISEMI Community Based Management Information System (CBMIS).

Percentage of persons with advanced HIV infection receiving ARV combination therapy

Information on national HIV prevalence in Tanzania is derived from surveillance of HIV in special populations, such as women attending antenatal clinics and blood donors. However, these surveillance data do not provide an estimate of the HIV prevalence among the general population. To better understand the magnitude and pattern of HIV prevalence in the general reproductive-age population, the 2003-04 THIS included HIV testing for female and male survey respondents age 15-49. The 2003-04 THIS provided, for the first time, direct estimates of HIV prevalence among the general female and male populations in Mainland Tanzania and detailed information about HIV prevalence by age, residence, region, and other socioeconomic characteristics. HIV prevalence estimates among the general population were repeated in the 2007-08 THMIS. To obtain a new estimate of HIV prevalence among the general population and update information on the characteristics of the epidemic, it was decided to repeat HIV testing as part of the 2011-12 THMIS. As was done previously with the 2003-04 THIS and the 2007-08 THMIS, the results of this testing was used to refine HIV prevalence estimates based on the sentinel surveillance system and to allow better monitoring of the epidemic.

In Mainland Tanzania, HIV prevalence among women and men age 15-49 has decreased from 7.0 percent in the 2003-04 THIS to 5.3 percent in the 2011-12 THMIS. Since 2004, the government has adopted a scale up plan which has
resulted into tremendous increase in the number of clinics providing HIV care and treatment services and the number of people accessing services. The decline in total HIV prevalence between 2003-04 and 2011-12 is statistically significant.

The target for percentage of persons with advanced HIV infection receiving ARV combination therapy by 2015 is to reach 60 percent (71,733) children and 85 percent (747,153) adults. The baseline for all groups was 48 percent. As of December 2013, it was estimated that a total of 1,400,000 people were living with HIV (Spectrum data, 2014). Of these 40 percent (560,000) had advanced HIV disease, hence were eligible for ART. 473,707 (67 percent) of adults and 38,848 (29 percent) of children with advanced disease who were eligible for ART were receiving ART by December 2013. This shows a very low coverage of ART in children, far below the target. By the end of 2013, a total of 1,209 Care and Treatment Centres had started to provide HIV care and treatment services.

Table 3.4: ART Coverage among adults and children, 2011 - 2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Years</th>
<th>PLHIV (Adult + Children)</th>
<th>Adults needing ART</th>
<th>Adults receiving ART (annual)</th>
<th>percent Coverage</th>
<th>Children needing ART</th>
<th>Children receiving ART (annual)</th>
<th>percent Coverage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1,400,000</td>
<td>340,844</td>
<td>246,873</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>151,143</td>
<td>19,555</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>1,400,000</td>
<td>633,952</td>
<td>398,593</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>143,352</td>
<td>32,302</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1,400,000</td>
<td>702,011</td>
<td>473,707</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>135,737</td>
<td>38,848</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Spectrum May, 2014

Table 3.5: Progress with selected HIV-related indicators, FY 2011-13 (figure in per cent)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Proportion of RCH facilities providing PMTCT services</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Percentage of pregnant women tested for HIV infection</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Percentage of HIV exposed infants receiving ARV</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Percentage of HIV exposed Infants receiving Cotrimoxazole</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Challenges and recommendations on HIV and AIDS**

Late enrolment of eligible PLHIV on ART; insufficient follow up of clients enrolled on ART; weak linkage between HIV counselling and testing services (HTC) and care and treatment services; irregular supply of HIV test kits and ARV drugs; and delay of CD4 results which delay ART initiation are some of the challenges. In order to address these challenges, among others stakeholders should; (i) put more resources on information education and communication to improve uptake of services; (ii) establish simple and standard monitoring systems to track lost to follow up clients in order to retain more clients on ART; and (iv) further decentralization of ART care to health centres and the community outreach programs.

**Malaria control**

Malaria is a major public health concern especially for pregnant women and children under age 5. The disease is a leading cause of morbidity and mortality among outpatient and inpatient admissions. It accounts for up to 40 percent of all outpatient visits (MoHSW, 2008). Malaria poses many societal and economic burdens ranging from school absenteeism to low productivity in the workplace. In the short term, widespread malaria illness reduces agricultural production and other economic outputs; additionally, the cumulative effect over the long term may decrease national economic capacity and development.

The Malaria Indicator Survey (MIS) component of the 2011-12 THMIS measures malaria prevention and treatment outcomes including household coverage of malaria interventions, possession and use of Insecticide-Treated mosquito Nets (ITNs), IRS activities, and use of Intermittent Preventive Treatment (IPTp) among pregnant women. Many of these indicators were assessed in past TDHS surveys in addition to the 2007-08 THMIS, which allows for trend analysis.
Table 3.6 Progress in Malaria Intervention Activities, As Measured By Core Indicators, 2007-2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of women who received two doses of preventive intermittent treatment for malaria during last pregnancy</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32.7</td>
<td>32.7</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of vulnerable groups (pregnant women 15-49 years of age) sleeping under an ITN previous night</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of vulnerable groups (children under 5) sleeping under an ITN previous night</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of laboratory confirmed malaria cases among all suspected malaria cases attended at the Out Patient Department (OPD)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaria parasite prevalence among children 6 - 59 months years of age</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3.28: Percentage of Women who Received 2+ Doses of IPT for Malaria, 2004/05 - 2012

Source: TDHS 2004/05, 2010; THMIS 2007/08, 2011/12
**Figure 3.29: Percentage of Households with at Least One ITN, By Wealth Status, 2007/8 And 2012**

Source: THMIS 2007/8, 2012

**Figure 3.30: Malaria Parasite Prevalence Among Children 6 Months to 59 Months Years of Age, by Residence, 2008 And 2012.**

Source: AHSPPR 2013/14
Challenges and recommendations on Malaria control

Significant progress has been made in the control of malaria through massive scale up of recommended preventive and curative interventions over the past decade, yet the country remains highly vulnerable for malaria transmission due climatic conditions suitability. Therefore, resource mobilization including domestic is so crucial so as to maintain the coverage and sustain the gains achieved so far. There is need for maintenance of the scale-up recommended interventions to ensure communities are continuously protected against malaria. Any laxity in instituting malaria control measures is likely to have a rebound effect with severe consequence.
Tuberculosis control

Tuberculosis has continued to be among the top ten cause of death and is ranked 6th among admission aged five years and above in the country. In 2008 the percentage of TB treatment success/completion rate was 84.7 percent which is the baseline and HSSP III target of 82 percent by 2015 and WHO target of 85 percent.

The National Tuberculosis and Leprosy Programme (NTLP) is charged with the responsibility of facilitating early diagnosis, treatment and cure of as many tuberculosis and leprosy patients as possible so as to reduce the incidence and prevalence of these diseases until they are no longer a major public health problem in the country and to reduce physical disability and psycho-social suffering caused by the two diseases. Performance of NTLP continues to exhibit solid performance – with year-on-year improvements in treatment success as shown below which in some incidences surpassed both HSSP III and WHO targets. The TB treatment success rate is defined as the number of patients who successfully completed treatment as a proportion of the total tuberculosis cases diagnosed.

Figure 3.33: TB Treatment Completion Rate, 2009-2013

![Percentage of completion rate graph](image)

Source: AHSPPR 2013/14

Table 3.7: TB Notification Progress

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TB notification rate per 100,000 population</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>no</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: AHSPPR 2013/14
Challenges and recommendations on Tuberculosis control

TB notification rate is still below the WHO estimated TB incidence rate (142 vs. 165 /100,000) may due to low number of diagnostic health facilities including low capacity to diagnose MDR-TB cases. Therefore, in order to increase TB notification, rolling out new diagnostic technologies such as Gene-Xpert machines and intensifying community TB care interventions is imperative. Involvement of mining sector in TB control is another intervention that can increase TB case detection and improve treatment outcome.

Goal 3 Summary of Challenges and Way forward

The analysis above shows progress made in several indicators of health, including immunization coverage and TB treatment completion rate. However, one of the most notable challenges is that most of indicators in this goal need concerted efforts in order to achieve the intended targets. These are targets in reducing FR, MMR, U5MR etc. Joint efforts are needed to implement HSSP IV basing on the challenges and lessons learned from the implementation of HSSP (I-III).

3.4. Clean and Safe Water; Sanitation and Hygiene

Goal 4: Increasing access to affordable clean and safe water; sanitation and hygiene

The Government and other stakeholders have focused on creating affordable, sustainable and reliable sources of water supply, sewerage and sanitation in both rural and urban areas. The government has intervened in the sector introducing and changing policy, institutional, legal and regulatory frameworks governing water sector. The interventions include the adoption of the National Water Policy of 2002. This policy was followed by the development and approval of the National Water Sector Development Strategy (NWSDS) 2006-2015, the Water Sector Development Program (WSDP) 2006-2025, the Water Resources Management Act No. 11 of 2009 and Water Supply and Sanitation Act No. 12 of 2009. These measures have brought significant achievements in improving water supply service delivery in the country.

Performance under goal Four

Progress of water and sanitation under this goal is measured through the following indicators:

i. Proportion of population with access to piped or protected water as their main drinking water source

ii. Percentage of households with basic sanitation facilities; and

iii. Percentage of schools having adequate sanitation facilities (as per the education policy)\(^4\)

4 Note that percentage of schools having adequate sanitation facilities indicator has been already discussed in goal 1, thus discussion on challenges and recommendations of goal 4 is based on the first and second indicator.
Proportion of population with access to piped or protected water as their main drinking water source

There are two main sources of data on access to clean and safe water: i) routine data collected by utilities and local government authorities, coordinated by the Ministry of Water and Irrigation (MoWI); and (ii) data from periodic household surveys and census conducted by the National Bureau of Statistics. However, the two data sources measure different things; routine data show the presence and functionality of infrastructure while household surveys measure actual access to water by households.

According to routine data, water supply coverage in rural areas declined from 58.7 percent in 2009 to 40 percent in 2013. The decline was due to various reasons, including drought in various parts of the country, destruction of water supply infrastructure, unstable water sources and inadequate continuity in quick win projects. However, following the implementation of the Big Results Now (BRN) initiative, access to water increased substantially, from 40 percent in 2013 to 51 in 2014 and then to 67 percent in June 2015. This surpasses the MKUKUTA II target of 65 percent by June 2015.

The BRN initiative focuses on construction of new water schemes, rehabilitation of existing water projects, extension of existing water projects and improved operation and maintenance services. All of these interventions contributed to the increase in water supply coverage mainly in rural areas. The objective of BRN initiative is to increase the proportion of rural households with access to improved drinking water sources reaching 74 percent by June 2016.

Furthermore, according to Water Point Mapping Inventory that was conducted by the Ministry of Water from December 2011 to February 2013, Mainland Tanzania has a total of 75,777 water points, of which 46,697 equivalent to 62 percent, are
functioning and the remaining 38 percent are not functioning. This data provides the basis for the Sector to focus on rehabilitation of malfunctioning water schemes and construction of new water supply schemes in rural settlements, which basically, the BRN initiative have already started taking into consideration.

The Household Budget Survey of 2011/2012 reported that the proportion of households with a protected water source increased to 60 percent, from 52 and 55 percent reported by HBS 2007 and HBS 2000/01 respectively. Likewise, the percentage of households within 1 km of drinking water increased from 57 percent in 2007 to 71 percent in 2011/12.

Water Supply and Services in Urban Areas and Small Towns

During the years under review, the Government efforts were directed towards rehabilitating, constructing and expanding water supply and sewerage systems in urban areas. This went hand in hand with building the institutional and technical capacity of the urban water supply and sewerage Authorities, particularly focusing with immediate works with quick impacts. As the results of these efforts, water supply coverage in 19 regional headquarters increased from 84 percent in 2009 to 86 percent in 2010/11, and it was maintained up to June 2015. This trend is due to the fact that population within the service areas in various authorities have increased and in some authorities services have been expanded. Furthermore, the number of households connected to Water Supply and Sewerage Systems has been increasing steadily from 196,619 in 2007/2008 to 311,213 in 2012/13. Deliberate investments in the water sector facilitated the observed achievements.

Table 3.8: Increasing access to affordable clean and safe water; sanitation and hygiene

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Major Urban Region centres</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dar es Salaam</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>64-68</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small towns and National water projects</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>52.5</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Settlements</td>
<td>57.8</td>
<td>56.57</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Data Source: Ministry of Water Budget speeches (2010-2015), Water Sector Status Reports and Aide -Memoire. (Basing on Routine data).

DAWASCO coverage have been fluctuating between 2007/08 and 2012/13, recorded the highest of 140,706 houses connected in 2008/09 and the lowest of 90,374 houses in 2009/10. In 2012/13, the number of houses connected to
DAWASCO was 114,357. Figure below shows number of households connected to water supply.

**Figure 3.35: Trend of Household Water Connections, 2007/08-2012/13**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial year</th>
<th>No. of House connections</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2007/08</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008/09</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>10,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>30,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Annual WSSAs Reports

The number of households connected to sewerage system in WSSAs has also been increasing (from 15,515 in 2007/08 to 21,999 households in 2012/13). Likewise, the completion of sewerage investment has contributed to the increase in sewerage connections.

**Challenges and recommendations on proportion of population access to piped or protected water**

The government is seriously facing a challenge in raising the number of people access to piped and protected water including frequent drought observed in various parts of the country, destruction of water supply infrastructure, sustainable water sources and inadequate continuity in quick win projects. Much has to be done on this especially public campaign on environmental protection, regular surveillance on water supply infrastructure and securing resources for further financing in water projects.

On the monitoring side, there is a constraint with the usage of the Water Point Mapping data as it is infrequently updated. This poses as a challenge in tracking the status on functionality of water points. Further, the differences in definitions of “improved access to water” across different data sources complicate the monitoring since comparison is not straightforward.

**Percentage of households with basic sanitation facilities**

Percentage of households with basic sanitation facilities represents a proportion of people with access to improved sanitation facilities. Implementation of sanitation and hygiene is critical for prevention of outbreak of diseases such as cholera. Currently, the country is implementing the National Sanitation Campaign (NSC) which aims at increasing the number of households with improved sanitation facilities. It is expected that the campaign will increase additional 1.68 million households and 812 schools that use improved toilets, hand washing with soap and maintaining general environment cleanness in both urban and rural by 2015.
Concerning rural sanitation, by June 2014, a total of 10,031 sub-villages had signed declaration to construct improved sanitation facilities for all village households. As a result, the overall hand-washing and improved latrine improved by 57 percent households against the cumulative target, particularly 384,709 (57 percent) households gaining access to improved sanitation and 254,947 (38 percent) households having hand-washing facilities out of a cumulative target of 675,156 since 2012/2013 for both hand washing and improved latrines. Output and outcomes of school WASH program, as of June 2014, SWASH programs recorded a number of achievements including; 128 schools completed rehabilitation, 54 schools rehabilitation was still in progress, 444 sanitation clubs were established, and 300 schools accomplished rehabilitation of toilets using funds secured from other development partners such as UNICEF, SNV AND TRCS (MoW, 2014).

Challenges and recommendations on Percentage of households with basic sanitation facilities
Despite the achievements gained from various programs, the proportional of households with basic sanitation facilities is very low. Challenges faced by the government in implementing this include, limited budget allocation, little awareness on the importance of sanitation facilities to some of the villages i.e. toilets; poor infrastructure especially in remote areas which pose great challenge in addressing the issue and low education among the households. Proper allocation of the budget and public campaign is still needed to increase the number of households with basic sanitation facilities. The government may consider subsidizing sanitation sector with the focus of improving the access especially in rural areas. Similarly, on monitoring side, there is a need to harmonize definitions of “improved sanitation” and “basic sanitation” across different data sources.

Summary of Challenges and Way forward
As shown above, there has been significant progress. The number of households connected to Water Supply and Sewerage Systems has been increasing steadily due to several investments in water sector through Big Result Now (BRN) initiatives. However, there are challenges as outlined below.

Challenges
• Drought in various parts of the country, destruction of water supply infrastructure, sustainable water sources and inadequate continuity in quick win projects.
• Limited budget allocation, little awareness on the importance of sanitation facilities to some of the villages i.e. toilets; poor infrastructure especially in remote areas.
• Ability of communities particularly in rural areas to manage water schemes. This is in terms of both technical skills and financing operations and maintenance.

Way Forward
• Public campaign on environmental protection, regular surveillance on water supply infrastructure and securing resources for further financing in water projects.
• Proper allocation of the budget and public campaign is still needed to increase the number of households with basic sanitation facilities.
• Create more awareness to the communities about importance of safeguarding water schemes for the sustainability.

3.5. Settlements and Sustaining Environmental Quality

Goal 5: Developing Decent Human Settlements while Sustaining Environmental Quality

For the purpose of sustainably achieving the social well-being of the country as a whole, planning is very important in the areas of human settlement, i.e. in housing, transportation, water, sewerage and public health, mobilization of human and financial resources, urban settlements and provision and maintenance of essential community services. In achieving this goal, the Government implements the Human Settlement Policy of 2000, the Town and Country Planning Act 2007, the Survey Act 2007 and the Professional Surveyors Registration Act 2007. In addition, attainment of this goal requires actions at all levels of decision making so that views and opinions are taken into account in formulating and implementing human settlement development projects. Four indicators are assessed under this goal:

i. Percentage of households with decent housing

ii. Proportional of households with land certificates

iii. Percentage of decrease in number of households in disaster prone and ecological sensitive areas, and

iv. Percentage of villages with Land Use Plans

Performance under goal five
Households with decent housing

This indicator focuses on the housing condition of the households. It looks on the material used and durability of the houses. Decent housing comprises of
houses with brick walls, foundation of cement, floor, and roof frame of timber and roof of tiles or corrugated iron sheets. The National Housing Corporation (NHC) continues to play a vital role in ensuring that decent houses are available in the country. Through its Five Year Strategic Plan (2010/11-2014/15), NHC continued to secure land for construction of decent houses in various areas of the country, together with conducting training to its lower level employees to improve their performance. National Housing Building Research Agency (NHBRA) continued to research and to promote use of low cost building materials in various parts of the country. Watumishi Housing Company (WHC) tasked to build houses to be sold under mortgage arrangements to the public servants across the country. All of these initiatives contributed to the increasing in the percentage of households with decent housing. The HBS 2011/12 reported that percentage of households with decent housing rose from 55 percent in 2007, to 73 percent in 2012. It further reported that 70.3 percent of the households lived in houses with a durable roof compared to 55.6 percent of households in 2007. Likewise, 48.2 percent lived in houses with durable walls compared to 34.1 percent reported be HBS of 2007.

Figure 3.36: Trend on the Use of Modern and Durable Housing Materials

Source: Poverty Key Findings HBS 2011/12

Challenges and recommendations on percentage of households with decent housing

Despite the gradual improvements in the number of households with decent housing, percentage is still below the MKUKUTA II target of 75 percent. NHC still facing challenges in providing decent housing in the country including high cost of securing land and building materials, higher housing demand compared
to the available supply, limited supply of socio-economic services in some areas particularly rural areas and affordability to vulnerable and poor social groups. More efforts should be directed towards ensuring that the target is reached and surpassed, by supporting housing sector and public institutions i.e. NHC, NHBRA and WHC. Support could be on researches, building materials and securing land at cheaper cost.

**Houses with land certificates**

Effective urban planning requires all houses to be in surveyed areas so as social services can easily be supplied and accessibility through street roads ensured. During the period under review, the Government continued to register and issue land certificates of plots and farms, conducted surveys and mapping and regularized unplanned settlements. These efforts contributed to the increase in houses with land certificates from 5.86 percent in 2012/13 to 6.4 percent in 2013/14. MKUKUTA II target is to reach 10 percent of households with land certificates by 2015.

**Challenges and recommendations on houses with land certificates**

The proportion is still very far from the target, the Government face a lot of challenges including the size of the country land, and some villages are not easily reached due to poor infrastructure. Another challenge is the reducing instead of improving the livelihood and wellbeing of the poor due to the fact that much of the fertile and productive land is taken by the rich. This has an impact of incapacitate the productive capabilities of the poor in twofold: first, they are left with less productive land; second, land grabbing by the rich pushes poor to new settlements were socioeconomic services are less advanced.

**Decrease in number of households in disaster prone and ecologically sensitive areas**

Ecological Sensitive Areas (ESAs) are landscapes that provide ecosystem services but are fragile and vulnerable to damage by human activities, thus require special attention. The Government continues to ban construction of buildings in areas that are prohibited due to disaster proneness and ecological sensitivity. Safeguard the areas through surveillance and laws enforcement. In the same vain, the government continues to collaborate with other countries in management ESAs and utilization of resources through different initiatives such as the Nile Basin Initiatives (NBI) under the project titled "Planning for Resilience in East Africa through Policy, Adaptation, Research, and Economic Development" (PREPARED).

For the purpose of conserving the environment and sources of water, the government continues to identify, set boundaries, and declare some areas as protected. Up to 2013/2014, a total of 153 water sources were identified to be prone
to destruction due to human activities, out of which, 59 where in the process of being declared as protected sources. Also, the government undertook measures to control pollution of water sources by caring out performance assessment of industries, mining, and hotel sewage systems. Further, the government continued to provide early warning systems in relation to weather conditions and climate change, strengthening warning centres and disaster management committee through provision of education, and other necessary resources.

**Challenges and recommendations on number of households in disaster prone and ecologically sensitive areas**

In implementing this to ensure the number of households in disaster prone and ecologically sensitive areas is reduced, the government is facing the following challenges: little awareness by the community on protected areas; shortage of land particularly in urban areas such that households struggle to settle at a place near town to easily access social and economic services; lack of regular surveillance in protected areas; affordability of the poor in securing appropriate land and unpredictable weather condition. Education is needed to create awareness on protected areas, regular surveillance and law enforcement, fight for corruption, land use plans and secure areas for vulnerable social groups.

**Villages with land use plans**

The government continues to undertake special projects to implement Village land Act of 1999 in various districts in order to build capacity and prepare Guidelines for districts to implement the Village Land Act. Also certificates of Village Land and certificates of Customary Rights of Occupancy were issued, educational and public awareness programs were undertaken, as well as introducing village registrar offices. The issuance of certificates of village land helps villages to plan the use of land in their villages and, Certificates of Customary Rights of Occupancy to ensure individuals of safety to land ownership. Public awareness programs help villages to understand their areas of administration and plans for land use. During the period under review the villages with land use plans increased from 1.4 percent in 2010 to 8 percent in 2011. It further increased to 11.65 percent and 12.45 percent in 2013 and 2014, respectively. The target for MKUKUTA II is to attain 40 percent by 2015.

**Challenges and recommendations on villages with land use plans**

The government face the following challenges: land conflicts among villagers particularly when there is disagreement on the new agreements; little awareness among communities; shortage of land in some villages and land survey challenges. Much is still needed to be done to address the issue of land conflicts and public awareness.
Summary of Challenges and Way forward

Challenges

i. High cost of securing land and building materials, higher housing demand compared to the available supply, limited supply of socio-economic services in some areas particularly rural areas and affordability to vulnerable and poor social groups;

ii. Some villages are not easily accessible due to poor infrastructure. Land certificate somehow reduce instead of improving the livelihood and wellbeing of the poor due to the fact that land certificates are used by riches to secure the lands of the poor leading the poor to shift to the areas far from social and economic services;

iii. Little awareness by the community on protected areas, shortage of land particularly in urban areas such that households struggle to settle at a place near town to easily access social and economic services, lack of regular surveillance in protected areas, affordability of the poor in securing appropriate land and unpredictable weather condition; and

iv. Multiplicity of institutions with different responsibilities that deal with land issues.

Way forward

i. More effort is needed to ensure that the target is reached and surpassed, by supporting Housing sector and Public institutions i.e. NHC, NHBRA and Watumishi Housing Company particularly, assisting on researches, building materials and securing land at cheaper cost.

ii. Education is needed to create awareness on areas protected, regular surveillance and law enforcement, fight against corruption, land use plans and secure areas for vulnerable social groups.

3.6. Social Protection and Rights to Vulnerable and Needy Groups

Goal 6: Providing Adequate Social Protection and Rights to Vulnerable and Needy Groups

Social protection continues to become important policy component in addressing poverty challenges and wellbeing of the vulnerable groups in Tanzania. During MKUKUTA II implementation period, the government has continued to undertake various interventions aimed at addressing social protection needs of the country. The indicators under MKUKUTA II framework for this goal mainly focus on children who are at risk of not attending school and those lack parental guidance. The realization and enjoyment of children’s rights entail fulfillment of four fundamental basic rights: 1) access to basic needs and health services 2) right to develop to their fullest potential 3) right to protection and 4) right to participation. Specifically, indicators for this goal are:
Data on these indicators mainly comes from the HBS and routine data sources. What follows is the assessment of these three indicators. Moreover, the importance of Tanzania Social Action Fund (TASAF) in reducing poverty and vulnerability is recognized in connection to attaining this goal. TASAF initiatives for this reason have also been covered in this part.

**Performance under goal Six**

**Proportion of households with orphans who attend school**

Proxy indicator is used to report progress of orphans who attend schools. This is the proportion of orphans attending in schools. Generally, there has been a fluctuation on orphans’ attendance to school over the MKUKUTA implementation period. Basic Education Statistics in Tanzania showed that in 2006/07 the baseline year, about 8.6 percent of orphans were attending primary school. This number improved to 10.9 percent in 2007/08, dropped to 10.34 percent (2008/09), then to 10.33 percent (2009/10), and to 10.26 percent (2010/11) down to 9.8 percent (2011/12). In the period 2012/13 the attendance improved to 13.5 percent but regressed again to 9.0 percent in 2013/14. On the gender basis, male enrolment has been higher than female enrolment throughout the MKUKUTA II implementation period.

![Percentage of orphans in primary schools](image_url)

Source: BEST; Education Sector Performance reports
Challenges and recommendations on Proportion of households with orphans who attend school

The main challenge of tracking progress using this indicator is it depends on proxy information for assessment. Furthermore, on the actual performance, limited availability of infrastructure, furniture, learning & teaching materials poses as a challenge to getting quality education. It will be ideal for surveys such as NPS and HBS to directly capture this information at household level. This will help to discuss the analysis of orphans attending schools using data from the demand side of education.

Proportion of children (5 years +) with disability attending school

One of the key challenges the education system of Tanzania faces is the provision of education to the children with disability. The government is running educational services for learners with special needs through special schools, integrated units and inclusive schools for the following categories of learners with disabilities: The blind and Visually Impaired; The Deaf and Hearing Impaired; The Intellectually Impaired/Mentally Handicapped; The Physically Handicapped; The Deaf blind; Autistics children/children with autism; and Albinos. The Law of the Child Act 2009 (under point 8: Duty to maintain a child), states that:

“A child with disabilities shall be entitled to special care, treatment, affordable facilities for his rehabilitation and equal opportunities to education and training wherever possible to develop his/her maximum potential and be self-reliance”

There are several interventions for ensuring that children with disability attend school. The National Strategy on Inclusive Education- NSIE (2009-2017) is one of such interventions. Inclusive Education initiatives for learners with disabilities have been initiated in several districts. The proportion of children with disability attending primary school marginally increased from 0.32 percent in 2009/2010 to 0.35 percent in 2010/11. It then declined to 3.4 in 2011/12 in maintained this level in 2013/14. Throughout the review period, attendance is higher for males than for females. Generally, the enrolment of children with disability is very low posing as a challenge on equal access to education among various population groups.

Challenges and recommendations on Proportion of children with disability attending school

The proportion of children with disability attending school is still low. Low response among households and communities to enroll children with disability in school stands as a challenge. The critical aspect of the implementation of NSIE is embedded with the organizational and cultural change required in education. Inclusive education is not, and cannot be, an add-on programme but rather a comprehensive approach attempting to address the barriers to presence,
participation and learning which arise in the process of education provision. Inclusive education calls for the adoption of its values and principles across education, and translating these into practices at all levels, in all programmes and in every classroom and lecture hall. In practical terms, this requires the sharing of the responsibility and accountability of the implementation of the Strategy among different stakeholders. Expertise accumulated in special needs education can be used in support of inclusive education as well.

**Percentage of child headed households**

Household Budget Survey (HBS 2011/12) reported that about 0.1 percent of households in Mainland Tanzania were headed by children aged 18 years and below. The results indicated that urban households were leading (0.2 percent) as compared to their rural counterpart (0.1 percent). However, the percentage of child-headed household seems to have increased as compared to HBS 2007, which indicated the non-existent of household headed by children (0.0 percent) for the similar cohorts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3.9: Percentage distribution of Households by Age of Head of Household</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dar es Salaam</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Under 18</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: HBS 2011/12

**Challenges and recommendations on Percentage of child headed households**

The main challenge here in to reverse and contain factors that contribute to developing of households headed by children. HIV and AIDS pandemic are among factors leading to the problem mainly when both parents are lost. Therefore, interventions on this pandemic disease and other morbidity causing factors are ideal in this regard.

**TASAF Interventions on Social Protection**

The government through TASAF has adopted an approach to provide support to the poor and the food insecure in a systematic way. This new approach includes the development and consolidation of a comprehensive, predictable and Productive Social Safety Net (PSSN). The implementation of TASAF supported interventions
is meant to enhance capacities of the poorest population, vulnerable groups and people with disabilities in communities (villages and mitaa) to participate in economic activities and access social services.

The Productive Social Safety Net (PSSN) is intended to support one million extreme poor households comprising six million people (approximately 15 percent of the total population). TASAF made notable contribution in national attempts to reduce inequalities in accessing social and economic services and opportunities along income, age, geographical areas and gender. Up to 2014, a total of 761,630 households were enrolled in the PSSN. Cumulatively, this is about 76 percent of the targeted 1 million households PSSN intends to reach. A total of 2,595,668 individuals have been reached in this case with 55 percent of them being females.

Nonetheless, there is a major pending issue of MKUKUTA II implementation that is related to TASAF initiatives. This is the unmet community demand for support as expressed by Subproject Interest Forms (SPIFs). A total of 102,309 SPIFs have been received from communities in all LGAs. Only 12,347 (12 percent) applications were approved and supported. This indicates that communities are in dire need of development support in order to get out of poverty but resources are not adequate to meet their requirements—the demand-supply side mismatch.

**Challenges that TASAF faced in the implementation of MKUKUTA II**

i). The design assumption that all LGAs were capable and hence did not require TMU staff to provide support to effective delivery of TASAF II. This resulted into less support to communities and many uncompleted subprojects as per sector norms and standards that necessitated requirement for additional funds.

ii). The subproject ceiling of US$ 30,000 resulted into incomplete and non-functional subprojects. During the Mid-Term Review (MTR) the ceiling was increased to USD 45,000 for Service Poor (SP) and Food Insecure (FI) subprojects still could not address the challenges of completion and functionality. This led to additional Financing in 2010 to address completion and functionality of subprojects.

iii). There was a lack of proper computerized systems at LGAs for the project to be interfaced as agreed during the design stage. Tracking of the sub-project physical and financial progress was difficult because the computerized systems which were developed at a later stage for LGAs use couldn’t accommodate Project data requirements.

iv). Due to resource constraint un-allocation of funds specifically for implementation of COMSIP affected smooth implementation of the same. Whereas initially COMSIP was initiated in 44 LGAs and Unguja and Pemba it was later scaled down leaving many beneficiaries unsupported.
v). There was a tendency for decision makers at LGA level and community leaders to favor service poor sub projects and thus ignoring other beneficiary groups. Based on received request from communities (SPIFs) one could note that interest for subprojects were balanced but the approved subprojects especially for the first two to three years were skewed towards the service poor beneficiary group.

vi). Rising prices of construction materials due to increase in fuel prices and depreciation of currencies had drastically affected the budgets of sub projects that threatened to leave sub projects incomplete and non-functional.

vii). Operationalization of new system with six (6) Bank accounts at LGAs in year 2012 caused delays in transfer of funds from the LGAs to Subprojects Bank Accounts and supervision of TASAF supported activities. All funds were frozen to Development Account managed by LGAs. The learning curve took long and connectivity was a challenge in some LGAs.

viii). Low Community contribution. Besides communities' purchasing power being affected by the food crisis, they were also required to contribute to other development activities. During Mid Term Review (MTR) the community contribution was lowered from 20 percent to 15 percent that was believed community could contribute.

ix). Effects due to seasonality factors. The implementation of some of PWP subprojects coincided with agricultural activities and hence it was difficult to get adequate number of beneficiaries to engage in planned activities.

x). Limited market and inadequate marketing techniques. This was due to the fact that products produced through IGAs did not have readily available markets. Processing and packaging skills for value addition of products was necessary to attract the market.

**Summary of Success, Challenges and Way forward**

The analysis above shows that the government and stakeholders have full articulated the agenda of social protection and more results have been documented as reflected in various reports. However, it is noted that, inadequate financing of social protection initiatives may be jeopardized by resource constraints. Going forward, the articulation of social protection agenda in FYDP II should draw inputs from NSPF, PSSN and regional consultative workshops on developing NSPF among others. As with respect to TASAF, areas proposed to be given priority in the coming national plans are:
i). Expansion of safety net program incorporating transfers linked to participation in public works and adherence to co-responsibilities under the Productive Social Safety Net (PSSN) implemented by TASAF III from one million extreme poor households to 2.3 million households having about 15 million people, approximately 28 percent of the total population.

ii). Rollout of community driven livelihoods enhancement interventions to promote economic empowerment of extreme poor and poor households to make savings, formation of savings groups and implement economic activities to reach poor households estimated to be 28 percent of the total population.

iii). Implementation of targeted infrastructure development to facilitate poorly served communities and households access improved services of education, health and water to realize the objectives of the safety net finally build human capital; and

iv). Implementation of capacity building to ensure adequate program implementation by households, community, local government authorities, regional and national levels to facilitate sound delivery of the safety net program to reach vulnerable and extreme poor and poor households.

3.7. Gaps and Data Challenges for Cluster II

The assessment of MKUKUTA II CLUSTER II has revealed challenges and successes of the implementation. Progress has been made but yet there are notable gaps towards achieving MKUKUTA II goals on improving socio wellbeing. Beyond that, there are data issues, which posed as an obstacle on tracking the progress during MKUKUTA II implementation. Here are some of the concerns connected to data:

i. There was no indicator which directly reflects the cost of accessing social-economic services. The assessment mainly focuses on the supply side as data on demand side such as on affordability of services and importance of such services to the communities generally lacks. Further, for instance, the increase in number of schools and hospitals (esp. private) reflect achievements in accessibility, however this may only affect a certain social class.

ii. Lack of year to year data, the data of some indicators depend on National Surveys which mostly conducted after 3 to 5 years, trend analysis might not reflect the reality, e.g. literacy rate (only found in 2012 survey), water access and most of indicators of goal 3. This is particularly a concern for the flow variables.

iii. Much of the indicators lack data disaggregated by gender, thus addressing gender issues on various indicators in this assessment became challenging.
Chapter IV: Good Governance and Accountability

4.1. Introduction

Good governance and accountability are fundamental and prerequisites for sustained economic development and poverty reduction. They are the basis of implementation effectiveness. Cluster III aimed to address issues of good governance and accountability. The following are the cluster’s broad outcomes:

i. Good governance and the rule of law

ii. Accountability of leaders and public servants

iii. Democracy, and political and social tolerance

iv. Peace, political stability, national unity and social cohesion deepened

4.2. Performance

This section presents the performance review of Cluster III organized in its five goals for the period between 2010/11 and 2014/15. The review uses the respective indicators in each goal and assesses the trends of achievement toward the targets, presents challenges, lessons learned and issues that to be considered for the future plans.

4.2.1 Systems and Structures of Governance

GOAL 1: Ensuring systems and structures of governance uphold the rule of law and are democratic, effective, accountable, predictable, transparent, inclusive and corruption-free at all levels.

Accountability of Public Resources

Accountability in the uses of public resources is one of the critical issues, which have significant influence on the realization of MKUKUTA II targets and development in general. This assertion is applicable at the central government as well as at lower level of government whereby, through the introduction and implementation of Decentralization by Devolution policy (D by D), significant resources have been used at lower level of the government.

The government undertakes auditing annually through its independent institution - the National Audit Office - to examine proper usage of public resources at each point of expenditure of public resources. Audit opinions issued by the National Audit Office are an important indicator of whether government offices are complying with financial management regulations. Table 4.0 shows the
performance of resource utilization for MDAs and LGAs for the period under review. Apparently, the number of institution utilizing public resources according to the financial rules and regulation has improved significantly. The performance based on audit opinion expresses a view as to whether the financial statements of the MDAs or LGAs have been prepared, in all material respects, in accordance with the applicable financial reporting framework as well as adequacy of information disclosure.

Table 4.0: Trends of Clean Audit Certificates of MDAs and LGAs from 2010 – 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of MDAs</td>
<td>89 (67 out of 75)</td>
<td>96 (73 out of 76)</td>
<td>66 (56 out of 85)</td>
<td>91 (79 out of 87)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of LGAs</td>
<td>54 (72 out of 133)</td>
<td>78 (104 out of 134)</td>
<td>80 (112 out of 140)</td>
<td>92 (150 out of 163)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source, CAG, 2015

Table 4.1 shows the trend of performance in detail for MDAs and Regional Secretariat (RS); and Table 4.2 is for LGAs. Note in Table 4.2 is that the number of LGAs increased from 134 LGAs in year 2009/10 to 163 LGAs in 2013/14 an increase of 22 percent. The thrust has been to extend government services closer to communities along with minimizing the long chain of administrative or decision hierarchy. This policy move is based on the premise that, the lower the decision making organ is available, the faster and easy decisions can be made. Above 90 percent of MDAs and LGAs are having clean audit certificates by 2013/14.

Despite the notable achievement, there have been a number of challenges that need to be addressed for better future outcomes. These include; the inadequate capacity with regards to International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS), inadequate knowledge among practitioners in respect to the Integrated Financial Management System (IFMS) and thus cause failure of some institutions to apply or use the system, late release of funds, implementation of CAG’s recommendations of which requires application of acceptable standards.

4 There are four audit opinions. **Unqualified Opinion** - The financial statements are prepared, in all material respects and in accordance with the applicable financial reporting framework. **Qualified Opinion** - The financial statements prepared contain misstatements due to the disagreements with management or limitation of scope which is neither material nor pervasive and except for the effect of those misstatements, financial statements were prepared, in all material respects, in accordance with the applicable financial reporting framework. **Adverse Opinion** - The effect of a disagreement is so material and pervasive to the financial statements that the auditor concludes that a qualification of the report is not adequate to disclose the misleading or incomplete nature of the financial statements. **Disclaimer of Opinion Paragraph** - When the possible effect of a limitation on scope is so material and pervasive that the auditor has not been able to obtain sufficient appropriate audit evidence and accordingly is unable to express an opinion on the financial statements.
non compliance issues, and challenges on procurement. Therefore, more efforts should be on capacity building among staffs of respective institutions, releases of funds to be improved, to institutes strategies on implementing CAG’s recommendations as well as review and up date existing institution’s policies and procedures.

### Table 4.1: Trend of Audit Opinion of MDAs and RS from 2010 – 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total Audited</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CAG, 2014

### Table 4.2: Trend of Audit Opinion of LGAs from 2010 - 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Total LGAs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CAG, 2015

**Information Dissemination to Communities**

Accessibility to information by communities enables citizens to follow and question performance in implementation that carter for their needs. The review focuses on accessibility and transparency of information to communities. It includes accessibility by the citizens to community meetings records, public budgets, revenues and actual expenditure. Notably, financial records and minutes of quarterly meetings are an evidence of good governance practice at grass roots of local government authorities. It also shows commitment of village/ street leaders to improve people’s welfare.

During the period under review all 163 LGAs were found to post their public budgets, revenue and actual expenditures on easily accessible public notice boards (Table 4.3) The challenge has been on posting their annual performance
reports on their website. Although the number of LGAs posting their annual performance on their website increased from 1 percent in 2010/11 to 8 percent in 2014/15, the trend is below the target of 80 percent. More efforts are required particularly on sensitizing LGAs to post their information on user friendly website and ensure reliability.

Table 4.3 Transparency and Information Sharing to the Public by LGAs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of LGAs posting public budgets, revenue and actual expenditures</td>
<td>100 (123 LGAs)</td>
<td>100 (133 LGAs)</td>
<td>100 (133 LGAs)</td>
<td>100 (133 LGAs)</td>
<td>100 (168 LGAs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of LGAs which have their annual Performance reports posted on their websites</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TAMISEMI, 2015

The review also assessed accessibility and transparency of information at lower level of local government (community level - village/street). However, monitoring this indicator at such lower level continued to face challenge of data availability. The indicator can only be measured from survey data which has an interval of time, e.g. the Community Characteristics Report based on Household Budget Survey (HBS). The HBS 2012 shows that there has been a tremendous improvement on the release of recent information to communities since 2007 to 2012 as shown in Figure 4.0.
Likewise the HBS 2012 survey reported that annual community meetings were held in almost all communities (over 95 percent) in the country. Figure 4.1 shows the percentage of communities with quarterly meetings minutes, and indicates that there has been improvement from year 2006/2007 to 2011/12.

**Figure 4.1: Percentage Distribution of Communities by Type of availability of Minutes of Quarterly Meetings in Tanzania Mainland, 2007 and 2011/12**
Improvements in transparency and accountability at the local level require expanded citizen involvement in the scrutiny of village/street budgets and expenditures against development plans. Results from the Community Characteristics Report of HBS 2012 have shown that public participation in local affairs as well as information dissemination is slowly improving. However, more efforts are required to enhance public awareness on existing or introduced development initiatives that are either within the community or have implications to their welfare. This gives them incentive to make follow-ups. It recommended that more efforts to be directed on educative campaigns to communities that also sensitize their active participation in call-up meet.

Moreover, the communication technologies are rapidly increasing to allow and support information sharing. Figure 4.2 shows the proportion of communities with access to selected communication services in the country such as a working public telephone (call boxes); mobile phone signal; and the Internet connection (publicly accessible).

**Figure 4.2: Percentage of Communities with Access to Selected Communication Services by Area, Tanzania Mainland, 2011/12**

Likewise, other potential areas for communication that are powerful in informing and educating communities are the mass media such as radio, television, and newspapers. Media, both print and electronic, are a powerful force in shaping attitudes in modern communities. The HBS 2012 survey noted that about 69 percent of the communities reported to have received radio station signals within their communities and almost 71 percent of the communities received Tanzania and foreign television signals. Regarding newspapers, over 50 percent of communities in Dar es Salaam and other urban areas reported to have received newspapers on the same day. However, in rural areas only 10.5 percent of the communities received newspapers on the same day.
Corruption

Corruption undermines good governance and economic growth, distorts national development, and retards the general welfare of citizens, particularly the poor and the vulnerable groups. The government during the period under review continued to maintain zero-tolerance for all acts of corruption, petty (e.g. involving traffic police) or grand (e.g. involving public tenders), and in the use of state resources. The government continued to create public awareness, and engage all stakeholders in preventing and combating the vice. The results of these efforts are reflected as follows.

Figure 4.3 shows the position of Tanzania ranked relatively to other countries in respect to CPI\(^6\). In 2010 Tanzania score was 2.7 according to the Indices of Transparency International (TI). In 2012/2013 Tanzania has done better job in the fight against corruption. The TI score for the year 2012/13 was 3.5. This score was higher by 0.5 if you compare to 2011/12, but after year 2012 Tanzania scores slightly declined from 35 to 33 in 2013/14 and 31 respectively in 2014/15.

**Figure 4.3: Corruption Perception in Tanzania Ranked to the Rest of the World**

The other dimension of progress reviewed in respect of corruption is the rate of convictions as a percentage of investigated corruption cases. This help to understand the effectiveness and efficiency of the process and the institution responsible for handling corruption related issues in the country. Figure 4.4 shows that the performance has improved during the period under review with

6 The Corruption Perceptions Index (CPI) ranks countries and territories based on how corrupt their public sector is perceived to be. A country or territory’s score indicates the perceived level of public sector corruption on a scale of 0 - 100, where 0 means that a country is perceived as highly corrupt and 100 means it is perceived as very clean. A country’s rank indicates its position relative to the other countries and territories included in the index.
an exception of year 2005 when comparing the number of corruption cases convicted as a percentage of investigated cases sanctioned for prosecution for the past five years of MKUKUTA II implementation.

**Figure 4.4: Trends of Convictions as a Percentage of Investigated cases**

Likewise, Table 4.6 shows the trends of received allegations related to corruptions and the entire process. This is an important aspect that first help to shed light on public awareness and understanding on the importance of reporting suspected event to respective authority. Second, it reflects the effectiveness and capacity of the respective institution to process the reported allegation. Table 4.6 shows that number of reported allegations, though high; it has been declining continuously during the period under review with the exception of year 2011. This may be an indication of an increase of public awareness about corruption and existing preventive laws. Furthermore, the trend shows improved capacity of the respective institution in processing corruption related cases.

**Table 4.6: Trends of Reported Allegations and Process**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Allegations Received</th>
<th>Cases Investigated</th>
<th>Completed Investigation files</th>
<th>Administrative actions taken</th>
<th>Files transferred to other agencies</th>
<th>Files sent to DPP</th>
<th>New cases into courts</th>
<th>Acquittal cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>5,685</td>
<td>870</td>
<td>924</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>224</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>4,765</td>
<td>819</td>
<td>868</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>193</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>5,084</td>
<td>1,178</td>
<td>881</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>5,456</td>
<td>1,100</td>
<td>1,027</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>358</td>
<td>343</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>2,765</td>
<td>391</td>
<td>415</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>53,498</td>
<td>9,641</td>
<td>10,628</td>
<td>825</td>
<td>1,711</td>
<td>1,368</td>
<td>1,900</td>
<td>574</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There have challenges, which continue to undermine efforts to prevent and combat corruption in the country. The main ones are as follows.

i) **Lack of National Whistle Blowers Act**

In the effort of preventing and combating corruption in the country is undermined by the lack of supportive legal framework such as the Whistle Blowers Act. In June 2015, the Government tabled a bill on whistle blower protection. Whistleblower legal protection is essential to encourage the reporting of misconduct, fraud and corruption. This applies to both public and private sector environments, especially in cases of bribery. Protecting public sector whistleblowers facilitates the reporting of passive bribery, as well as the misuse of public funds, waste, fraud and other forms of corruption. Protecting private sector whistleblowers facilitates the reporting of active bribery and other corrupt acts committed by companies. Lack of such protective legal framework in the country increased number of acquittals in corruption cases as well as withdrawal of witnesses in corruption cases.

ii) **The right to information Bill**

Lack of the right to information legal framework is also another aspect that continued to undermine efforts that focus to address issues of corruption in the country. Existence of such framework will help to enhance community cooperation in fighting corruption by minimizing fear among community members to cooperate with respective institutions dealing with corruption in the country. During the period under review the government took initiatives to draft the Right to Information Bill. Once this law is enacted, it will improve the legal framework required for effective until corruption war.

iii) **Insufficient Resource**

Insufficient resource - both financial and human resources for undertaking anti-corruption activities is also an aspect that needs to be considered in the future. During the period under review, some of planned activities were not implemented due to insufficient resources. Establishment of regional offices for the Bureau that is PCCB in order to facilitate its activities especially at lower levels of the community calls for more budget. Also insufficient number of judicial officers and supporting staff results in backlog of cases.

Thus it is recommended to employ more judicial and supporting staffs as well as strategically tried to utilize the existing synergy between PCCB and the Judiciary system in-order to enhance efficiency of the overall process of handling corruption related cases.

iv) **Lack of strong Legal Aid Literacy Network and Change of Culture**

Having a community or society that is knowledgeable or familiar with
national laws and regulations becomes bedrock for successful anti-corruption efforts. During the period under review, poor knowledge among communities with regards to laws and regulation was noted to be among the factors that contribute for increase of corruption allegations and cases. In some instance, few knowledgeable groups strategically use those who are not knowledgeable on existing laws. Thus, there is a need to establish a strong Legal Aid Literacy Network that may help to enhance public knowledge on legal issues.

Likewise, culture and communities' mindset was also noted to account for increased corruption allegations and cases during the period under review. In some instances, communities perceived successful corrupt people as heroes. Therefore, there is an urgent need to strengthen efforts that aimed at enhancing public awareness and sensitization for anti-corruption.

v) Cooperation among other stakeholders in the fight and prevention of corruption

Lack of effective framework for cooperation among stakeholders in the fight and prevention of corruption is also an aspect that needs to be addressed. Dealing with different types of corruption, particularly grand corruption requires strong cooperation among stakeholders. It also calls for trust among stakeholders in the fight against corruption. In addition to using sensitization program to stakeholders, there is a need to establish a cooperation framework amongst stakeholders that will act as guiding tool for their cooperation.

4.2.2. Improving Public Service Delivery

Goal 2: Improving public service delivery to all, especially the poor and vulnerable

Improving public service delivery to all has been the fore front agenda, as a way of enhancing people’s basic needs as well as continuing building a democratic government. Improvement in efficiency in service delivery impacts on access, quantity and quality of service provision. In assessing the state of public service provision during the period under review, this section used recent case studies as well as survey and sector reports to explore public perception with regards to public service provision.

Although there has been some improvement, studies have shown that, even when resources are allocated for the provision of public services, a large portion of the resources might not be spent as planned. This challenge is not particular to Tanzania. For instance, the Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys show that

---

7 Among the case studies that have been used include a study by Leyaro (2015) and REPOA 2012 that focused on the state and provision of public services in selected regions of Tanzania. Other report used includes the HBS 2012 survey report.
in Africa only a small percentage of resources (around 20 per cent) reach the targeted destination (SID, 2013). Thus, there is a weak relationship between resources and services provided in terms of both quantity and quality. Indeed, increasing resources — labour and financial resources — rarely imply increased quantity and quality of services. This is due to the weakness in the accountability relations across the service provision chain. Improving service delivery must therefore go beyond mere increases in resources/inputs — must focus on strengthening accountability — institutional aspects of service provision.

**Public Perception on the State of Public Service Provision**

The review here shades light on the public perception with regards to the access to and the quantity as well as quality of public service provision. The people’s perception involved views with regards to the current state of the provision of education, health care, water and sanitation, housing, electricity, town planning and infrastructure (TPI) development and law and order enforcement (LOE), as well as with regard to access, quantity, quality and affordability of the services.

Generally, reviewed studies have shown that, majority of people indicated that most of the basic services were available in their communities. For example the survey by REPOA found majority of people, approximately 80 percent, expressed a degree of satisfaction with public service delivery. This finding is consistent with the findings of both the HBS and the TDHS, which showed that there was an improvement in access to and availability of most of the basic services. In particular, the increase in the number of primary schools and ward-based secondary schools in the communities has made education the “most available service” (91.18 per cent), followed by health care (76.38 percent). These findings are shown in Figure 4.5.

**Figure 4.5: People’s Perception on Availability of Public Services**

![Figure 4.5](image)

Source: Leyaro, 2015

The availability of a service does not mean that it is accessible. The findings of the study by Leyaro (2015) have revealed that some of the households did not have access to the services and that others could hardly access them. The
situation was poor, with respect to law and order enforcement and town planning and infrastructure development. The study revealed furthermore that education was the “most accessible service” (34.35 percent), followed by health care (27.02 percent), water (25.61 percent), electricity 24.01 (percent), town planning and infrastructure development (18.86 percent) and law and order enforcement (17.77 percent).

Likewise, majority of the people said that the services provided to the communities were not enough in terms of quantity. As shown in Figure 4.6 law and order enforcement services were not enough (52.74 percent), followed by town planning and infrastructure development (50.75 percent), electricity/energy (42.35 percent) and the others (over 35 percent). Water supply in many areas was acute and the quality of the service was poor.

**Figure 4.6: People’s Perception about Quantity of Public Service**

![Bar chart showing perceptions about quantity of public service](image)

Source: Leyaro, 2015

The study by Leyaro (2015) also examined the perceptions of public service quality. The public is demanding for more diversity and more quality of services. The public asks: Do pupils at school and residents in a nursing home receive sufficient attention? Are the staffs sufficiently skilled? What is the situation as regards dropout from lessons and waiting lists? The study results showed that those who were not satisfied or somewhat satisfied with the provision of water, electricity, town planning and infrastructure development and law and order enforcement accounted for more than 50 per cent of all the respondents (Figure 4.7).
The review noted that a significant section the public complains about the adequacy, affordability (costs) and quality of the services provided. This points to challenges to be addressed by enhancing the service providers’ efforts and ability to provide the services, particularly education and health services. Furthermore, there is a need to address issues of shortage of resources particularly in underserved areas, resource leakage and inefficient usage of the few resources available.

4.2.3. Human Rights for all

**Goal 3: Promoting and Protecting Human Rights for all, Particularly for Poor Women, Men and Children, the Vulnerable, Including people living with HIV and AIDS**

Under MKUKUTA II, there have been considerable efforts to promote and protect of human rights for all in the country including poor women and men, vulnerable groups such as children, people living with HIV, etc.

**Reported Sexual Abuse**

Sexual abuse and harassment remain common violations of human rights in Tanzania, especially for women and children. However, sexual abuse and harassment is one of the most under reported crimes (much of incidence are basically being left unreported). Nevertheless, the government in collaboration with stakeholders during the period under review continued to implement various interventions in addressing incidence of sexual abuse and harassment in the country. Among initiatives undertaken includes conducts of awareness campaigns especially in those areas that were observed to be potential for such
incidence either due to vulnerable environment, culture, etc. Other interventions include the introduction of Police, Gender and Children Desks across District Police Headquarters that aimed at addressing gender based violence as well as violence against children.

Table 4.7 shows the number of reported cases of sexual abuse that resulted in a conviction. The reported cases continued to increase and this provides an indication of an increase in public awareness and understanding of the importance of reporting incidence to respective authorities. It is an aspect of increased public awareness on human rights.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Prisoners</th>
<th>% change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>14,677</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>7,709</td>
<td>-47.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>7,795</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>9,776</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>23,328</td>
<td>138.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MoHA, 2015

During the period under review several challenges have been noted to continue undermine efforts addressing issues of sexual abuse in the country. These are:

i. Low public awareness on issues related to human rights. This is partly due to low level of education and poverty.

ii. Traditional beliefs and rituals in some communities which consider human rights protection as abuse.

iii. Unwillingness of victims to report the sexual abuse incidents as well as failure of witness/victims to produce evidence before the court.

iv. Globalization and urbanization which expose communities especially the youth on issues and manners that violate human rights. Such effects are extended further by high unemployment rates that exist in the country.

v. Lack of enough resources and capacity to carry out effective investigation on reported incidence.

To address some of these challenges, the Government needs to invest in Monitoring and Evaluation techniques and investigation skills; promote safety and security policies in schools and urban areas; ensure effective community policing in urban areas; and support the conduct of awareness campaigns and investigations.

**Gender balance**

There is abundant evidence that gender balance is an important means and end
to socio-economic and political development in the country. Gender inequality is one of the underlying causes of low productivity as it does, among other things, hamper the participation of at least half of the country’s population. In recognition of this fact the government has taken various measures to ensure equality of all its citizens and, in particular, gender equality and gender equity. Gender is now mainstreamed into all policies, programmes and strategies.

As part of operationalization of gender policy, the government has ensured that the established gender focal points in ministries, independent government departments, regional and local authorities are effective enough to address gender issues. The focal points are responsible for gender mainstreaming in their respective plans and programmes. The implementation of gender-related legislative, administrative and affirmative actions has enabled to record remarkable achievements in gender balance in education, health and water; economic empowerment and participation in decision-making. Proportion of women in senior positions in different levels of decision-making has increased from 33 percent during 2010/11 to 41 percent in 2014/15. Table 4.8 details the above trend across selected levels of decision-making and shows significant improvement of gender inclusiveness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministers</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Commissioners</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judges</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members of Parliament</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of MCDGC

Despite these achievements there have been challenges. According to the local government structure, a village and street council is supposed to have about twenty-five members. The HBS 2012 community report indicates that some councils were found to have more than that amount. Table 4.9 and Figure 4.9 shows the percentages of village and street leaders by sex observed in 2007 and 2011/12. From 2007 to 2011/12, the table shows percentage increases of male leadership of the villages/streets in all areas. The percentage increase was highest in Dar es Salaam (15.6 percentage points) followed by other urban areas (10.8 percentage points) and lowest in rural areas (6.9 percentage points). This observation was below the expectations of gender balance policy. Thus, more efforts should be directed in addressing gender equality not only to ensure a balance representation at senior level but also at lower level of decision making. These observed challenges cannot be overcome without ensuring that all stakeholders play their role in attaining that goal of gender equity and gender equality,
for sustainable social and economic development. Also efforts should continue to ensure more accessibility to opportunities especially on education which has potential for sustaining long-term outcome of gender equity.

**Table 4.9: Percentage of Village/Mtaa Council Leadership by Sex and Areas, Tanzania Mainland, 2007 and 2011/12**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Male 2007</th>
<th>Female 2007</th>
<th>Total 2007</th>
<th>Male 2011/12</th>
<th>Female 2011/12</th>
<th>Total 2011/12</th>
<th>Male Leadership Percentage Change (points)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dar es Salaam</td>
<td>64.1</td>
<td>35.9</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>79.7</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>15.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Urban</td>
<td>76.9</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>87.7</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>83.5</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>90.4</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: HBS, 2012

**Prisoners in Remand for Two or More Years**

The other area that the government continued to focus was on processing of cases in order to reduce the number of people in remand thus addressing the problem of congestion in prison facilities. Congestion in remands and prisons is one of the issues and incidences of human rights violation during the period under review. Table 4.10 shows the number of prisoners in remand for two or more years for the period under review. It is apparent that number continued to increase.

**Table 4.10: Number of Prisoners in Remand for Two or More Years**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Prisoners</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>3,738</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>3,635</td>
<td>-2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>2,450</td>
<td>-32.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>6,398</td>
<td>161.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>6,506</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MoHA, 2015

Among the strategy that the government adopted to address the increase in the number of prisoners in remand was to reduce the time taken for arrangement of case hearing, especially the first hearing. Increase the number of human resource personnel, financial resources, supporting facilities as well as separation of
prosecution and investigation activities to different organs help to reduce the number of the time taken from arrangement to first hearing of cases as shown in Table 4.11.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Days</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: AG and DPP, 2015

There have been a number of issues that continued to undermine efforts aimed at reducing time from first hearing of cases. These issues can be categorized into three broad areas as follows:

**Broader Issues**

i. Engagement of different multi-players (multiplicity of stakeholders), which complicates the coordination process in case management.

ii. Increasing crimes involving human trafficking, cyber crimes, piracy, money laundering and terrorism which were not quite common and frequent occurring in the country.

iii. Administrative issues determine the effectiveness of the overall process of cases. These administrative issues include the management systems in Administration, Financial Management, Monitoring, Evaluation, Reporting and ICT are among fundamentals in the provision of services in every organization.

**Specific Issues**

i. Unwillingness of witness to appear in court and thus undermine case proceedings as well as existing of outdated laws regarding witness. Inadequate fund which lead to slow process of repealing some of the outdated laws.

ii. Lack and delay in proper supporting documents and reliable evidence that may be used to make decisions. Also delays of investigation procedures.

iii. Inadequate human resource (investigators, state attorneys, judges, etc) and skills among practitioners in the overall ladder of legal services to handle some legal technicalities.

iv. Insufficient with delays in disbursement of financial resources to accommodate state attorneys, investigators and witnesses to appear in court, as well as for incentives to state attorneys and other staffs.

v. Poor following-up on planned session schedules accompanied with delay of investigation procedures.
In order to address the issues identified here would require strengthening coordination among stakeholders or players involved in overall case proceedings and make them accountable in their respective areas. This should go hand in hand with enhancing financial resources and ensure equitable disbursement of funds to stakeholders involve in criminal justice basing on their needs.

Solution will also require strengthening the capacity of judiciary in terms of human resource particularly increasing the number of attorney, investigators and other staffs as well as capacity building that may focus more on among others training on emerging crimes and other crimes. On criminal offences, emphasis on trainings involving cyber crimes, money laundering and its predicated offences, terror financing, piracy, corruption, environmental cases, human trafficking, drugs and Gender Based violence (GBV) offences should be given more weight. Capacity building however, should also been accompanied with increased motivation and incentives. There is also scope to strengthen the use Information Communication Technology in the judiciary system.

Addressing these challenges will require conducting frequent witness educative campaigns to create awareness to the general public. Also, the civic education on of prosecutions ought to be given much emphasis as a way to reduce criminal offences and proper delivery of criminal justice to the public. The AGC should be provided with witness budget coupled with raising awareness to the general public on legal services offered free of charge by the AGC across the country.

National Legal and Regulatory Framework should be improved by undertaking reviews of outdated laws and regulations to match with social and economic reforms undertaken during the period under review.

**Birth Registration**

Civil registration or birth registration is a fundamental right of citizenship, and birth certificates are increasingly required for national identification and for registration of children in school. The registration is carried out primarily for the purpose of establishing the legal documents provided by law and are the best source of vital statistics.

It is a policy of the government to ensure that children receive their birth certificates within 90 days after birth. The target was to reach 80 percent of registration of birth within 90 days. During the period under review that is, 2011 - 2015, the government managed to register only 873,484 births which is equivalent to 10.6 percent of births registered within 90 days after birth (Table 4.12).

Apparently, there is a declining trend in this indicator. Some of the efforts to address this challenge include the Under Five Birth Registration Initiative in Temeke District, Mbeya and Mwanza Region. Since this is a long terms strategy, the plan is to extend the initiatives to other areas in the country.
Table 4.12: Trend of Births registered within 90 days after birth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Projected Annual Births*</th>
<th>Registered Births</th>
<th>% of Births Registered Within 90 days</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>1,638,533</td>
<td>251,630</td>
<td>15.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>1,645,917</td>
<td>186,374</td>
<td>11.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>1,650,845</td>
<td>169,851</td>
<td>10.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>1,653,469</td>
<td>165,585</td>
<td>10.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>1,655,017</td>
<td>100,044</td>
<td>6.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8,243,781</td>
<td>873,484</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* National Bureau of Statistics Projections

There have been a number of challenges faced during the period under review and that can be taken as lesson to inform future planning with regards to birth registration in the country as discussed below:

**Low Public Awareness**

Low public awareness on civil registration matters has been one among the critical issue that undermines registration of children during birth. The main cause here has been lack of understanding on the importance of having birth certificates as well as culture among communities. Allocated budget has not been sufficient to carry out mass awareness campaign and implement effectively Information, Education and Communication (IEC) Strategy.

**Lack of registration policy**

It is argued that apart from other mentioned constraints that undermine birth registrations in the country, lack of registration policy stands as a major factor to the noted low rate of registration. Current, there is no registration policy, what exists and used is the Births and Death registration Act in Registration. This law of registration does not link together issues of registration and other social services hence most of the citizens do not see the need of birth certificates. Lack of such a policy results in weak coordination among agencies and RITA, which is the primary registration agency. It is recommended that there is a need to develop a registration policy as well as to review the legal framework procedures and processes of delivering RITA services so as to enhance effectiveness.

**Shortage of manpower**

Shortage of human resources is also a factor that continued to undermines efforts that focused to enhance birth registration in the country. The insufficient number of human resources and training both at the headquarter and district level of the respective institutions i.e. RITA resulted to low capacity in number of staff to provide services effectively and efficiently. It is recommended that enough resources to allocated to enhance the capacity of RITA that may allow the institution to have at least one Assistant Registration Officer in each district.
Weak linkages among key stakeholders
The overall process of registration involves various key stakeholders across sectors (different ministries i.e. RITA under MoCAJ and Health facilities under MoHSW etc.) for which their fully participation determines the effectiveness of the process. However, there is a weak linkage among key stakeholders (RITA/health, local government, etc.) in providing registration services. There has been delays’ returning the registered birth forms from health facilities/local government and thus delays the completion process of registration. Also systems of individual organizations do not communicate RITA/NIDA/ Immigration, etc. Thus, it is recommended that the framework that guide the overall process to be strengthened as well as strengthening relationship and collaboration between registration sectors. Also, registration offices should be positioned at grass root levels closer to the community either at healthy facilities or at ward executive offices.

Payments of birth certificate fee
Payment of birth certificate fees is also another factor noted that continued to undermines the registration at birth. Most of birth occurs at home particularly in rural areas whereby majority in rural area are not able pay birth certificate fees, especially for late registered births. Low income and lack of knowledge are arguably to be the main cause. Thus, it is recommended that efforts to be directed to increase level of awareness and education so that births should be registered within 90 days after birth.

Apart from the above issues noted that requires more attention with regards to registration in the country, it is recommended also to prioritize the development and implementation of a viable and functional Civil Registration and Vital Statistics (CRVS system) for the next five years. CRVS is the continuous, permanent, compulsory and universal recording of the occurrence and characteristics of vital events of the population in accordance with the law. The system will register all key-life events – births, deaths, marriages and divorces, and enable the generation of quality vital statistics, including cause of death.

A well-functioning Civil Registration and Vital Statistics (CRVS) system plays a central role in governance and economic development of nations. It is also required for evidence-based, development and transformation of society which is in line efforts to formalize the informal sector. As such, the rationale of CRVS System:

i. Legal uses: Civil registration provides legal proof for identity and civil status (origin, date of birth, marriage or death). Also help determine rights to insurance benefits, child custody and tax deductions. Similarly, death records provide legal evidence.

ii. Administrative uses: Vital Statistics serve many administrative and governmental purposes. Such information is valuable to the electoral system for a national identification system of the citizens.
iii. Statistical uses: An effective civil registration and vital statistics system provides essential data, rates and other quantitative measures for the accurate planning of programmes and social development.

iv. Policy Making: Civil registration plays a significant role in establishing the appropriate institutional frameworks essential for the efficient management, operation and maintenance of development policy making in the country. It highlights the appropriate needs of the country’s citizen basing on the data obtained.

**Poor and Vulnerable Group**

In protecting the poor and vulnerable groups among communities the government during the period under review took the initiative to extend the already existed Productive Social Safety Net (PSSN) towards its third phase. The PSSN is a social protection initiative that aimed not only protecting the poor and vulnerable households but also to increase income and opportunities to these groups while improving their consumption. The identified households i.e. beneficiaries, benefited from a combination of basic and conditional cash transfers; receive cash transfer through participation in labor-intensive public works and advice and support concerning savings and investments.

During the period under review, cumulatively, 1,090,662 poor households were enrolled in the programme having 4,895,305 household members from different regions. The number of poor beneficiaries disaggregated by sex are shown in Table 4.13.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>MALE</th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>83,331</td>
<td>96,527</td>
<td>179,858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>374,738</td>
<td>441,870</td>
<td>816,608</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>1,803,959</td>
<td>2,094,880</td>
<td>3,898,839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,262,028</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,633,277</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,895,305</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source: TASAF, 2015**

Despite the above positive progress, several challenges were faced in the course of implementation of PSSN. Main challenges are as follows:

i) Limited financial resources to support all poor households living below the basic needs poverty line. PSSN supports 15 percent of the population while poor population is 28.2 percent.

ii) Inadequate financing of targeted infrastructure development (health facilities schools and water projects) to respond to demand for human capital development created by the implementation of CCT under PSSN.
iii) Poor connectivity in some local government authorities (LGA) to facilitate decentralization of MIS so that data capturing take place at LGA level.

iv) High levels of illiteracy among PSSN beneficiaries.

Based on this analysis, the following issues should be considered in the future PSSN policy.

i) **Scaling up of PSSN electronic Unified Registry of Beneficiaries (URB)** into a National Registry to support all social protection programs in order to avoid duplication of effort. Currently the PSSN Registry has detailed data of 6.5 million poor, vulnerable and food insecure population. The process will entail linking the PSSN Registry NIDA, RITA and other program registries and ultimately building a platform that establishes interfaces with the various program MIS in order to effectively link information on all Social Protection programs across the entire system of Social Protection in country.

ii) **Rollout of the Productive Inclusion (Livelihoods Enhancement) component** as a strategy to expedite graduation of targeted households out poverty. Poor households (around 1.1 million) currently provided with bimonthly cash benefits should be supported to make savings, join savings groups and implement various income generating activities to meet their needs as a sustainable mechanism of graduating from receiving Government transfers disbursed by PSSN.

iii) **Scale PSSN to reach the remaining 13.5 percent of the poor population.** Out of 28.2 percent of poor population living below the basic needs poverty line, PSSN currently supports only 15 percent.

iv) **Implementation of targeted infrastructure development community projects**, including schools, dispensaries, health centers and water schemes to address challenges of nutrition, health and education among poor population in order to improve human capital indicators and break intergeneration poverty cycle.

### 4.2.4. National and Personal Security and Safety of Properties

**Goal 4: Ensuring national and personal security and safety of properties**

Protection of national and personal security as well as ensuring safety of properties continued to be among the top agenda of the government for the period under review. Security and safety of properties is one among the factors that are catalyst for development in the country. In some instance, development literature considers security indicators as among key determinants of development in the country.
During the period under review, the government efforts focused on crime prevention—i.e. reduce and deter crime and criminals, as well as on law enforcement. Key interventions include increasing security network close to communities, using community policing approach, enhancement of supporting security facilities, infrastructure development as well as educative awareness campaigns. Among the outcome of these interventions is the observed decline of crimes in the country as shown in Table 4.13. However, traffic offense continued to increase significantly and thus calls for more strategic interventions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>s/n</th>
<th>Offense Category</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Against Person</td>
<td>11,364</td>
<td>11,049</td>
<td>11,206</td>
<td>11,335</td>
<td>11,166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(-2.8)</td>
<td>(1.4)</td>
<td>(1.2)</td>
<td>(-1.5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Against Property</td>
<td>68,527</td>
<td>50,863</td>
<td>46,773</td>
<td>45,470</td>
<td>43,803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(-25.8)</td>
<td>(-8.0)</td>
<td>(-2.8)</td>
<td>(-3.7)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Against Public Tranquility</td>
<td>14,499</td>
<td>14,140</td>
<td>14,786</td>
<td>16,414</td>
<td>15,179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(-2.5)</td>
<td>(4.6)</td>
<td>(11.0)</td>
<td>(-7.5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Traffic Offense</td>
<td>384,676</td>
<td>465,145</td>
<td>627,272</td>
<td>688,202</td>
<td>1,125,672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(20.9)</td>
<td>(34.9)</td>
<td>(9.7)</td>
<td>(63.6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MoHA, 2015

The following are challenges noted that continued to undermine efforts addressing and/or preventing crimes and safety of properties in the country:

i. Inadequate resources both human and financial resources to undertake planned activities that aimed at preventing and handling crime issues. This is also accompanied with poor working environment.

ii. Low capacity of existing staffs with poor data collection skills that may support the analytical skills of the information collected. This is also extended with lack of advances/modern investigative tools that may support handling newly and complex crimes in the current globalized network.

iii. Increase urbanization, poverty, unemployment and inequality, which are significantly been associated with incentive creation of crime among individuals with communities.

iv. Inadequate public awareness on support the communities are supposed to extend to law enforcers.

Based on these observations, the following are recommended to improve the performance in personal security and safety of properties:
i. The government needs to go beyond law enforcement and criminal justice to tackle the risk factors that cause crime because it is more cost effective and leads to greater social benefits than the standard ways of responding to crime. This involves promote primary prevention responses and define priorities for, and support research on, the causes, consequences, costs and prevention of violence.

ii. Enhance investigative capacity as well as capacity for collecting data on violence as well as continue ensuing there is an effective national action plan for violence prevention that have a monitoring framework.

iii. Strengthen responses for victims of violence and continue strengthening community policing especially in urban areas.

iv. Integrate violence prevention into social and educational policies, and thereby promote gender and social equality.

v. Increase collaboration and exchange of information on violence prevention across institutions within the country as well as within the region.

vi. Promote and monitor adherence to international treaties, laws and other mechanisms to protect human rights.

vii. Seek practical, internationally agreed responses to the global drugs and global arms trade.

viii. Promote safety and security policies in schools and urban areas.

4.2.5. Culture of Patriotism, Hard work, Moral Integrity, and Self-confidence

Goal 5: Promoting and preserving culture of patriotism, hard work, moral integrity, and self-confidence

This goal embeds in the equation of economic growth a dimension of patriotism, hardworking and integrity. Studies have shown these aspects to help countries, e.g. China, to achieve significant development progress. The government during the period under review continued to acknowledge the role of having culture of patriotism, hardworking, moral integrity and self-confidence in transforming the country’s development. The government took various initiatives as discussed below:

Patriotism, Hardworking and Self-Confidence

During the period under review the government re-introduced the national services widely known as JKT that focus on equipping young generation, especially those graduating from secondary schools, with patriotism, hardworking, integrity and entrepreneurship skills. The government has made JKT mandatory to secondary schools’ graduates before joining higher learning education.
Significant progress has been achieved in terms of enrolment whereas the number increased from 4,667 in 2010/11 to 40,082 in 2014/15. Graduates from such program are equipped with skills that allow them to acquire or create self-employment as well as employed by the government and other private institutions, especially for those whom do not plan for further studies. Other interventions focused at enhancing self-employment among youth especially graduates through training on entrepreneurship skills. During the period under review, the government in collaboration with other stakeholders managed to train 35,325 graduates from higher learning institutions. The government also created a total of 1,929,938 employments to graduates in different sectors.

Despite recording some progress by introducing several initiatives to promote and preserve patriotism, hardworking and self-confidence in the country, there have been quite a number of challenges faced which require more attention for better outcome in the future. These are outlined below:

i. Globalization and urbanization continued to expose societies into the external culture and norms, which some could be constructive and others destructive. Such challenges are rooted down at family level where parent-hoods is key in determine the future generation of the country and thus calls for educative and awareness raising campaigns to communities on areas that are generally perceived or noted to destruct cultural values.

ii. Lack of enough resources, both financial and human resources, to undertake planned activities. Thus, more resources need to be allocated to respective institutions as well as creating incentive mechanism to staffs especially to those working in underserved areas.

iii. Some of the media programs and broadcasting continued to contribute to undermine local values. There is a need to ensure laws, regulations are effectively enforced, and institutions and regulatory authorities strengthened in order to enable them undertake their roles smoothly.

Declaration of Assets and Liabilities

The other area that the government continued to direct its efforts during the period under review is with respect to integrity of public leaders. Section 9 of the Public Leadership Code of Ethics Act requires public Leaders to give an official statement of their assets and liabilities, of the spouse and children under 18 years who are unmarried. Declaration should be made within thirty days after being appointed or elected in the post, at the end of the year and at the end of tenure of office of a leader. When issuing the Declaration, a leader should also specify the property value, and how s/he had acquired those properties including liabilities if any. The declaration is submitted to the Ethics Commissioner before or by 31 December each year. In the period of 2010 to 2015, there were significant improvement in filling and submitting forms of Declaration of Assets and Liabilities (Table 4.14).
Table 4.14: Declaration of Assets and Liabilities, 2010-2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>No of Forms Issued</th>
<th>No. of Forms Received</th>
<th>Received (%)</th>
<th>No. of Forms not Received</th>
<th>Not Received (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009/2010</td>
<td>7819</td>
<td>5677</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>2142</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/2011</td>
<td>9015</td>
<td>7904</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1,111</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/2012</td>
<td>8972</td>
<td>7924</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1,048</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/2013</td>
<td>9505</td>
<td>9155</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/2014</td>
<td>13223</td>
<td>11,584</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1639</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/2015</td>
<td>13753</td>
<td>12,278</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>1475</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ethics Secretariat, September 2015

Table 4.14 shows that there was a notable progress in declaration of assets and liabilities of public leaders annually. The improvement in declaration is a result of awareness campaign to public leaders on importance of undertaking such exercise. The secretariat is conducting regular education awareness camping so as public leaders adhere with the Public Leadership Code of Ethics Act.

Despite of the notable progress, the challenge has been on the support on working tools, environment and adequate resources to the institutions responsible for enhancing integrity among public leaders. Among the proposed area for improvement are:

i. Create and strengthen national values and make it part of the community in order to prevent the erosion of ethics in the country by recommending inclusion of the ethics subject in the curriculum from primary schools to universities;

ii. Promote and strengthen systems of ethics from the family level to the national level, as ethical leaders are the result of ethical society;

iii. Continue to promote and monitor leadership ethics by implementing various guidelines, systems, mechanisms, procedure and existing programmes on performance management; conducting investigation, verification of assets and liabilities, and to strengthen M&E systems;

iv. Strengthen the capacity of Ethics Tribunal by providing training to members of the Tribunal on matters concerning case management in international standards;

v. Enhance Human Resources and Financial capacity as well as improve working environment such as Ethics Secretariat’s office buildings to those Zones thus bringing the Institution’s services closer to the people;

vi. Improve legal infrastructure i.e. finalize the review of PLCEA and preparation of Conflict of interest Act.
4.3. Progress in Public Sector Reforms Under Governance And Accountability

Since the 1990s, Tanzania has been implementing several reforms. By the end of 2014/15, some core reform programmes have already to come to an end. These include Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP), Local Government Reform Programme (LGRP), Legal Sector Reform Programme (LSRP), National Anti-Corruption Strategy Action Plan (NACSAP) and Agricultural Sector Development Programme (ASDP). Currently, these reforms have prepared concept papers for future phase of reforms based on the recommendations made from the Assessment Report of the Reforms Implementation in Tanzania; the study which was done in the year 2013. However, an improved and more inclusive National Anti-Corruption Strategy Action Plan (NACSAP) will start new phase of implementation this financial year 2015/16. Thus, this section highlights the achievements and challenges encountered by the core reform programmes as follow:

4.3.1. Public Financial Management Reform Programme (PFMRP-IV)

The programme aimed at addressing three key major developmental issues which are:

i. **Fiscal sustainability and balance in the public economy**, where by economic growth and poverty reduction achieved through policy-based budget management and resource mobilization and allocation, improved fiscal discipline and sustainable budget balance;

ii. **Restructuring and reallocation for growth and poverty alleviation**, whereby Service delivery improvement through the introduction of results-based management, program based budgets, accountability and performance audits is underscored;

iii. **Improved Public Sector Performance**, efficiency and effectiveness, in public administration leading improved service delivery through improved transparency, accountability and efficient controls.

The Programme focused on 6 Key Result Areas (KRAs) of the PFM system; 1) Revenue Management, 2) Budget and Planning, 3) Budget execution, Transparency and Accountability, 4) Budget control and Oversight, 5) Change Management, Programme monitoring and Communication 6) Local Government Reform Sub programme (recently added). To some extent, the programme has been adequately enhancing revenue mobilization, planning and budgeting, transparency, accountability, efficiency and effectiveness in the use of resources and implementation.
4.3.2. Business Environment Strengthening in Tanzania (BEST-ROAD MAP)

The Government approved the Roadmap for improvement of Business Environment and Investment Climate in Tanzania on 1st July 2010 where Prime Minister’s Office was tasked to coordinate its implementation. The following is the progress made:

i. In collaboration with the Ministry of Land, Housing and Human Settlement Development, the land services access has been improved.

ii. In collaboration with the Ministry responsible for industrial development, procedures for business initiation have been improved.

iii. Through Private Sector Collaboration Program, (PSCP), 230 government employees from various institutions were trained in different skills to build their capacities.

iv. Promotion on the use of EFD as well as undertaking negotiation with business owner’s community in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance.

v. In collaboration with the Ministry of Transportation the discussion on the road transportation of goods and passengers Contracts between Tanzania and Zambia were conducted.

vi. Participating in the forum for Ease of Doing Business Initiative (EDBI) for Eastern and Southern of Africa which was held at Kampala, Uganda between 11 – 13 May, 2015

4.3.3. Financial Sector Reform Program (FSRP II)

The programme, among others things, is responsible for financial sector deepening and it covers issues related to insurance, banking, housing mortgage, social security and macro and micro financing to facilitate easy access to financial services by the majority of Tanzanians. Furthermore, the programme through financial Sector Support Project has been strengthening legal, regulatory and operational infrastructure of the financial sector as well as informing other laws that had an impediment to increased lending by banks. In addition, the programme is on the way to design mechanism for managing estate development in order to ensure quality of newly developed settlements.

4.3.4. Future Direction of Reforms – Challenges and Way Forward

Major challenges encountered in the period under review include inadequate funds for implementation following lack of DP contribution; and delays in disbursement of funds from both Development Partners and Government. This provides a lesson that reforms should be home-grown and home-driven. With this, it is expected that, future reforms should focus on the following;
(i) Align and Contribute to the National Development Initiatives such as Vision 2025, Five year Development Plan etc.

(ii) Make use ICT to promote E-Government and facilitate Government Businesses and transactions

(iii) Make use of the Recommendations from the Reforms Assessment conducted in 2013 particularly on Management of Reforms (aspects of Design, Financing, Implementing, Governance, Coordination and M&E).
Chapter V: Review of MKUKUTA II Financing

5.1. Overview

Since 2005, Tanzania budget progress and allocation has been significantly influenced by MKUKUTA framework. The budgeting processes involved categorizing the MKUKUTA and non-MKUKUTA activities. As noted since the introduction chapter, MKUKUTA I & II were built on three clusters, namely, Growth for Reduction of Income Poverty; Improved Quality of life and Social Well being; and Good Governance and Accountability. In each Cluster, there are broad outcomes for which a set of goals is defined. Under each goal, there are operational targets, which are achieved through cluster strategies and intervention packages. These cluster strategies and intervention packages entailed aligning sector strategies, programs and projects and LGAs plans hence a comprehensive financing framework. This chapter review progress and challenges in MKUKUTA II financing.

5.2 Review of Implementation of Budget and Financing Framework of MKUKUTA II

5.2.1. Review of Budget Process

The main instrument for financing MKUKUTA II is the Government Budget; a tool for implementing Government policy and decisions to achieve economic, social and political goals. This section highlights the budget processes which were followed during MKUKUTA financing processes. This process involved four key steps namely preparation; negotiation/allocation; implementation; and monitoring and evaluation (Figure 5.1).

5.2.2. Budget Preparation

During MKUKUTA I and II implementation process, the subsequent year budget preparation process starts by first preparing the Plan and Budget Guidelines (PBG) document. PBG is the main Government framework for resource mobilization and allocation which provides directives and the strategic vision for revenue and expenditure as well as priority areas for implementation in the medium term. More specifically, Budget Guidelines provide: Instructions for plans and budget preparation; Key responsibilities of all Accounting Officers;

---

8 In 2011, Mainland Tanzania launched the Long Term Perspective Plan (LTPP) spanning 2011/2012 to 2025/2026 which is being implemented in three sequential Five Year Development Plans (FYDPs) with the first covering the period 2011/2012 to 2015/2016. In effort to synchronize formulation of subsequent MKUKUTA (III) and FYDP (II) in terms of time frame in order to maximize on their synergies and accelerate achievement of TDV 2025, MKUKUTA II implementation period was extended for one year, up to 2015/2016, to coincide with the terminal year of FYDP I implementation.
Important issues to be considered during the budget preparation including priority areas and targets as stipulated under MKUKUTA II; and the medium term resource envelop which includes both revenue and expenditure estimates. The Annual Plans and Budget Guidelines are prepared taking into account the Tanzania Development Vision (TDV) 2025, the Tanzania Five Year Development Plan 2011/12– 2015/16 including priorities set under the Big Results Now (BRN) initiative, and priorities outlined in MKUKUTA II.

**Figure 5.1: Budget Process**

Source: Ministry of Finance

The objectives of the Government budgets for 2010/11-2014/15 were: addressing the challenges of reducing income poverty; continued improvement of domestic revenue collection mechanism; ensuring that revenues from retention schemes are collected appropriately and remitted to the Consolidated Fund Services. Others include allocating resources to areas that stimulate economic growth; accelerating implementation of Public Private Partnership Act in order to widen opportunities for co-financing development projects, and implementing public sector reforms including continued strengthening of public finance management. During the same period, budget preparation tools and processes such as the Medium term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), the Strategic Budget Allocation System (SBAS) at the MDAs level and PlanRep at LGAs level were strengthened and realigned with MKUKUTA II to guide budget allocation and transparency. Furthermore, the Government changed the budget cycle in 2014/15 in order to allow passing the Finance Bill as early as possible in order to avoid delays in disbursement of funds for implementing the budget for respective year.
5.2.3. Resource Mobilization 2010-2015

Mobilization of financial resources is an important aspect of effective implementation of Plans. One of the key challenges to PBG was ascertaining the amount of funds that can be mobilized from different sources for budgeting execution. The sources of finance for recurrent and development expenditures included: domestic tax revenue; non-tax revenue (dividends, royalty, fees and licenses, property tax, penalties); domestic borrowing; grants and concessional loans from both bilateral and multilateral sources and borrowing from external non-concessional sources (Figure 5.2).

![Figure 5.2: Structure of Central Government Revenue Sources](image)

### i) Domestic Revenue Performance

Government budgetary operations in 2010/11-2014/15 were generally characterized by shortfall in domestic revenue collections resulting to a lower than projected government spending. The average domestic revenue collection in that period was 93 percent of the planned estimates. The worst performance was in 2013/14 where Government aimed at collecting tax and non-tax revenue amounting to TZS 11,154 billion but collected TZS 9,937.8 billion. This amount was equivalent to 89 percent of annual estimate. The general performance is shown in Figure 5.3.
Underperformance was mainly due to reliance on unsustainable sources such as alcoholic beverages and cigarettes which change with changing consumer behavior; tax exemptions; tax avoidance/evasion; existence of large informal sector; narrow tax base; political, institutional and capacity constraints in property tax administration; resistance by some traders to use EFD machines; and failure to realize expected revenue from some new tax measures particularly excise duty on Simcards and money transfers.

It is also noted that, domestic revenue collection was still far below the required level to finance MKUKUTA interventions. Inadequate domestic revenue has been the main challenge in many Ministries hence hindering smooth implementation of MKUKUTA activities. Generally over years, domestic revenue has been increasing (Figure 5.4). However, Government expenditure on the other hand has been increasing at a faster rate, thus causing widening of the resource gap (fiscal deficit).

The generic means of closing the gap have been grants and concessional borrowing from developed nations, external non-concessional borrowing and domestic borrowing. Each source has its own repercussions in terms of accessibility. Support from Development Partners is not predictable, domestic borrowing is tied with a cap of one percent of GDP with the view to avoiding crowding out private investment; external non concessional borrowing has high interest rate and mostly of short maturity among other conditionality. Thus, domestic revenue is the only reliable and dependable source of financing projects/programs that are aimed at meeting MKUKUTA targets.
ii) External Grants and Concessional Loans

A key issue in Government resources is predictability of General Budget Support (GBS) and Sector Budget Support (SBS: un-earmarked) from development partners (DPs), to enable Government prepare a more predictable budget. The review period was characterized by fluctuations in external loans and grants as narrated below.

The GBS disbursement in 2010/11 amounted to TZS 928.3 billion, 13.0 percent higher than the budget estimates. The actual disbursement for 2010/11 surpassed the estimate mainly due to increase in financial support from Canada whose pledge was more than doubled from the initial pledge of TZS 17,771.5 million to TZS 37,090 million. Another reason for surpassing the budget estimates was due to exchange rate depreciation. Again, out of the actual total budget support (GBS) received in 2010/11, TZS 726,524 million was budget support grant, equivalent to 78.3 percent of the total GBS for the period and 15.0 percent above the estimate for the period. Budget support loan accounted for 22.3 percent of the total budget support and was also above the period estimates by 6.3 percent. Total grants (budget support and project grants) received during the year 2010/11 amounted to TZS 1,655,752 million, however fell short of donor’s commitments by 11.2 percent due to delays in disbursements of foreign project funds, project execution and delays in data reporting of direct-to-projects funds.

The GBS disbursement in 2011/12 decreased by 1.3 percent from TZS 928.3 billion.
billion disbursed in 2010/11 to TZS 916.381 billion. Nonetheless, the total budget support disbursed was 5.4 percent higher than the budget estimates of TZS 869.414 billion for 2011/12. Surpassing budget estimates was due to increased level of Development Partners (DPs) in terms of meeting their commitment and increased level of discretionary resources available to the Government for MKUKUTA II implementation. The actual disbursement for 2010/11 surpassed the estimate mainly due to increase in budget support loans as well as exchange rate depreciation. Out of the actual total budget support (GBS) received in 2011/12, TZS 676,062 million was budget support grant, equivalent to 73.4 percent of the total GBS for the period and 4.0 percent below the estimate for the period. The underperformance was on account of Euro zone debt crisis. Budget support loan accounted for 26.6 percent of the total budget support and was also above the period estimates by 44.3 percent\(^\text{10}\).

Total program grants and loans (GBS) for 2012/13 surpassed the target by 7 percent to TZS 898.6 billion, compared to the annual estimate of TZS 842.487 billion. This was 1.9 percent lower than TZS 916.381 billion disbursed in 2011/12. The actual disbursement for 2012/13 surpassed the estimate mainly due to increase in budget support loans as well as exchange rate depreciation. Out of the actual total budget support (GBS) received in 2012/13, TZS 539.799 billion was budget support grant, equivalent to 60.1 percent of the total GBS for the period but 13.0 percent below the estimate for the period. The underperformance was on account of Euro zone debt crisis. Budget support loan accounted for 39.9 percent of the total budget support\(^\text{11}\).

During Financial Year 2013/14, the Government expected to receive TZS 3,855.8 billion from Development Partners, of which TZS 1,163 billion were programme loans and grants, TZS 500 billion was basket funds, and TZS 2,192 project loans and grants. The actual amount received was TZS 2,791.5 billion, equivalent to 72 percent of commitment. The shortfall in project funds was attributed to a slow pace in project implementation and delays in reporting project performance by some implementing agencies which in turn affected disbursement. During 2013/14, the Government received grants and loans through General Budget Support (GBS) amounting to TZS 1,040.7 billion which was 89 percent of the annual estimate and 14.3 percent less than the amount received during FY 2012/13. Out of the actual total budget support (GBS) disbursed during FY 2013/14, TZS 514.5 billion was budget support grant, equivalent to 49.4 percent of the total GBS for the period and 16.0 percent below the estimate for the period. Budget support loan was 14 percent below the target. On the other hand, in most cases, concessional loans are tied to specific projects/programs with some conditionality. During 2013/14, Basket Funds, received amounted to

\(^{10}\text{MAIR 2011/12 (MKUKUTA Annual Implementation Report 2011/12), Ministry of Finance}\)

\(^{11}\text{MAIR 2012/13 (MKUKUTA Annual Implementation Report 2012/13), Ministry of Finance}\)
TZS. 376.8 billion, equivalent to 75 percent of annual estimates of TZS 500.4 billion. In addition, project loans and grants amounting to TZS 1,374 billion were received, equivalent to 63 percent of annual estimates\textsuperscript{12}.

For the FY 2014/15, the Government had expected to receive the sum of TZS 2,941.5 billion as grants and concessional loans from Development Partners. Until April 2015, the actual budget support contributions received amounted to TZS 408 billion, which is equivalent to 44 percent of the annual projections of TZS 922.2 billion. Until April 2015, the Government received TZS 289.5 billion for Basket Funds, equivalent to 106 percent of the annual estimates. Further, TZS 1,117 billion equivalent to 64 percent of the annual targets of TZS 1,745.5 was received as grants and concessional loans to negotiation procedures. Grants and concessional loans were expected to amount to 70 percent of the annual targets by June 30, 2015\textsuperscript{13}. During the period under review, the Government continued to negotiate with development partners and other lending institutions, including banks in order to ensure that committed funds were fully available on time as programmed.

\textit{iii) External Non-Concessional Loans}

Non-Concessional loans have increased consecutively in the past five years. In FY 2010/11, the non-concessional was TZS 153.9 billion though it multiplied more than 7 times reaching TZS 1,156.4 billion in 2013/14. Also, during FY 2014/15 the government planned to borrow US dollar 800 million equivalents to TZS 1,320 billion from external sources to finance development projects. The external non-concessional loans were mainly received from Credit Suisse Bank for financing roads, water and railway projects, from Citi Bank to finance power generation projects under TANESCO and from HSBC\textsuperscript{14} Bank under the Export Credit Arrangement for financing the expansion of the Julius Nyerere International Airport – Terminal III project. The trend of non-concessional borrowing is shown in Figure 5.5.

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[12] MAIR 2013/14 (MKUKUTA Annual Implementation Report 2013/14), Ministry of Finance
\item[13] Budget Speech 2015/16, Ministry of Finance
\item[14] HSBC is the short form for Hongkong and Shanghai Banking Corporation
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
iv) Domestic Commercial Loans
During the past five years, the Government has continued borrowing from domestic markets through bank borrowing and through issuance of short-term treasury bills and bonds in order to finance its budget. The amount borrowed fluctuated over the period depending on the requirement as indicated in Table 5.1.

Table 5.1: Domestic Commercial Loans 2010-2015 in TZS Billion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Year</th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15*</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-Bank Borrowing/ roll over</td>
<td>720.2</td>
<td>1,326.9</td>
<td>1,734.5</td>
<td>1,528.2</td>
<td>2,265.7</td>
<td>1,515.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bank Borrowing</td>
<td>1,244.3</td>
<td>334.9</td>
<td>1,069.3</td>
<td>976.7</td>
<td>689.6</td>
<td>863.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Commercial Loans in TZS Billion</td>
<td>1,964.6</td>
<td>1,661.7</td>
<td>2,803.9</td>
<td>2,504.9</td>
<td>2,955.2</td>
<td>2,378.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Represents the likely actual amount at the end the year
Source: Ministry of Finance

5.2.4. Resource Allocation 2010-2015
During the implementation of MKUKUTA II, the allocations of financial resources to all components of the budget were guided through the application of Strategic Budget Allocation System (SBAS) for MDAs and Regions while Plan-Rep was applied to LGAs. Further, analysis of financial disbursement to each cluster of
MKUKUTA II was conducted every year by using Budget Data Analysis Tool (BUDATO) with a view of understanding the mileage of implementing MKUKUTA II.

**i) Allocations between MKUKUTA and NON_MKUKUTA**

The cost of implementing MKUKUTA II interventions was articulated to be at TZS 34.4 trillion for the period of five years. This was established using estimated share of domestic revenue in which the shares of domestic revenue to MKUKUTA II were assumed to increase annually from 60.7 percent in 2010/11 to a share of 84.4 percent by 2014/15. Consequently, the average domestic revenue that connected to MKUKUTA II was considered as the least cost of implementing MKUKUTA II, which was at TZS 6.9 trillion per annum.

During the period of five year (2010/11 – 2014/15), the competition of meager government resources was somehow tense between MKUKUTA interventions and NON-MKUKUTA which covered all interventions that are not related to MKUKUTA. In the period under review, the Government approved total allocation of financial resources to MKUKUTA II amounted to TZS 57.4 trillion being higher than the estimated minimal cost by 66.9 percent. This figure show that the implementation of MKUKUTA II was annually allocated financial resources at an average of TZS 11.5 trillion from the budget.

In the first two years, there was an increasing share of resource allocation in favour of MKUKUTA II against to what was directed to NON-MKUKUTA intervention. The share of resource allocation to MKUKUTA II peaked up to 75.5 percent in 2011/12 from the ratio of 73.2 percent in 2010/11 (Table 5.2). The increase in the share of resource allocated to MKUKUTA II reflected the government’s commitment towards attaining operational targets aligned to boosting the share of development budget as well as over performance of domestic revenue during the fiscal year. These interventions were related to the following priority areas such as water; infrastructure (railways, ports, airports and roads); electricity; agriculture and irrigation.

On the contrary, in the period after 2011/12 towards the end of implementation, the share of the budget directed towards financing MKUKUTA II showed a declining trend to 70.9 percent of the total budget in 2014/15 from a ratio of 75.5 percent recorded in 2011/12. The decline in the share of financing MKUKUTA was due to the increasing financial needs for NON-MKUKUTA which emanated from important national activities such as Population and Housing census, Constitutional review and National ID projects. As a result, the share of NON-MKUKUTA allocation from the total budget increased and stood at an average of 26.1 percent.
### Table 5.2: Budgetary Allocations of Resources to MKUKUTA and Other 2010/11 - 2014/15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MKUKUTA</td>
<td>8,494.2</td>
<td>10,207.0</td>
<td>11,218.2</td>
<td>13,362.0</td>
<td>14,079.0</td>
<td>57,360.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster I</td>
<td>3,810.4</td>
<td>4,914.0</td>
<td>4,413.7</td>
<td>5,339.0</td>
<td>5,710.8</td>
<td>24,187.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster II</td>
<td>3,374.9</td>
<td>3,857.4</td>
<td>4,652.9</td>
<td>5,639.0</td>
<td>6,067.0</td>
<td>23,591.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster III</td>
<td>1,181.6</td>
<td>1,313.1</td>
<td>1,921.4</td>
<td>2,345.0</td>
<td>1,748.8</td>
<td>8,509.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross Cutting</td>
<td>127.3</td>
<td>122.5</td>
<td>230.2</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>552.4</td>
<td>1,071.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NON-MKUKUTA</td>
<td>3,115.3</td>
<td>3,318.9</td>
<td>3,973.7</td>
<td>4,887.0</td>
<td>5,774.4</td>
<td>21,069.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>11,609.5</td>
<td>13,525.9</td>
<td>15,191.9</td>
<td>18,249.0</td>
<td>19,853.4</td>
<td>78,429.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Finance

**ii) Cluster-wise Allocation**

In the analysis of resource allocation within the MKUKUTA II, for each cluster resource was allocated according to their importance during the period. In 2011/12, Government directed more resources to cluster I while leaving the other two clusters with less shares compared to preceding fiscal year. The high increase in cluster I’s resource allocation was consistent with government policy of promoting economic growth by improving economic infrastructure services and productive sectors. This policy did not only affect the other two clusters but also led to a substantial decline in the share of non-MKUKUTA allocation. In the subsequent years, the allocated share of cluster I within MKUKUTA resources dropped drastically to 39.3 percent in 2012/3 from a ratio of 48.1 percent in 2011/12 being a partial reverse of the policy and later maintaining shares around the same ratio to the end of implementation.

In cluster II, Government continued to deliver social services to the public with the intention of enhancing quality of life and social wellbeing. However, in 2011/12 the share of resources allocation to cluster II within the allocated resources to MKUKUTA decreased to 37.8 percent from a ratio of 39.7 percent in 2010/11. This decline in the share of resources allocated to Cluster II was attributed by Government decision to shift resources to Cluster I after completion of heavy investments in education and water sectors. In the fiscal years after 2011/12 to the end of MKUKUTA II, government committed more resources to cluster II to address the challenges of improving social services delivery to the public.

Similarly, cluster III enjoyed the same pattern as of cluster II in which a slight drop in share of resources allocated within the MKUKUTA was observed in
2011/12 to 12.9 from allocated resource share of 13.9 in 2010/11. The slight increase in the share of resource allocation within the MKUKUTA reflected the government efforts of enhancing rule of law and good governance by financing various interventions related to legal reforms. In general, the larger share of allocated resources to MKUKUTA was directed to cluster I that accounted for an average of 42.2 percent followed by cluster II which commanded an average of 41.1 percent of total resources to MKUKUTA intervention and the residual amount was shared with cluster III and cross-cutting.

Table 5.3: Budgetary Allocation within MKUKUTA II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MKUKUTA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster I</td>
<td>44.9</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>40.6</td>
<td>42.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster II</td>
<td>39.7</td>
<td>37.8</td>
<td>41.5</td>
<td>42.2</td>
<td>43.1</td>
<td>41.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cluster III</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>12.9</td>
<td>17.1</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>14.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross Cutting</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Finance

**iii) Sectoral Allocation**

In the period of 2010 to 2015, Government allocated resources to sectors according to the guidance of national budget guidelines with a view of attaining Tanzania Development Vision 2025 (TDV 2025) goals. As a means of achieving these TDV 2025 goals, the government focused more at priorities set in MKUKUTA II as well as in Five Year Development Plan. The priorities were considered to be the ones that could bring quick result in attaining TDV 2025 goals and consequently reduction of income poverty in the country. Among the sectors that were considered to be priority areas included: agriculture; education; water; health; energy and minerals; transport; and works.

Agricultural sector experienced a seemingly increasing resource allocation from the budget for the period of MKUKUTA II implementation in absolute term but in share of total budget estimate showed a falling ratio. The government allocated TShs 1,084.7 billion to the agricultural sector in 2014/15, amount which was higher by 20.0 percent of resource that was allocated to the sector of TShs 903.8 billion in 2010/11. However, as a share of approved budget to agriculture, it showed a falling trend from 7.8 percent of the budget in 2010/11 to a ratio of 5.5 percent in 2014/15. The allocated resources to the sector were intended to continue implementation of various agricultural programmes for the purpose of increasing productivity in agricultural products. Among the programmes under the agricultural sector included ASDP; DASIP; EA Agricultural Productivity Programme; SAGCOT Project; Accelerated Food Security Project; Expanded Rice Production and Livestock Disease Control. In actual facts, the low
productivity in the agricultural products was a result of this declining resource allocation to agricultural sector.

Similarly, the same pattern of experience to agricultural sector was observed to social service delivery sectors in which Government allocated resources in declining shares of the budget to education and health, while water sector did not change much. In the five years of MKUKUTA II, government had continuously reduced the share of allocated resources to education sector from 19.2 percent in 2010/11 to a ratio of 17.5 percent in 2014/15 which was obscured by the increase of the allocation from TZS 2,227.3 billion in 2010/11 to the approved allocation of TZS 3,127.9 billion in 2014/15. Likewise, health sector’s allocation increased by 31.7 percent to TZS 1,588.2 billion in 2014/15 from the parliamentary approved allocation of 1,205.9 billion in 2010/11 whereas the ratio fell from 10.4 percent to 8.0 percent. The resource to water sector increased by 75.8 percent to 665.1 billion in 2014/15 from an allocation of TZS 378.3 billion in 2010/11, although the ratio to approved budget stood at 3.3 percent.

On the contrary, the energy, transport and works sectors enjoyed increasing annual resource allocations which were approved by the parliament. The reason for increasing more resources to these sectors was due to the fact that they were regarded among the key sectors for the country’s economic growth and development. The government increased drastically the resource allocation to energy sector to TZS 1,090.6 billion in 2014/15 from the allocation of TZS 327.2 billion in 2010/11. The increased allocation to the energy sector was intended to increase capacity of power generation, transmission and distribution in order to reduce the challenge of power rationing facing the country. The transport sector’s resource allocation increased by 40.0 percent to TZS 2,109.0 billion in 2014/15 from an allocation of TZS 1,505.1 billion in 2010/11, an increase that was in line with the government’s effort of invest in transport infrastructures in the country.

5.3. Budget Implementation 2010-2015

In the period of 2010 to 2015, the fiscal policy focused on the financing of interventions that were identified and prioritized in Five year Development Plan and MKUKUTA II, with the objectives of attaining TDV 2025 goals. The annual budget execution was used as means of achieving those two strategies in meeting the national goals of increasing economic growth and reduction of poverty. For the past five fiscal years, budget execution undesirably performed below the budgetary estimates with annual average of 11.6 percent. The impressive performance of budget execution was observed in the first and third years of implementing MKUKUTA II in which the performance reached 95 percent and 93 percent of budgetary estimate of the total expenditure, respectively.
Table 5.4: Performance and Growth of Total Expenditure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010/11</th>
<th>2011/12</th>
<th>2012/13</th>
<th>2013/14</th>
<th>2014/15</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Actual Expenditure in Billion of Tshs</td>
<td>9,300.2</td>
<td>10,764.5</td>
<td>12,714.2</td>
<td>14,011.1</td>
<td>14,939.4</td>
<td>61,729.4</td>
<td>12,345.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As Percent of Budget Estimate</td>
<td>95.0</td>
<td>86.0</td>
<td>93.0</td>
<td>81.0</td>
<td>86.9</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth rate (%)</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>15.7</td>
<td>18.1</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>12.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Finance

The worst performance of budget execution, during the last five years of implementation, appeared in 2013/14 in which total expenditure reached at 81 percent of budget estimate for the fiscal year. The most impressive performance in the execution of the budget was observed in 2010/11, whereby actual total expenditure reached a level of 95 percent of budget estimate. During the implementation period of five years, recurrent expenditure happened to command about an average of 70 percent of total expenditure leaving 30 percent to development expenditure, this pattern appeared most to favour cluster II of the MKUKUTA which largely depends on recurrent expenditure. The impressive performance was manifested on recurrent expenditure which received enough resource for execution on average to a level above 90 percent of recurrent expenditure estimate while development expenditure was on average below 80 percent.

Most of the time, underperformance of budget execution was manifested into a form of under-spending in the approved budgetary expenditure in the past five years. The under-spending was caused by a shortfall in both domestic revenue collections and receipt of external resources. In the case of underperformance in the development expenditure, which had a focus on addressing infrastructure challenges by improving transport, communication, irrigation and power/energy infrastructures, was due to untimely and slow disbursement of foreign project funds in development budget from Development partners. Similarly, budget execution experienced a shortfall in realization of external non-concessional borrowing as well as underperformance of domestic revenue collection, which starved the approved budget of financing resources.

In general, budget execution during MKUKUTA II’s implementation faced a problem of having resource shortage in financing budgeted activities as approved by the Parliament. As MKUKUTA II was supposed to have total budgetary allocation of TZS 78,429.7 billion for the past five years while the actual total budgetary expenditure amounted to TZS 61,729.4 billion, which is below by
21.3 percent of the MKUKUTA's plan. The shortfall in resources was due to insufficient domestic revenue especially non-tax revenue collection by the MDAs and LGAs as well as unsatisfactory disbursement of external aid and borrowing.

5.4. Budget Reporting and Transparency

Policy and Budget transparency is a prerequisite for public participation and accountability in achieving common national development agenda as stipulated in Tanzania Development Vision 2025 and its subsequent implementation strategies namely MKUKUTA II and FYDP I. Needless to say, budget transparency is a key in building up trust and understanding between the government and other stakeholders such as Development partners, Members of Parliament and the general public. In that regard, the Government made significant progress in reforms that are geared towards enhancing budget transparency especially in the areas of budget formulation, implementation and reporting.

During the period of MKUKUTA II implementation, the Government had been in the forefront of being transparent and follows all procedures of budget cycle which involved budget planning, formulation, implementation, evaluation and reporting from both central and local levels of authorities. The aim of this was to ensure that the available meager public resources were utilized efficiently and effectively in achieving the national aspirations of TDV 2025 through MKUKUTA II and Five year Development Plan. Also, budget processing had been transparent to all citizens through various channels/means of communication which were used in reporting different stages of the budget cycle.

During budget formulation, annual budgets were prepared according to annual Planning and Budgeting Guidelines with explicit coded linkage to MKUKUTA and Five Year Development Plan for the period 2011/12-2015/16. The coding system has been upgraded from EPICOR 7 to EPICOR 9 making line item classification even more detailed. Further, stakeholders such as DPs, MPs, CSOs, FBOs were involved through the PER process to provide inputs into the Planning and budgeting process. Indeed, PER dialogue fora facilitate implementation of MKUKUTA II through Cluster Working Groups. During preparation, MDAs, RS and LGAs link their institutional targets with relevant MKUKUTA II cluster strategies. The linkage enables one to generate reports containing resource allocations to MKUKUTA II clusters.

In the case of reporting, the Government had produced annually Budget Background and Medium Term Framework (BBMTF) which serves as a “narrative cover” for the traditional budget books (Volumes I, II, III and IV). The description of the volumes are as follow: Volume 1 of the Budget Estimates covers revenue measures and estimates, Volume II detailed recurrent budget estimates of central government MDAs, Volume III detailed recurrent budget estimates of regional offices of the central government, and Volume IV detailed development
budget estimates of central government MDAs. The four volumes were normally submitted to the Parliament as references to members of the parliament in the discussion of sectoral budgets as well as national budget speech. The BBMTF is normally prepared and published immediately after the Parliament approves the national budget. It is the most important report that used to better inform the stakeholders and the general public about budget performance and medium term outlook. The BBMTF represents a milestone in the Government’s sustained effort to address stakeholders’ request for enhanced communication and transparency of the budgeting process.

On the side of enhancing transparency in the budget processing, the Government in collaboration with non state actors initiated a booklet which is known as “the citizen’s budget” and being published every financial year in a reader-friendly language (Swahili and English version). It is a simplified digest of the national budget produced in a format that makes it easy for the ordinary citizen to understand the main features of what the government is determined to do for the financial year. A citizen’s budget briefs the source of resources envelope and how it has planned to be spent. Further, it shows a breakdown of budget for some key sectors, highlighting their respective priorities for the year under consideration. The purpose of the booklet was to make budgetary information more accessible to ordinary people as well as giving them the opportunity to be more involved in the Government’s planning and budgetary process. Therefore, this involvement of non-government actors shows determination of the Government to enhance transparency on budgetary issues.

As a way of enhancing transparency, budget documents and implementation reports were discussed at District Councils, RCC, IMTC, Cabinet, Parliamentary Sectoral Committees, PER fora. The documents (MKUKUTA II, budget speeches, Medium Term Budget Background, Citizen’s budget digest, etc.) and reports (Budget Execution Report (BER), monthly and quarterly disbursement of funds) were also published in newspapers, Government websites to be accessed by the general public. Main achievements in enhancing transparency was the public sharing information of CAG report which used to be discussed in the National Assembly and brought up accountability measures among public leaders.
5.5. Principles, Assumption, Risks and Mitigation Measures and Challenges

5.5.1. Principles

In its design, the principles to guide MKUKUTA II implementation was National ownership (the people, GOT, CSOs, Private Sector, etc.); political commitment, leadership, and enhanced accountability; commitment to stabilize macroeconomic variables and accelerate core reforms implementation, whereby the role of the private sector in pro-poor economic growth is emphasized and given a central role. Others include macro-micro linkages; sector strategies, linkages and collaboration; local partnerships and people’s participation and community engagement; and harmonized assistance as well as sharper and focused prioritization. MKUKUTA II was also predicated on the principle of sustainable human development and equity. The principles are very useful in the financing process of any developmental strategy including MKUKUTA II.

5.5.2. Assumptions

MKUKUTA II was also designed under several assumptions that have had major implications in the financing framework and processes. These assumptions are:

i. The domestic economy gradually recovering and stabilizing from the impact of global financial and economic crisis;
ii. Macroeconomic stability will be maintained and socio-economic development will continue to be improved;
iii. Domestic revenue collection will be enhanced;
iv. Increased impetus in the implementation of MKUKUTA II and resource allocation in areas that have rapid multiplier effects in the economy;
v. Kilimo Kwanza initiative will be implemented;
vi. Increased progress in private sector development and PPP implementation, including further improvement in the business environment;
vii. A supportive monetary policy, reflected in low inflation, a narrowing interest rate spread, and increased credit to the private sector;
viii. Political stability will be maintained, especially after the general election in 2010; and,
ix. Strengthened monitoring and evaluation, to ensure effective use of public resources.

The status of the above assumptions witnessed a mixed trend. The economy has witnessed recovery from the crisis; most of the macro-economic variables have started to stabilize; efforts to enhance domestic revenue collection increased leading to gradual widening of tax base and resource allocation and monitoring strengthened through initiatives such as Big Results Now (BRN). For the next Plan, the above assumptions need to be maintained if we need to attain success in implementation of the next strategy.
5.5.3. Financing Risks under MKUKUTA II and Mitigation Measures

a) Adverse developments in the world economy-Issues of Global Crisis and transmission channels

i. Banking sector and exposure to global financial crisis
The banking sector especially foreign banks activities in countries like Tanzania were not much affected since their operations follows respective national laws and regulations and their financial relationships with parent institutions require approval of the host countries. However, the channels of crisis transmission were indirect through slower export growth, weak growth or decline in tourism receipts, reduced remittances, reduced FDI and reduced ODA.

ii. Exports, Tourism and Remittances
These were affected by weakening global demand and depressed commodity prices over the period due to global economic slowdown. The weakening global demand strained Tanzania’s trade account of the balance of payments. On the other hand, the receipt from reported aggregate tourism receipt was on rise, though this can be contributed to a number of issues including currency depreciations. However, the government of Tanzania created the rescue plan to at least compensate for the losses attributed to the weakening global demand especially in crops such as cotton.

iii. Foreign Direct Investments (FDI)
FDI has been on the rise, however tightening of global credit conditions lowered the expected FDI flows to some extent and it also reversed or reduced portfolio inflows as among investments. Some other effects resulted to investment delays and cancellations. As a mitigating measure, there is a need for ensuring good investment climate to make investors not perceive the country as vulnerable such that to result into a marked reversal. The basic approach to insure from rising global integration vulnerability is to conduct sound macroeconomic and financial policies geared toward preserving stability and where needed to rebuild any depleted policy buffers, especially on the fiscal side.

iv. Official Development Assistance (ODA)
As said in 3.3.2, the Euro Zone crisis had impact on the level of ODA received by the Government of Tanzania. The crisis also resulted in delays in implementations of projects. However, a number of mitigating issues can be including establishing exogenous shock facility, enhancing domestic revenue collection, undertaking serious public expenditure prioritization and monitoring and establishing new ODA sources. During the period of MKUKUTA II implementation, most of these mitigating initiatives were used and currently new sources of ODA were identified including the BRICS. Additional external sources from FDI, traditional partners such as UK and International institutions lending at concessional conditions remained prevalent in providing funding, but non-traditional partners, in particular
China, have increasingly been investing in the country. This has assisted in filling the Infrastructure Gap.

b) Internal risks and adverse shocks
These were projected to include adverse natural conditions such as drought and floods that affect agriculture and livestock; power outages and shortage due to inadequate capacity and unreliable weather conditions. Both may lead to slow economic growth and hence low domestic revenue; inadequate progress on addressing implementation bottlenecks, including core reforms; Political instability; and inadequate achievement on the war against corruption.

The country during the period of implementation of MKUKUTA II witnessed most of the above anticipated risks, although a number of mitigating measures were implemented to reduce the adverse effects on implementation and financing options. These include continued investment on power generation projects and reform programmes. A number of financial and fiscal reforms continued to be implemented although more need to be done to widen the tax base.

5.6. Challenges and Way Forward

5.6.1. Challenges
Looking at the previous sections, basing on projections during MKUKUTA II design, the resources for financing MKUKUTA II have surpassed the revenue projected in MKUKUTA II assumptions. However, the need have also increased in the same pace hence leaving the implementation processes with several challenges. These challenges among others include:

i. Increasing domestic revenue collection and ensuring enforcement in property and other tax collection. This include continued fight against tax aversion and the use of paper receipts;
ii. Increased control of tax exemption;
iii. Unpredictability of foreign resources and conditionalities. This include dealing with the financing gap especially on Grants and external borrowing that suffered in the recent past due to Global Financial crisis (GFC) and Euro Zone Crisis;
iv. Harmonization of budget classification system to enable the tracking of budgeted expenditure on an administrative, functional and economic classification basis. The budget classification system need to be contained in one single document and all the budget-related documents should show the budget classification system in the same degree of detail;
v. Controlling public debt;
vi. Small proportion of Country Programmable Aid (CPA) to the total ODA especially during the budget preparation stage. The CPA is the aid money available to partner countries to support agreed-upon
development projects or programs. This is what remains after deducting debt forgiveness, emergency and food aid, technical assistance, and administrative overheads of donor agencies from the net ODA;

vii. Dealing with slow pace of project implementation attributed by among others delays in reporting of project performance by implementing agencies, stringent conditions by donors; and,

viii. Controlling public debt and reducing non-concessional loans since these have a very big implication on the growth of interest payment hence external and domestic debt.

5.6.2. Way forward

One of the major challenges noted is the ever growing financing gap. To address this, the following financing strategy options to be considered are:

a) Domestic Revenue

Further increases in Government domestic revenue (given growth) through improvements in tax administration and other tax policy measures. More efforts need to be emphasized on collection of non-tax revenue by trying to follow some international best practice in charging some of country’s resources.

b) Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) and Public-Private Partnership (PPP)

These are options recommended as alternative sources for financing long-term development expenditure especially public infrastructures. In order to have a good flow and making these sources as dependable sources, there is a need for ensuring good investment climate to make investors not perceive the country as vulnerable such that to result into a marked reversal. The basic approach is to conduct sound macroeconomic and financial policies geared toward preserving stability and where needed to rebuild any depleted policy buffers, especially on the fiscal side. The government should not worry about current account deficits during attracting FDIs, as long as these are accompanied by sustained investment efforts and allows for a pick-up in productivity and exports. The government needs also to understand that sometimes PPP may have high transaction and financing costs, thus they need to be pinned by an appropriate legal and institutional framework and require close monitoring on the side of institutions that governs PPP.

c) Borrowing

There is also a need for financing by continuing to borrow internationally, on commercial terms, and also on concessional terms, from both bilateral and multilateral sources. Moreover, the government may need to borrow domestically including borrowing through syndicated loans. These sources need to be done while considering the effects of fiscal vulnerability since in some cases expansionary fiscal stance is being driven by growth in recurrent spending rather than development spending. So there is a need to ensure fiscal
imbalance containment, primary spending readjusted toward growth-enhancing expenditures and fiscal policy design appropriately embedded in medium term framework with improved public financial management that avoid overoptimistic borrowing.

d) Official Development Assistance (ODA)
The government may also source support from international community from current or new development partners, as specific projects and programs that propel high economic and social returns. However, given the unpredictability of the ODA, the government should also design and establish exogenous shock facility, enhance domestic revenue collection, undertake serious public expenditure prioritization and monitoring and establishing new ODA sources.

e) Issuance of Sovereign Bond
These are easily done when the market conditions allow and need to be directed to specific projects. This source of financing has several advantages including: Being the source of financing that applies given less opportunity for domestic long-term maturity issuance; diversifying the sources through the signal a country sends to international community when a country issues the international bond that the domestic fundamentals have improved; being a source of financing that acts as a catalyst for international funding for the private sector including FDI. Moreover, the sovereign rating that comes along with the bonds provides benchmark for private firms to issue their own bonds and provides financial innovations. The government needs also to consider the exchange rate risk that may result from the bond since the country needs to pay back in foreign currency at a prevailing rate.

f) Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR), remittance and Non-State Actors (NSA)
The use of CSR as a source of financing is very important financing option. This source may be promoted by designing an appropriate guiding principle and establishing the incentive mechanism.

In summary, the next Plan should implement the following measures:

i. Widening the tax base (including property tax) by bringing more businesses into the formal sector through formalization of the informal sector;

ii. Enhanced use of Electronic Fiscal Devices (EFDs): The Government should continue to provide education to tax payers (both buyers and sellers) on the importance of tax payment to the economy through use of electronic payment systems and enforce the use of EFDs as opposed to paper receipts;

iii. Reduce exemptions: Continued lessening of the powers of the Minister for Finance to grant exemptions;

iv. To address unpredictability of foreign resource, including by the
Government continuing to negotiate with development partners and other lending institutions including banks to ensure that the committed funds are readily available as programmed and timely; improved reporting mechanism for the performance of the projects and the procurement processes of developmental projects;

v. Develop new innovative sources to finance poverty reducing and growth projects in order to reduce external dependency. These include issuance of infrastructure and sovereign bond as well as PPP arrangement; and,

vi. Control public debt through ensuring the borrowing that focuses on growth-enhancing projects.
Chapter VI. MKUKUTA II Monitoring and Evaluation System

6.1. Overview
MKUKUTA II implementation and its monitoring and evaluation framework ends in June 2016 (after an extension by one year) and Government will have to design a new Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. In order to achieve that ambitious agenda, a comprehensive review of MKUKUTA Monitoring Master Plan II has been conducted in order to inform the new strategy that is expected to generate next M&E strategy that embraces FYDP II with both poverty and growth drivers. This chapter presents this review and looks at lessons learned from MKUKUTA II implementation for the last past five years in terms of monitoring and evaluation systems performance and provides specific recommendations to be taken into account in the design of the M&E plan for the follow-up strategy that is a pro-poor strategy for FYDP II.

6.2 Description of the Current Situation
The current M&E arrangement for MKUKUTA-II is still largely based on initial approach, with some modifications. The arrangement for MKUKUTA-II M&E is set out in Monitoring Master Plan of December 2011. In broad terms, the key features of MKUKUTA-II M&E arrangement are:

i. An institutional framework that brings together specific institutions with mandates to coordinate and execute functions previously carried out by Technical Working Groups (TWGs). These functions include data and information generation, research and analysis and stakeholders' engagement through communication. Therefore, it is inclusive and brings together all relevant stakeholders through the Technical Committee and links them to relevant Government policy and decision making bodies;

ii. A survey calendar to be implemented by the National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) to provide estimates for key MKUKUTA II indicators;

iii. A calendar of planning, budgeting and reporting activities include among others; PER cluster studies, Budget guideline preparations, MDAs quarterly and mid-year performance reports and productions of MAIR, PHDR, Views of the People Report, Strategic Policy briefs and Joint MKUKUTA/PER Annual National Policy Dialogues;

iv. Defined outputs of MKUKUTA II M&E, including survey reports, analytical reports

v. Incentive structure and systems of accountability planned to reduce distortions and to ensure work effort to produce the required MMS outputs are reasonably recognized through both financial and non-financial incentives;

vi. A funding mechanism and a budget for the implementation of MKUKUTA M&E from pooled fund; Project funding and DPs direct contributions to TWG and Secretariat’s activities.
6.2.1 General Implementation Progress for MMS

The Review of implementation include the design and finalization of MMS; MKUKUTA II Monitoring Master Plan was printed, launched and distributed to stakeholders; MAIR were produced and distributed and posted on the website; and annual national policy dialogues 2010 was conducted and report produced. It is also noted that, MKUKUTA Communication strategy was developed printed, launched and distributed to among stakeholders; analytical studies for PHDR 2011 were carried out, printed, launched and produced and Draft report of TDHS 2009/10 was prepared and evaluated. National panel report 2010/11 was prepared.

During the review period, the MMS Secretariat procedure and financial manual was developed to facilitate implementation of MMMP II and the Secretariat produced work plan and was approved by Parliament and most activities were integrated in the government budget. Furthermore, the Secretariat observed abridging of MKUKUTA II and FYDP II Framework. However, the coordination generally continued in terms of defined roles and responsibilities, e.g. MKUKUTA Secretariat under Poverty Eradication Division (PED); survey and routine data under NBS; Research and analysis under REPOA/COSTECH.

6.2.2 Implementation of the Institutional Framework

The backbone of the MKUKUTA M&E arrangements is formed by specific institutions with mandates to coordinate and execute functions such as data and information generation, research and analysis and stakeholders’ engagement through communication. There is also a steering committee which the study finds that it was not formed as per documentation of MKUKUTA-II MMP. Also there is a Technical Committee (TC) responsible for providing visionary direction in terms of delivering the MMMP II programme of work and in terms of fostering evidence based decision making through provisioning of analytical information, a venue for pro-poor policy thinking and analytical work. Consultations with stakeholders claim that the TC did not actively attend its functions as it was endeavored.

There is MKUKUTA Secretariat which is based at the Ministry of Finance, department of Poverty Eradication. Its overall task is to coordinate operationalization of MMS including managing MMMP II programme and linking outputs of MMMPII with wider government dialogue, monitoring and reporting. Further it ensures cross sector fertilization of issues emerging from different stakeholders and thematic areas. The secretariat entailed also to support and serve the dialogue structure with the required information endorsed by Technical Committee.

6.2.3 Implementation Progress MKUKUTA Secretariat

MKUKUTA Secretariat carried out the following major activities:

i. Facilitated functioning of TWG and Technical Committee in designing of MMS

ii. Produced MAIRs and MDGRs

iii. Developed Training M&E Modules for MDA and LGAs

iv. Routine coordination of MMS conducted by PED

v. Scrutinized MMS work plan

vi. Under PED communication group, accomplished plan as articulated in MKUKUTA communication strategy

vii. PED participated in international and local exhibitions events e.g. African public service week held in Accra –Ghana, sabasaba, nanenane

viii. Coordinated production of MKUKUTA II extension and reviewed document as a government planning framework

6.2.4 Implementation Progress on Survey and Routine Data

This is the mandate of the National Bureau of Statistics (NBS). NBS is responsible for the implementation of a multi-year survey plan that would produce estimates on key MMS indicators; coordinate implementation of surveys and census programme and generation of official statistics. The NBS was meant to ensure that those indicators drawing from administrative data sources would be populated in a timely manner with new estimates and was meant to serve as forum for the coordination and quality improvement of routine data sources. Performance is indicated below:

i. Managed to write report on TDHS, Agriculture Census, National Panel Survey, Integrated Business Survey and evaluation report

ii. Data development and dissemination under TSMP (NBS), e.g., integrated business survey (mainland Tanzania); Employment and earning survey 2011; HIV/AIDS and Malaria Indicators Survey 2011/12

iii. Data generation for MMS II were approved by TSMP steering committee under NBS

6.2.5 Implementation of Research and Analysis

REPOA under the leadership of COSTECH was mandated to coordinate a programme of analytical work around the MMS and to produce the Poverty and Human Development Reports and Poverty Status Reports, policy briefs and Views of the People’s Report (VoPs) as main outputs of the MMS. The following are some of implementation achievements:

i. Conducted special thematic meetings on poverty reduction and agriculture development

ii. Resource Centre at REPOA strengthened- support in production of publications and related policy

iii. Conducted open sessions on evaluation of key findings of FINSCOPE survey and House hold consumption

iv. Developed policy briefs outputs of research agenda e.g. pattern of growth, competitive farming system in economic growth experience in Tanzania

v. Reviewed various studies- e.g. re-write distribution aspects of growth papers in the form of book- (i) status of poverty and employment, (ii) status of productivity (iii) social security and (iv) business environment

vi. Produced a background paper on employment productivity and social economic security to inform preparation of PHDR 2011

vii. Participated in planned surveys conducted accordingly by NBS

viii. Harmonization of variables for comparability between census and HBS

ix. Matching census 2012 up to ward level with GIS map and prepared census and HBS dataset (the process greatly improved understanding on the determinants of poverty and their correlations, dimensions and geographical variations of poverty).

6.2.6 Implementation of MKUKUTA II Communication Strategy

The role of the Communication was to communicate and facilitate two – ways communication flow of the main findings of the MMS to all relevant audiences at different levels, with communication products tailored to each audience. Results are shown below:

i. Airing radio program on MKUKUTA II implementation

ii. Participated on government events such as Utumishi wa Umma

iii. Prepared annual IEC materials, radio and TV features on MKUKUTA

iv. Distributed number of copies of MMS-outputs to MDAs and LGAs, National and International Agencies, Media, Private & public library and NGOs

v. Reviewed Communication strategy

vi. Communication at the level of research and academic institutions, parliament, CBO, FBO, Private sectors and LGAs on various study finding

vii. Production of documentary on Mbarali paddy irrigation scheme and drafting mapambano magazine

viii. Participated on sabasaba and Nanenane events to articulate issues of growth and poverty reduction

ix. Organized annual national policy dialogue (MKUKUTA/PER/GBS)

x. Translating MKUKUTA II communication strategy into Kiswahili (abridged version) for wide use by public

xi. In collaboration with REPOA in 2012 conducted study on views of the people

xii. Implemented activities as per communication strategy, such as dissemination of MMS outputs to MDAs, LGAs, Private Sector, NSA, DPs and general public through different events such as poverty policy week; saba saba, Utumish wa Umma, nanenane and other forums.

6.2.7 Outputs of MKUKUTA II Monitoring System

The main products of the MKUKUTA M&E arrangements as foreseen in the Master Plan include:

i. The MKUKUTA Annual Implementation Report (MAIR - annual)

ii. The Strategic Policy Brief to Parliament (annual)

iii. National Survey Reports (annual)

iv. The Poverty and Human Development Report (every second year)

v. Views of the People Report on MKUKUTA Implementation (foreseen in 2007 and 2012)

vi. Various briefs (intermittent)

The outputs produced have been presented under the performance of respective institutions in MMS.
6.3 Main findings of the assessment

6.3.1 Institutional Arrangements for MKUKUTA M&E

a). MKUKUTA Secretariat

The study has found that the Secretariat for MKUKUTA M&E is critical in ensuring the smooth operation of monitoring and evaluation for the country’s economic growth and poverty reduction strategies. Its role is to support the work of specific institutions around the MMS; to facilitate and quality assure the planning of these institutions; to ensure adequate funding is available in a timely manner; to hold the institutions to account for the delivery of their agreed outputs; to ensure information flows between the functional institutions and up to the Monitoring Technical Committee. The Secretariat also plays a key role in the production of the MKUKUTA Annual Implementation Reports.

The Secretariat is currently located in the Ministry of Finance. There are advantages and disadvantages in this current institutional home for the Secretariat, but in principle the current location in MoF is ideal to pursue linkages between MKUKUTA M&E and the planning, budgeting and reporting process that has been institutionalized since 2005. To date (2015) there has been uncertainties in terms of overseeing implementation of planning and budget manual and hence the study team suggests that there is a need for PED to be proactively link its business to the Budget Directorate. Presumably, POPC, and PED to strategize needs to synergize the dynamic domain of object poverty and the need of economic growth in a sustainable framework.

Stakeholders would like to see a stronger strategic direction; synergies and a more proactive approach emanate to cater for all levels of service delivery. In light of these views, it would be useful for the Secretariats and their institutional hosts to analyze management capacity. Things to consider are:

i. Clarity of vision and mission in the new harmonized strategic framework (FYDP II);

ii. Work load and prioritisation in area of combined structure and current country direction, such as economic transformation through industrialisation agenda; and comprehensive Human Development agenda that will sharpen the fight against poverty in its multi-dimensional form, through measures that include enhancing income security, access to quality social services, responsive governance and social protection. Internal division of labour and minimizing overlapping activities between PED and PO-PC;

iii. Staff capacity (numbers, skills, competencies);

iv. Other elements of internal capacity within and with collaborating MDAs and LGAs;

v. Linkages to other parts of MoF, wider Government and non-Governmental stakeholders.
The capacity of the MKUKUTA Secretariat has been an issue since the early days of the Poverty Eradication agenda. For many years, development partners have supported the Secretariats – with technical assistance as well as financial support. This support has reduced over time, and of recently has become almost worse but the capacity constraints remain. Reasons for the persistence of the capacity constraints include:

i. Turnover of staff
ii. Positions not being filled (permission and bureaucracy)
iii. Shifts in the institutional home with no sufficient resources as planned in MKUKUTA II Monitoring Master Plan
iv. Poor remuneration and incentive packages
v. A poor working environment and inadequate facilities
vi. Technical assistance that is focused on ‘getting the job done’ rather than building sustainable capacity
vii. Limited ‘empowerment’ of the Secretariat by senior Government officials, political will though demand of information/data at a time of speech are critically needed.

As part of the formulation of the successor arrangement for MKUKUTA III (FYDP II), Government should take a critical view of capacity and capacity needs in the Secretariat, and make an investment in Secretariat capacity that is commensurate with the importance it attaches to the role of the Secretariat.

a) Technical Committee

Some stakeholders express the view that the Technical Committee meets too infrequently. Some claim that the Technical Committee only meets to approve expenditure estimates and reports. As these Committees are supposed to take a view on the work plans and budgets of the functional groups, the infrequency of meetings can lead to delays in funding flows. This has happened for example in relation to pooled funding which collapsed and hence activities for research and analysis group could not be financed.

The fact that the Technical Committee meets only infrequently and then mainly to discuss work plans and budgets is worrying, because it is the conduit for the flow of information from the MMS to the Inter-Ministerial Technical Committee. Therefore, an important focus of its work should be to digest and interpret the information emerging from the MMS and to distil the most important messages that need to be plugged in the next iteration of FYDP II.

c) Surveys and Census (NBS)

The functional group for Surveys and Census has broadly worked successfully under the TSMP framework. Meetings have been regular and well attended. The outputs of the group – the survey reports – are of good quality.
The multi-year survey plan agreed in the MMMP was largely implemented as planned, but with delays for some of the surveys. One reason for these delays was the extensive stakeholder consultations required ahead of surveys. Another reason is unreliable funds from the DPs’. NBS relies on a combination of Government contributions and contributions from Development Partners who disburse directly to NBS.

d) Research and Analysis (REPOA)

The functional group for Research and Analysis is another very successful group. It has highly committed members and produces high quality outputs. One of the ingredients of the success of the Research and Analysis group is the useful partnership between the Commissions for Science and Technology (COSTECH) as Lead research analysis component while REPOA Implements it.

While the chair (COSTECH) provides the secretariat with a strong mandate for its work, guidance on Government needs and priorities, and a link into important decision-making circles, the secretariat provides the technical expertise and convening power for the top analytical capacity in the country.

The Poverty and Human Development Reports, which are published, are the main output of this group. We will discuss them in more detail under the outputs of the MMS, but suffice to say that they are of very high quality and have become quite influential. One Poverty and Human Development Reports has been published since the MMMP-II was formulated in 2011. Another PHDR was to be published in 2013, but this could not happen due to lack of funds and change of the overarching Government planning framework. Instead, a similar progress under ESRF filled this gap by producing the Tanzania Human Development Report (THDR 2014).

The Research and Analysis functional group has become more proactive in promoting debate about the findings of its analytical work. This should continue to be a welcome development. Three initiatives in particular are worth mentioning – Conducted special thematic meetings on poverty reduction (the day after tomorrow) and agriculture development; Conducted open sessions on evaluation of key findings of FINSCOPE survey and House hold consumption and Matching census 2012 up to wad level with GIS map and prepared census and HBS dataset (The process greatly improved understanding on the determinants of poverty and their correlations, dimensions and geographical variations of poverty. This calls for a more proactive outreach function by the Secretariat, which is well placed to play this role.

Consultation indicated that one issue raised by members of the Research and Analysis group is that they find their work is constrained by limited domestic capacity for analytical work. The group finds that it relies on a relatively small
pool of experts, with limited opportunities for young researchers to hone their talents and enhance their capacity and experience. The issue of limited analytical capacity is beyond the scope of the MMS, but it is an issue worth flagging. If Government is serious about instilling an evidence-based decision-making culture and wants a strong results orientation, boosting domestic analytical capacity is important. It then suggested that one or two high learning institution to be capacitated by training staff and students on Research, monitoring and evaluation aligning needs as per country framework and arrangement. Of recently, (2013), University of Dar es Salaam, Open University of Dar es salaam and Mzumbe University have courses of M&E.

e) MKUKUTA II Communications

There are several achievements of the functional group for Communications worth mentioned as it has been reported above. However, the major one that signify outstanding indicators for the group that has moved forward on its quality of communication implementation of activities as per MMMP is reviewing of communication strategy, translating MKUKUTA II communication strategy into Kiswahili (abridged version) for wide use by public and airing radio program on MKUKUTA II implementation.

Another achievement of the Communications TWG is the Voice of the People report, which provides a useful overview of people’s opinions regarding MKUKUTA II implementation. It stresses the function of stakeholders’ engagement as two-way: from Government to stakeholders and vice-versa.

6.4. MKUKUTA II Monitoring System: Overall Challenges

The MMS has been facing the following challenges:

vi. Limited data availability, data quality and accessibility by sector accelerated by lack of standardized and harmonized format of reporting; data interpretation and use remain relative weak. Uneven data quality and accessibility

vii. Funding of MMS were ring fenced and thus disrupting MMS work plan

viii. Creating demand and understanding of M&E by Legislature

ix. Inadequate M&E capacity at all levels constrained the implementation of strategic planning, budgeting and reporting manual designed with the intention to generate information for indicator reporting at national level

x. The evaluation function is underplayed; as such other elements of outcome evaluation (impact assessment) by comparing indicators before
and after (without attributing the change) and comparison of targeted values to actual values are still limited

xi. Inadequate staff capacity to undertake M&E functions at all levels

xii. Absence of independent Evaluation Institution identified by government to build capacity of the staff working in Government as well as help the government to use evaluation as a learning process

xiii. Delayed finalization of national M&E framework as an integrated approach of the “whole of Government M&E” system, hence no circulars, guidelines to support MDAs in implementing M&E in Tanzania

xiv. Weak Results Based Management (RBM) as advocated by UN Aid effectiveness and M&E Accra agenda

xv. Evidence based decision making using M&E data remain a challenge at all levels.

6.5 Special issues for Consideration in M&E

6.5.1. Coordination of Data Production

Over the past ten years, the coordination of data production has seen a major boost. This was at least partly a result of the MMS, and particularly through the Surveys and Census Working Group. The MMS have brought about a much clearer and much better articulated demand for robust, timely data on key indicators. Its institutional framework has brought together data producers and data users. This has enabled a much greater degree of coordination at two different levels. Coordination between data users and producers has ensured that data collected are more relevant to the needs of data users and take better account of timeliness and specific requirements of these data users. Coordination between data producers has reduced the degree of overlap and duplication in data production systems. It has also initiated work on standards and norms. The detailed indicator description in the MKUKUTA Monitoring Master Plan, with its definitions and methodological comments are making a contribution in this respect. However, there is an indicator that is difficult in collection, should not be considered worth- as a rule of thumb, minimum and necessary indicators to measure progress are viable.

Coordination of Routine Data Systems and data production by LGAs has been less successful than the coordination of Survey data and as we have commented above, this now needs urgent attention. NBS need to collaborate with MDAs, and LGAs to make this happen. PMO-RALG should play an important role on the Mainland LGAs. Some stakeholders demand the Core Welfare Indicator Questionnaire Survey (CWIQS) to be revamped and be operational as it was
before, simply it provided useful information on pro-poor indicators trends and performance for each LGA. Further, it is recommended that TSMP and the Planning, Budgeting and Reporting Guidelines both provide an opportunity in this respect and should be used as a wide government M&E linked with FYDP II M&E.

Tanzania Statistical Master Plan will need to continue addressing both statistical production in routine data systems as well as through surveys and the census as an important step in the coordination of statistical production.

The Planning, Budgeting and Reporting Manual provides a real opportunity for MKUKUTA II indicator reporting as well as strengthening evidence-based decision making in MDAs and LGAs. Supporting and facilitating it should be seen as core function for the MKUKUTA Secretariat. As the government is envisaged to merge the MKUKUTA and FYDP, complementarity strategies need to be in place in order to link MMS and the whole of Government M&E System.

Consultation with various Stakeholders had some feeling that in line with Government’s decentralisation approach, statistical production at LGA level should be encouraged (including the use of village registers). Local Government statistical production should feed into the MMS and be an integral part of it. Stakeholders also suggested that FYDP II should include a chapter on statistical production, and achievement of Statisticians and M&E professional at MDAs and LGAs.

6.5.2 Participation of Stakeholders

The MMS has been signalled and criticised by many for its inclusive, multi-stakeholder approach. The elaborate institutional framework was designed to ensure that all stakeholders were represented and no institution with a relevant mandate or relevant expertise was alienated. Proponents of this approach see this as a key strength of the institutional set-up. Critics see it as an unnecessarily cumbersome and inefficient way of doing business. The National Policy Dialogue and later the Poverty Policy Weeks were also a deliberate attempt to involve a wide range of stakeholders in the review of progress with implementation of MKUKUTA II and the discussion of findings emerging from the MMS.

But even though the design of the institutional framework for MKUKUTA II M&E emphasizes inclusion, a number of civil society and private sector stakeholders we spoke complained about limited scope for participation. On balance, the assessment team feels that the level of stakeholder involvement is just about right. Claim remain about deteriorating funding from various stakeholders, which in normal sense jeopardize participation, e.g. funds collapsed in supporting PHDR 2013/14
6.5.3 Outputs of the MKUKUTA M&E System

The assessment team reviewed a sample of the outputs of the MMS, looking in some detail at survey reports, MDGR, MAIRs and PHDRs. On the whole, the quality of outputs is high and there is a consistent positive trend in the quality of the reports. The general point to make is that while the quality is improving consistently, further improvements can be made in terms of the timeliness of the reports and the communication of their main findings especially to LGAs majority of Executives at RS and LGAs are not aware of existing outputs of MKUKUTA II. There is often a long time lag between surveys or pieces of analysis being carried out and the report being publicly available. When a report is formally published, it is often not immediately available online and hard copies can be difficult to obtain for stakeholders not intimately involved in the MKUKUTA II process (see next section). For some reports, a ‘simplified version’ accompanies the main report, but on the whole the MMS is not very imaginative in repackaging the findings of key outputs for various audiences and using a range of communication tools to disseminate the main messages.

The MAIR is perhaps the MMS output that has shown the most significant improvement in both quality and timeliness. The MAIRs are generally produced on time and the document has become more analytical and informative in its nature. Having said that, there is little clarity on who uses the MAIR and for what purpose. When we asked stakeholders especially at LGA level about the MAIR, few said they relied on it heavily in their business and majority had no idea.

Given the amount of time and effort invested in preparing the MAIR every year, it would be worthwhile for Government to reconsider the purpose of the MAIR in terms of cost effective and efficiency (value for money versus information utilization especially at productive level). Its content and the amount of time and energy invested in it should be brought in line with the importance various stakeholders attach to this document. Escalating findings to lower level of governance should be a priority in the coming strategy.

Government could either drop the MAIR altogether or at least make it a ‘lighter touch’ document. If the Government Guidelines for Planning, Budgeting and Reporting are properly implemented by all MDAs and LGAs, the preparation of the MAIR would become very straightforward. In this scenario, the MAIR could simply synthesize the MDA and LGA reports and draw out key messages of relevance to MKUKUTA II. The similar principle may be utilized for the next generation, e.g. FYDP- II.
6.5.4 Access to data and Information of the M&E Systems

While stakeholders are generally appreciative of the outputs of the MMS, there is some degree of concern about the accessibility of both data sets and finished products. When it comes to datasets, some stakeholders expressed concerns about the data access policy of NBS being less than transparent. It often takes a very long time for data sets to become available after surveys are conducted. Once a data set is final, requests for the use of the data set take a long time to get approved. Several stakeholders stressed that they would like to see TSMP result in a new, progressive data access policy for NBS. This data access policy should actively encourage third party analysis of official data sets at individual level and Universities, without of course compromising on data protection. A pricing policy for the use of NBS data sets should be part of this data access policy, but pricing should not make it prohibitive for students, Tanzanian analysts and civil society groups to make use of the data sets. It is suggested that linking it to other websites such as PMO-RALG, it will increase visibilities.

Many stakeholders not directly involved in the MKUKUTA II process complain that the outputs of the MMS are hard to access. Hard copies are difficult to obtain and it often takes a long time for the reports to appear online, if at all. The Poverty Monitoring Website was useful to facilitate access to key products emerging from the MMS and general information on the MKUKUTA II process,

As we have pointed out already, dissemination of MMS outputs is taking place particularly at macro level, but re-packaging of information for various audiences and promotion of analysis, interpretation and use is somewhat limited. The Communications group has now started playing its role efficiently. In the next stage of MKUKUTA III (FYDP II) M&E, promoting actively the utilisation of evidence emerging from the FYDP II M&E should take a much higher priority.

6.5.5 Utilisation of Evidence Generated by the MKUKUTA II M&E Systems

While it is easy to get completely absorbed in the definition of indicators and the mechanics of data collection when involved in M&E systems, the ultimate purpose of an M&E system is to make information available that can be used to improve implementation and to account for resources used. So the ultimate test for the effectiveness of an M&E system is to see if there are specific examples of the evidence it produces being used to inform decision making, at any level.

When we reviewed M&E practices in MDAs and LGAs and some MDAs (Health, Agriculture, Education just to cite few examples), we still observed a considerable amount of data collection for its own sake, to fill forms, reports and databases without a focus on actual utilisation. This was true particularly at LGA
level. But to an extent this is hardly surprising, as an evidence-based decision making culture doesn’t set in overnight and in practice many incentives within Government still counter this very mindset. What is encouraging though is that examples are beginning to emerge of evidence produced by the MMS informing policy dialogue, if not policy decisions. The two examples already quoted are the spatial analysis of poverty and the drivers of growth analysis. It would be useful for the Secretariat to capture and champion good examples of the use of evidence in decision making, to build on the few good examples that are emerging.

The Secretariat should also become more proactive to encourage the use of evidence by MDAs, LGAs. This can be done by strengthening the planning, budgeting and reporting work – PED can work with Budget Directorate on this. The Secretariat’s location in MOF gives it an ideal opportunity to work very closely with the planning, budgeting and reporting work and to ensure that it feeds in well to MKUKUTA III or FYDP II monitoring and that it strengthens evidence-based decision making in the MDAs and LGAs.

The underlying reason for poor utilisation of the evidence generated by MKUKUTA II as reported by stakeholders and reviewed from various documentations of M&E Systems is that the incentives for evidence-based decision-making remain weak and to some levels non existing at all. There several possible routes to strengthening these incentives:

i. Availability demanded in terms of Result based management to data users (MDAs, LGAs, CSO, and DPs etc.)

ii. accountability demanded by elected representatives in Parliament and local assemblies

iii. accountability demanded by citizens or citizens’ groups, directly from service providers, local authorities or central Government

iv. accountability demanded by Government’s own oversight bodies, such as the National Audit Office, particularly if its function extends beyond a more narrow interpretation of audit to include accountability for programme decisions and value for money

v. internal Government incentives for a results orientation, for example by moving towards performance-based budget allocations

The issue as well as the solutions are well beyond the scope of MKUKUTA II M&E. The wider efforts to strengthen results-based management under the Harmonisation Taskforce that was stopped without proper reasons offer important entry points and the stakeholders in the MMS need to align themselves closely with these efforts. MoF, PMO, PMO-RALG POPC, Cabinet Secretariat are recommended a new focused implementation arrangement in order to revamp the “whole of Government M&E framework under President Office.”
6.5.6 Capacity for Implementation of the MKUKUTA III M&E Systems

A detailed capacity needs assessment for MKUKUTA III M&E can be carried out once the structure of the new strategy and the M&E requirements are clear.

One positive development we noted was is that there is emergence of a growing number of M&E posts throughout Government. These posts are established at senior level (several Assistant Director Posts) and at junior level. This is a welcome development and a sign that the concept of M&E is gradually taking hold in the Government of Tanzania. However, there is, to date, neither recognised M&E cadre in Government nor a known lead ministry to engineer “whole of Government M&E”. Therefore, there are no agreed entry criteria and competency standards for M&E staff, no policy and standard guideline for M&E. Study team suggests that we revamp the full utilization of initial government of enforcing using Planning and budget manual especially implementing chapter seven of that manual. It is suggested that chapter seven in Medium Term Planning and Budget Manual removed, and expand to another institutional framework that will entail a full-fledged governance M&E for the Whole Government (Experience from Sri-lanka, South Africa and Kenya, are typical good economic countries that have manage to have the whole of Government M&E.)

From the aforementioned bottleneck people with a variety of academic backgrounds and different job profiles claim the title of M&E officer. There is inadequate recognised training programme at undergraduate or graduate level to prepare people for a career in M&E. The training offered on M&E is ad hoc and short term. Recognition and professionalization of the M&E cadre in Government would be a major step forward towards stronger evidence-based decision making. The current initiatives of training M&E professional cadre at for instance, University of Dar es salaam (Geography Department), Open University of Dar es salaam and Mzumbe University is accepted development agenda

6.5.7 Linkages between MMS and other M&E systems at National, MDA and LGA levels

Since 2005, Tanzania has reformed planning, budgeting, monitoring and evaluation including reporting processes that determine the direction Government will take in order to meet its development objectives. Literature review and stakeholders opinion acknowledge the government initiative to put in place a harmonized planning and budgeting framework. Concerns however recorded during this assessment are the need to continue to adopt the planning cycle current prevailed by the government as majority of MDAs, RS and LGA have acquainted and are now in favour of the model. This assessment further suggests that in MKUKUTA II there should be a harmonised approach that affirms a common planning and reporting language strictly, as documented in
Medium Term Strategic Planning and Budgeting Manual, and in all cases the MKUKUTA monitoring arrangement should follow government planning model as indicated below.

Figure 6.1

The introduced Planning, Budgeting and Reporting Manual present a major opportunity for the MMS. It introduces a common approach to reporting that can serve the needs of MKUKUTA and any other cross-sectoral initiative very well. For instance, Form 12b in the Manual in particular is an important step forward. The reporting under the Manual is already making the production of the MAIR smoother. At the moment, the potential offered by this new approach is not yet fully exploited. More could be done to analyse the Forms 12b from MDAs and LGAs systematically. Further, an assessment of the implementation of Planning and budget manual is inevitable in order to understand its strengths, operational opportunities and gaps and thus the needs required be revisited and be part of FYDP implementation framework.

A core function of the Secretariat should become to facilitate MKUKUTA III (FYDP II) integration into MDA and LGA plans, budgets and reports and to facilitate a two-way interaction between MDAs, LGAs and MoF in this respect. A detailed assessment is further needed to affirm the usefulness of the developed M&E tools and reporting structure to ascertain whether fulfills the need of Results Based Management (RBM) at all levels of government implementation.
6.5.8 Value for Money

Many stakeholders consulted reported that it is impossible to make a sound value for money judgment on the MMS at this moment in time, because of two reasons:

i. The evidence generated by the MMS is of relevance to a much wider audience than the MMS stakeholders. Without mapping out who uses this evidence and for what purpose it is impossible to judge how the cost of the MMS compares to the benefits derived from it. However production cost is significantly high, and become bad if the products are not disseminated to the various audiences especially at LGAs where most of the services are delivered.

ii. We are insufficiently clear on what the evidence generated by the MMS is used for even by MMS stakeholders. We therefore cannot easily measure policy gains brought about by the MMS.

6.6. Abridging MKUKUTA II and FYDP II Monitoring and Evaluation System: A New M&E generation

Existing publications and stakeholder’s consultation have affirmed that transition (abridging) to FYDP II M&E system will need the following

i. It require revised implementation tools (Communication Strategy and Evaluation Frameworks)

ii. Implementation of FYDP will be refurbished through harmonized government planning and budgeting framework (MTEF), coordinated through Wide Government M&E framework under a single selected Ministry or under President Office. In so doing it will enforce reporting of service delivery performance and compliance

iii. It may need to re-organize an institutional arrangement and define M&E products for assessing government wider performance as per agreed M&E needs, e.g. value for money or performance budgeting processes through expanded and enhanced PER at both macro and micro levels

iv. The use of decentralized governance M&E will need to be of major focus in implementation of FYDP II, e.g. Findings from RCC and DCC be honoured and used for planning and improved decision making processes

v. The missing middle “The Evaluation” and particularly the impact assessment has to be over emphasized. This agenda will facilitate comparison of indicators before and after project/programme implementations for the assigned government targets

vi. Generally the achievements recorded during implementations of MMS 1 and II need to be carried out in implementing FYDP II, namely, Improving transparency and accountability through TWG and policy dialogue and forums
vii. Providing learning ground, as such as selected institution may be centre of excellent for comprehensive capacity building of M&E (example Pretoria University in south Africa, Mahidol University in Thailand), both are supported by MEASURE Evaluation in all matters related to principles and guidance of M&E including Statistics and second M&E analysis, in Tanzania need to make dedication for some Universities to do the same and allocate funds to support the initiative, DPs may as well support and facilitate the development ambitious;

viii. Enhanced Result-Based management Concept. Implementation of Wide Government M&E with standard tools and guideline, targets and objectives will emulate and further improve RBM to the government and other stakeholders

ix. Better articulation of indicators: In the current initiative and through Medium Term Strategic Planning and Budgeting Manual as revised in year 2008 there is better articulation of MDAs objectives; clear setting of goals, good methodology of identification of unambiguous indicators and benchmarks to monitor progress and finally setting of transparent monitoring system: This good initiative should continue in FYDP II.

6.7. Stakeholders’ Analysis of MMS Situation

Stakeholders have suggested that, there should be:

i. Internal and external demands for greater accountability, transparency, efficiency and effectiveness with a view to improving delivery of public services.

ii. Pressure for judicious use of taxpayer’s money and showing real results of political promises made to constituencies.

iii. Adoption of performance management systems or Result Based Management

iv. Pressures by citizens and their representatives demanding for leaders (elected and appointed) to account for results of programmes and projects being undertaken using taxpayers’ money.

v. Decision makers wanting to use evidence generated from M&E systems in making choices and informed decisions.

vi. Increased involvement of development partners in funding development programmes and projects, which as a result requires recipients to report on progress and results.

vii. The emerging of free media and autonomous civil society organizations with requirements for transparency and accountability in the conduct of public affairs.

viii. Development programs and projects that require complex frameworks for monitoring implementation and reporting results.
The adoption of result-oriented reform agenda across government - the implementation of public sector reform programmes that have, as part of their objectives, the popularization of use of M&E tools in Government business

The development of M&E frameworks for monitoring and evaluating implementation of strategic plans in MDAs following the implementation of PSRP (i.e. the PMS component);

Support has been extended to Local Government Authorities to adopt and use M&E in their operations.

6.8. Recommendations

i. Strengthening M&E especially by establishing the digitized MIS at all level

ii. Put in place policy and legal instrument that require the legislator to monitor progress made on priorities of government outcomes and educate about the functioning of RBM systems

iii. Institutionalize the whole of government M&E system

iv. Advocate for and institutional impact assessment through academic institutions and other potential organization including individuals

v. There should be a lead Ministry capacitated with power and functions legally to support M&E for the whole government- It is proposed to be under President Office

vi. Some efforts are in place to some MDA and LGAs to locate funds for M&E

vii. Government has to some levels recruited staff, supporting M&E systems and working tools

viii. Data should be used to inform choices in different stages in planning and public services delivery;

ix. Assessing of impact of larger programmes which will be developed by two framework MKUKUTA III and FYDP II need to assess dynamics of poverty levels, so establishment of an independent institution to manage the second level evaluation such as cost benefit analysis; impact assessment; outcome and process evaluation and citizen satisfaction survey is inevitable.
ANNEX A. MKUKUTA CLUSTERS: GOALS, INDICATORS, AVAILABLE DATA AND 2015 TARGETS

Annex A1. Trend performance in Growth for Reduction of Poverty

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 1: Pursuing Sound Macroeconomic Management</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inflation Rate (%)</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>NBS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of disbursed amounts of aid to total commitment (%)</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ministry of Finance (AMP-Database)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Official Foreign Reserves (months of imports of goods &amp; services)</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>Bank of Tanzania (Various Publications)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exchange Rate (TZS per 1USD)</td>
<td>1,391.6</td>
<td>1,489.6</td>
<td>1,572.2</td>
<td>1,603.7</td>
<td>1,647.7</td>
<td>2,020.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bank of Tanzania (Various Publications)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget deficit as a % of GDP before grants</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Below 8.0</td>
<td>Economic Survey – June 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget deficit as a % of GDP after grants</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey – June 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Revenue to GDP Ratio (%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>13.0</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>Economic Survey – June 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Expenditure as a % of GDP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Economic Survey &amp; BOT QEB (Jun 2015)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Direct Investments (Mln USD); calendar year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,813.0</td>
<td>1,229.5</td>
<td>1,799.6</td>
<td>2,087.3</td>
<td>2,049.3</td>
<td>Economic Survey – June 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Goal 2: Reducing Income Poverty through promoting inclusive, sustainable and employment enhancing growth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Basic Need Poverty (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Poverty (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty Gap Index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gini Coefficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP Growth (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crops (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Livestock (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forestry (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishing (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture contribution to GDP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing Sector Growth (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing Contribution to GDP (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of International Tourism Arrivals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Earnings (US $ million)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining Sector Growth (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribution of mining to GDP (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction Sector Growth (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribution of Construction to GDP share (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trunk and Regional Roads in Good/Fair (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural /Local Roads in Good and Fair Condition (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Sector Growth (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy Sector Contribution to GDP (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity Generation Growth (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Households with access to Electricity (%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Goal 3:** Ensuring creation and sustenance of productive and decent employment, especially for women, youth and people with disabilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Food Activity</th>
<th>44,670</th>
<th>46,904</th>
<th>49,266</th>
<th>51,729</th>
<th>54,316</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Economic Survey, 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Drinking Activity</td>
<td>5,964</td>
<td>6,262</td>
<td>6,578</td>
<td>6,906</td>
<td>7,252</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Tobacco and Cigarettes</td>
<td>6883</td>
<td>7227</td>
<td>7588</td>
<td>7968</td>
<td>8,366</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Knitting and Weaving</td>
<td>12,224</td>
<td>12,835</td>
<td>13,490</td>
<td>14,165</td>
<td>14,874</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Leather and Leather Products</td>
<td>652</td>
<td>684</td>
<td>719</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>793</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Shoes</td>
<td>824</td>
<td>865</td>
<td>909</td>
<td>954</td>
<td>1,002</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Wood and Wood Products</td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
<td>795</td>
<td>5,669</td>
<td>6,225</td>
<td>6,568</td>
<td>6,897</td>
<td>795</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Paper and Printing</td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
<td>834</td>
<td>5,952</td>
<td>3,122</td>
<td>1,301</td>
<td>1,436</td>
<td>877</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Chemical Manufacturing</td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td>2,974</td>
<td>3,122</td>
<td>3,444</td>
<td>3,616</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Rubber Products</td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td>2,974</td>
<td>3,122</td>
<td>3,444</td>
<td>3,616</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Plastic Products</td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td>2,974</td>
<td>3,122</td>
<td>3,444</td>
<td>3,616</td>
<td>1,239</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Non-metal Mineral Products</td>
<td>2,540</td>
<td>2,667</td>
<td>2,802</td>
<td>2,942</td>
<td>3,089</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of People Employed in Manufacturing in Others Activities</td>
<td>20,904</td>
<td>21,949</td>
<td>23,069</td>
<td>24,223</td>
<td>25,434</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Survey, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal 4: Ensuring Food and Nutrition Security, Environmental Sustainability and Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>125</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Cooperative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Annex B. Trend performance in Quality Of Life and Social Wellbeing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Trend</th>
<th>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal1: Ensuring equitable access to quality Early Childhood Development (ECD) programmes, Primary and Secondary education for boys and girls.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01. Literacy rate of population aged 15+ years (percent)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All adults</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>83.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>71.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02. Net enrolment at Pre-primary level</td>
<td>37.5</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>39.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03. Total enrolment in pre-primary</td>
<td>925,465</td>
<td>1,069,208</td>
<td>1,034,729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04. Net Primary school enrolment rate</td>
<td>95.4</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>92.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05. percent of cohort completing STD VII</td>
<td>53.0</td>
<td>62.6</td>
<td>54.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06. percent of students Passing the Primary School Leaving Exam</td>
<td>53.5</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>30.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent of teachers with relevant qualifications</td>
<td>94.5 96.5 96.6 99 98.7</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>BEST, 2013, MoEVT, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent Transition rate from Standard Seven VII to form 1</td>
<td>43.9 52.2 53.6 59.5 55.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>BEST, 2013, MoEVT, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent Net Secondary enrolment</td>
<td>30.8 34.5 36.6 33.7 32.0</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>BEST, 2013, MoEVT, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent of students Passing the Form 4 Exam (Div 1-3)</td>
<td>50.4 53.6 43.1 57.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>BEST, 2013, MoEVT, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NER for Advanced level secondary education</td>
<td>1.9 2.01 2.7 1.8 2.0</td>
<td></td>
<td>BEST, 2013, MoEVT, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The pass rate in form VI exams</td>
<td>92.1 92.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>BEST, 2013, MoEVT, 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal 2: Ensuring Expansion of Quality Technical and Vocational Education and Training, Higher education, and adult, Non-formal and Continuing Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual enrolment in technical and Vocational educational training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical education</td>
<td>50,173</td>
<td>85,040</td>
<td>112,447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational training</td>
<td>72,938</td>
<td>102,217</td>
<td>121,348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross enrolment in higher education institutions</td>
<td>118,951</td>
<td>139,638</td>
<td>166,484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal 3: Improved survival, health and well-being of all children and women and especially vulnerable groups</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of births taking place at health facility</td>
<td>58percent</td>
<td>62percent</td>
<td>60percent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Fertility rate</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DATA SOURCE: BEST, 2013, MoEVT, 2015; DHS, 2010
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Trend</th>
<th>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infant mortality rate</td>
<td>51/1,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under five mortality rate</td>
<td>81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTP-HpB-Hib coverage</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportional of under- five moderately or severely stunted (height for age)</td>
<td>42percent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal Mortality Rate</td>
<td>454</td>
<td></td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent of persons with advanced HIV infection receiving ARV combination therapy</td>
<td>(Adults) 7.6percent (Children)</td>
<td>(Adults) 13percent (Children)</td>
<td>(Adults) 23percent (Children)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB treatment completion rate</td>
<td>89percent</td>
<td>88percent</td>
<td>89percent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaria prevalence among children under 5 years old</td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV prevalence among 15-24 years olds.</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal 4: Increasing access to Affordable Clean and Safe Water, Sanitation and Hygiene</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of rural population with access to piped or protected water as their main source (within 30 minutes to go, collect and return), Census, TDHS</td>
<td>46.5</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Indicator: Percentage of urban population with access to piped or protected water as their main source (within 30 minutes to go, collect and return).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Settlement Type</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>Target 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural settlement</td>
<td>46.5</td>
<td>57.8</td>
<td>56.6</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small towns</td>
<td></td>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major urban regional centres</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>95</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dar es Salaam</td>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td>68</td>
<td></td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator: Water supply service coverage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Settlement Type</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural settlement</td>
<td>46.5</td>
<td>57.8</td>
<td>56.6</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small towns</td>
<td></td>
<td>53</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major urban regional centres</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dar es Salaam</td>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td>68</td>
<td></td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Indicator: Percentage of households with basic sanitation facilities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010</th>
<th></th>
<th>2012</th>
<th></th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>Target 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>93</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Data Source:** TDHS, 2010, HBS 2012
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Trend</th>
<th>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of schools having adequate sanitation facilities (as per policy ratio of toilets to students)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TDHS, 2010,HBS 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>1:55</td>
<td>1:53</td>
<td>1:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>1:53</td>
<td>1:51</td>
<td>1:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All pupils</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Goal 5: Developing Decent Human Settlements while Sustaining Environmental Quality**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Trend</th>
<th>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>percent of Households with decent housing, HBS</td>
<td>70.3</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent of Households with land certificates</td>
<td>5.86</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent of villages with land use plans</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target 2015</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent of Decrease in number of households in disaster prone and ecologically sensitive areas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 6: Providing Adequate Social Protection and Rights to the Vulnerable and Needy Groups</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of household with orphans who attend school</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of children (5 years+) with disability attending school</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of child-headed households</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Annex C. Trend performance in Good Governance and Accountability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Trend</th>
<th>MKUKUTA II Target</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>2012/13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Goal 1: Ensuring systems and structures of governance uphold the rule of law and are democratic, effective, accountable, predictable, transparent, inclusive and corruption-free at all levels**

- **%-of villages that presented all obligatory financial reports at their village Assemblies in the last FY**
  - 2010/11: 87%
  - 2011/12: 94.7%
  - 2012/13: 100% in 2015
  - **DATA SOURCE**: PMO-RALG-LGAs

- **Proportion of LGAs Posting public budgets, revenue and actual expenditure on easily accessible public notice boards**
  - 2010/11: 87%
  - 2011/12: 94.7%
  - 2012/13: 100% in 2015
  - **DATA SOURCE**: LGDG Annual Assessment Report

- **%- of MDAs who have their annual performance reports posted on their websites**
  - 2010/11: 87%
  - 2011/12: 80% in 2012
  - **DATA SOURCE**: MDAs& LGAs’ Website
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Trend</th>
<th>MKUKUTA II Target</th>
<th>DATA SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-% of LGAs who have their annual performance reports posted on their websites</td>
<td>1% 2% 2% 5% 8%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-% of those contacting a service provider that paid a bribe, by sector within the last year</td>
<td>TBD</td>
<td></td>
<td>PO-PSM, REPOA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-% of MDAs and LGAs with Clean Audit Certificate from CAG</td>
<td>90% in 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-MDAs</td>
<td>89% 96% 66% 91% -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-LGAs</td>
<td>54% 78% 80% 92% -</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Reducing in time from arraignment to 1st hearing</td>
<td>120 100 90 75 65</td>
<td>8 days in 2010 to 3 days in 2015</td>
<td>DPP, AG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Number of corruption cases convicted as % of number of investigated cases sanctioned for prosecution</td>
<td>9.54% 7.33% 6.50% 9.96% 10.39%</td>
<td>Higher in 2015</td>
<td>DPP, PCCB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Percentage reduction of corruption in key prone sectors and professions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PCCB, Judiciary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Overall reduction of corruption in MDAs, LGAs, Private Sector and CSOs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PCCB, Judiciary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Overall reduction of corruption</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PCCB, Judiciary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Improved corruption perception from the general public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>PCCB, Judiciary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>2012/13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal 2: Improving public service delivery to all especially the poor and vulnerable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-% of population reporting satisfaction with basic services (including older people)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal 3: Promoting and Protecting human rights for all, particularly for poor women, children, men and vulnerable, including people living with HIV/AIDS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-% of court cases that have not been disposed for more than 24 months as % of all court cases (criminal and civil cases)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-2.8%</td>
<td>-32.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22% in 2012 Judiciary, MJCA, MoHA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-% of prisoners in remand for two or more years compared to all prisoners in a given year</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of detained juveniles (girl and boys) accommodated in a juveniles remand homes and approved schools (compared to detained juveniles in prisons)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher in 2015</td>
<td>MoHA-Prison, MoHSW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-% of districts with a team of trained Paralegals</td>
<td></td>
<td>Higher in 2015</td>
<td>MJCA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-% of births registered within 90 days after birth</td>
<td>15.36%</td>
<td>11.32% 10.29% 10.01% 6.04%</td>
<td>80% in 2015 RITA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of women among senior civil servants (Assistant Director and upwards)</td>
<td></td>
<td>35.6%</td>
<td>MCDGC, PO-PSM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Prevalence of violence (sexual, physical and emotional) against children aged 18 years of age and below</td>
<td></td>
<td>F=15%, M=7.1% F=36%, M=35.8% F=12%, M=14%</td>
<td>MCDGC, NBS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicator</td>
<td>Trend</td>
<td>MKUKUTA II Target</td>
<td>DATA SOURCE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>2012/13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 4: Ensuring national and personal security safety of properties</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Number of cases of crimes reported by type</td>
<td>479,066</td>
<td>541,197</td>
<td>700,037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % of cases of sexual abuse reported that resulted in conviction</td>
<td>14,677</td>
<td>7,709</td>
<td>7,795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal 5: Promoting and Preserving culture of Patriotism, hard work, moral integrity and self confidence</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Number of International conferences where Kiswahili is used</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % of Institution that have functioning Integrity committees</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Government leaders and of MPs who have abided by the leadership code by filling in wealth declaration forms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>